



CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY
BOARD No. 4
 330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor
 New York, NY 10036
 tel: 212-736-4536
 fax: 212-947-9512
 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Meeting Date	March 2, 2016
Meeting Time	6:30PM
Meeting Location	Mount Sinai West 1000 Tenth Avenue
Meeting Audio Recording	LINK

DELORES RUBIN
 Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
 District Manager

March 2016 Full Board Meeting Minutes

PUBLIC HEARING/ PRESENTATION	<p>Public hearing on CB4’s Proposed Responses to Mayor’s FY17 Budget:</p> <p>Lowell Kern, Chair of CB4’s Budget Task Force, states that there is a letter drafted by the Task Force, which lists CB4’s responses to the Mayor’s FY17 budget. The letter has been approved as drafted by the Executive Committee, and will be up for consideration by the Full Board (see Item 15). The hearing closes without any additional speaker.</p> <p>Delores Rubin, Chair of the Board, thanks the Budget Task Force for its quick turnaround and reminds the community to stay involved in the budget process and asks community members to please notify the Board of any suggested budgetary needs and concerns throughout the year.</p>
---	---

Public Session

Fabrice Armand	<p>NYC Department of Corrections Recruitment: Mr. Armand is the Director of Strategy Partnership and Community Engagement for DOC and is in attendance with two uniformed officers. He wishes to inform the community of an ongoing hiring push at DOC. He clarifies that DOC does not solely employ correctional officers and has both uniform and non-uniform positions. DOC is also hiring non-uniformed positions including attorneys, trades people, nurses, and IT professionals. Mr. Armand announces that there are currently 300 open non-uniformed positions and DOC wishes to hire another 1800 correctional officers over the next calendar year. He provides some starting salary ranges: IT professional @120K, attorneys @140K, uniformed correctional officer @45K (which is competitive with NYPD) and after 5.5 years, correctional officers’ base pay rises to \$94,231. Mr. Armand emphasizes that working for the City at DOC opens the door to the middle class and with the benefits, continues to be good way to support families. DOC enjoys high attrition rates among its employees and many are coming up on retiring age after spending their entire careers with DOC since age 18-21, which explains the need for the current hiring push. The Department is making calls to applicants within 6 months to 1 year. There are brochures available.</p>
Anita McDonogh	<p>(1) Balsley Park at 322 W 57th Street: Ms. McDonogh is a community member at 333 W 56th Street. She first wants to thank CB4 members for their contribution. She wants CB4 members to be aware that the grass is bare in the Park. Ms. McDonogh has been told by a parks professional that the Park has dead trees and seedlings and is in need of fertilizer and attention.</p> <p>(2) 311 W 57th Street: Ms. McDonogh “do[es] not approve of a 4am close.” Venue sounds fantastic and she wishes the operators lots of luck but she hopes that they will close at 2am. Ms. McDonogh describes a news article about a man who was attacked at 4:10am because he refused to give money to a panhandler. “When you leave late, things happen.” She asks board members to please take this into consideration.</p>
Theodora Fleurant	<p>Columbus Library at 742 10th Avenue btw 50th and 51st Streets (a branch of NY Public Library): Ms. Fleurant is the Community Outreach and Technology Training Associate at Columbus Library. She</p>

	wants to make sure the community knows about a large variety of free courses offered by the Library, ranging from financial literacy to technology classes for all ages and skill levels. See printed list on handout.
Alexander Victor	311 W 57 th Street: Mr. Victor is an attorney working with Variety Worldwide on their application to transfer the existing liquor license. He first is thankful for BLP committee's efforts to work with the applicant to arrive at the agreed upon stipulations. Mr. Victor wishes to clarify that the location has been licensed for over 25 years and the request is a transfer of existing liquor license, not a new application. He states that Variety plans to open an immersive dinner theatre. The team has many years of experience in hospitality and theatre and recently produced the multiple Drama Desk award winning show <i>Queen of the night</i> and also operated the show at Kazino, which will come to Broadway later this year. The team hopes to replace the existing nightclub with a novel and sophisticated form of entertainment. The team has met with as many community members as possible to discuss the issues that had arose in the past; and it appears that many of the problems are from many years ago. The team hopes to be as accommodating as possible and have agreed to many stipulations proposed. The team hopes to earn everyone's support, but realizes it may be impossible. The team continues to believe that the proposed new use by Variety is "a much better use" and has collected over 100 signatures of support, including many from residents in the building above the space. Mr. Victor emphasizes that this is not a new license application. He states that if the previous operation stays in the space, no one benefits. Mr. Victor, in response to a question asked by a CB4 member, also confirms that Variety Worldwide accepts the resolutions and stipulation as drafted by CB4's BLP committee.
Alex Picken	311 W 57 th Street: Mr. Picken owns Picken Real Estate and has been the broker representing both landlord and tenant in transaction at 311 W 57 th Street for the past 1 ½ years. During this time frame, Mr. Picken has brought multiple offers to the owners, including proposals for new nightclubs, music venues, and adult establishments. The landlord, who purchased the building 2.5 years ago, has not not accepted any of those proposed uses. In the course of looking for the appropriate tenant, Mr. Picken believes that the applicant here, Variety Worldwide, is the "Number 1 candidate." Variety is a theatre group focused on the arts along with a fine-dining restaurant. Mr. Picken hopes to have the support of the CB members on this. He assures the Board that the landlord has agreed to this group, Variety Worldwide, as the anchor tenant, Variety Worldwide, after carrying out much diligence and consideration.
Deborah Fromberg	311 W 57 th Street: Ms. Fromberg has lived at 309 W 57 th Street (residential building located above Providence) for 25 years and works for the management company that manages the building, including the restaurant/nightclub. She is familiar with the predecessor, current operation, and has done research to understand more about Variety Worldwide. Ms. Fromberg is concerned with where she lives and its surroundings and the people who would be coming to the location because "it is where she comes home to every night." Ms. Fromberg is excited to see an operation that looks "more like Cirque Du Soleil meets dinner theatre meets fine dining." She believes this is an improvement to the street. Along with many of her neighbors, Ms. Fromberg is excited about this proposed type of use; having performance-based artistic expression is a positive change. She hopes that the CB members will be supportive of the liquor license transfer application.
Andrew Katz	311 W 57 th Street: Mr. Katz is a NYC-based theatre producer and has collaborated with Variety Worldwide over the past few years. He is a supporter and a fan off the innovative work that Variety Worldwide does and he is personally very excited about this new show to come to West 57 th Street.
Randy Weiner	311 W 57 th Street: Mr. Weiner is a partner of Variety Worldwide. His background is in theatre production. In the 51 years of living, he has worked with many organizations, including Cirque du Soleil and Radio City to name a few. He has worked on the Drama Desk award winning show <i>Queen of the Night</i> and also <i>Natasha, Pierre and the Great Comet of 1812</i> (moving to Broadway from Kazino). Mr. Weiner mentions that Kazino was located in a largely residential area and the producing team was very sensitive to the needs of the surrounding community. Mr. Weiner stresses that the producing team is committed to the neighborhood and hopes to produce the highest level of artistic work and be accepted into the community. Mr. Weiner thanks the BLP committee for taking

	the time to work with the team to arrive at the agreed upon stipulations. He hopes that “we will all be very good neighbors.”
Jennie Willink	311 W 57 th Street: Ms. Willink is a theatre producer. She was the Executive Producer at the Blue Man Group for 15 years and later worked as Producer for the show <i>Queen of the Night</i> . She has been working with Variety Worldwide since the closing of <i>Queen of the Night</i> on developing new creative content with the hope of opening the show at the location on West 57 th Street. She explains that the team has been working diligently with the neighborhood and creating something beautiful artistically and considerate for the neighborhood.
Reynolds Duck	311 W 57 th Street: Mr. Duck spent 6 months working at Queen of the Night. He wishes to emphasize the artful performance and culinary experience that the show provides. The show is hard to describe but it is “definitely not a nightclub.”
Brian McCollough	NY Civilian Complaint Review Board: Mr. McCollough explains that the NYCCRB is the civilian oversight agency of the NYPD and is an independent free standing agency that has been in existence since 1993. The Board investigates police misconduct, which covers alleged force, abuse of authority, discourtesy, and offensive language. Anyone in NYC can fill a complaint with the Board, regardless of age, immigration status, or prior criminal record. Over the past 2 years, the agency has developed some improvements: it now has a policy unit, prosecution unit and community engagement unit. Two months ago, they started a community partnership initiative. Besides being able to file complaints via mail, via the website, via 311, via hotline, via precinct, the Board is also sending outreach representatives to higher complaint communities a few times a month. The Board has representatives stationed in East Harlem, South Bronx, East New York, Far Rockaways, and Staten Island; the schedule of these outreach station is on the Board’s website. The Board is also reaching out to schools, youth groups, probation groups, faith groups, LGBTQ groups, homeless groups and asks members of the public and board members to please make introductions and connections if they are involved with such groups. The Board would love to attend group meetings and talk to these groups about the public’s rights in police interactions and what to do when one has an experience with police misconduct. In response to a question proposed by CB4 member, Mr. McCollough states that the Board deals with alleged police misconduct, and not negligence/unenforcement of laws. He also emphasizes that the Board has a robust investigative process and is completely independent. Materials available.
David Terry	311 W 57 th Street: Mr. Terry is a professional dancer and actor and performed with <i>Queen of the Night</i> over the past year and a half. He speaks in support of Variety Worldwide’s plan to move to the location on West 57 th Street. He believes that Variety does groundbreaking work in the performing world. He refers to it as “pure art” and it brings a community of “anything but nightclub.”
Susan Lahn	311 W 57 th Street: Ms. Lahn is a community member says she is “kind of happy” that a theatre group is coming to the space where Providence Club had been because for many years, the location was a bad issue. Ms. Lahn did some research surrounding the 4am closing request. Ms. Lahn found that CB3 has had many problems with this operator in its community and denied the license and held many meetings regarding such problems. Ms. Lahn is disappointed that BLP committee did not understand that more stipulations needed to be put in place. Ms. Lahn said that one news article she found states “[t]hey present themselves as a theatre group and are clearly not.” Ms. Lahn would like to see more stipulations. She thinks that 600 people arriving and 600 leaving would cost transportation issues. She hopes that someone from QOL would look at the CB3 stipulations with her.
Jeffrey LeFrancois	Free E-Waste Recycling Event: Mr. LeFrancois represents the Meatpacking District BID. He notifies the community of a free used electronic disposal day. On Friday, March 18 th from 11am to 4pm, community members can dispose of used/unwanted electronics to a collection station located at SW corner of 14 th Street and 8 th Avenue. Items that will be accepted include: Working and non-working computers, monitors, printers, scanners, keyboards, computer mouses, cables, TV’s, VCR’s, DVD players, phones, audio/visual equipment, batteries, cell phones, and PDA’s. Electronics recycling is required by law; failure to do so can result in \$100 fine. Flyers with further information

are available.

Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives

Andrew Lombardi for BP Gale Brewer	<p>Mr. Lombardi starts by stating that the MBPO is committed to address ongoing issues with DOB re tenant disposal and illegal demolition requests, especially in the three special districts in CB4. There has been increased protection against demolition in the special districts, yet there has still been permits granted by DOB to developers for demolition/construction. Examples of these administrative mistakes are: 497 9th Avenue, W38th Street and W22nd Street, and MBPO has written letters to DOB to address these specific sites. The BP is also working hard to schedule in person meetings with DOB to address the issue-at-large. The Construction Safety working group was founded by BP Brewer last Fall, the group (includes industry leaders, both labor and management, local electeds and other industry experts) has met 5 times so far, and a report on policy recommendations and proposed reforms is expected in late March. Regarding renewal of CB membership applications and reapplications, members should expect to hear about status update in first week of April. Any questions re reapplication process, please reach out to Mr. Lombardi.</p> <p>Mr. Lombardi also announces two upcoming events:</p> <p>March 8 6-9pm Public Hearing on School Overcrowding at PS 125, 425 W 123rd Street</p> <p>March 20 12-3pm Upward Aging – health event for aging adults regarding Aging Brain Health at CUNY Grad Center, 365 5th Avenue</p> <p>In response to members’ questions, Mr. Lombardi said the BP must sit down again with DOB and get in front of these inconsistencies, noting they had met with Commissioner Rick Chandler several times in the past few months. Mr. Lombardi also mentions that there are tenant clinics offered in BP Brewer’s Northern Manhattan Office at 431 West 125th Street. These workshops, offered in conjunction with attorneys from Housing Conservation Coordinators, are scheduled for: March 2 (3-5pm), March 10 (5-7pm), March 16 (3-5pm), March 24 (5-7pm) and March 30 (3-5pm).</p>
Robert Atterbury for USCM Jerry Nadler	<p>Mr. Atterbury reports that Congressman Jerry Nadler had participated in two congressional hearings in 2 days. First, the “Apple” hearing on Government’s attempts to undermine data encryption and consumer privacy. The Congressman is “very concerned” that the Government is “forcing back doors on companies.” Second, the “attack on women’s health” committee hearing, as organized by Republicans to attack Planned Parenthood. The Congressman is working hard to push back on “the Republicans’ moral arrogance in insisting women aren’t informed and can’t make their own choices” on family planning issues. Earlier this month, the Congressman, along with other members, also submitted an amicus brief on behalf of 123 members of Congress in a contraceptive case, which attempts to overturn the ACA mandate. The brief argues that all employees should receive full coverage on contraception when requested even when the employer expresses moral reservation on such coverage because the ACA mandates that the Government step in and provide such refused coverage.</p>
Eli Szenes-Strauss for SS Hoylman	<p>Mr. Szenes-Strauss reports that the Environmental Protection Fund in the Executive Budget went up \$123 million and includes \$32.5 million in a new fund on Climate Change Adaptation. Sen. Hoylman is fighting to significantly increase funding for runaway homeless youth; currently only 0.003% of the budget is dedicated to this cause. Also, Sen. Holyman believes that the budget for the Hudson River Park Trust should be increased from the dedicated \$800K to \$3.5 million. For Women’s History Month, Sen. Holyman is taking nominations from community members and hopes to honor a “Woman of Distinction” (as part of the State Senate’s program) who has been working or living in the district to positively contribute to the health and civic well-being of the community. Please write to the Senator’s office or Mr. Szenes-Strauss directly with your nominations. In response to members’ questions, Mr. Szenes-Strauss states that Sen. Holyman’s office continues to wait for a response from the Port Authority to address community concerns about its proposed expansion plan.</p>

Gabriel Dann-Allel for AM Richard Gottfried	Ms. Dann-Allel provides updates on the Executive Budget as proposed by the Governor, which will be submitted on April 1 st . AM Gottfried, as Chair of the Assembly’s Health Committee, is “deadly set” against the proposed shift of the fiscal responsibility of Medicaid from the State to New York City; which would increase the City’s fiscal burden by \$656 million over the next two fiscal years and will lead effort to oppose this shift. AM Gottfried is also working with other members to seek increase in MTA capital program of \$1.8 billion and the group also wishes to see funds made available for MTA to create mechanism to generate new revenue. AM Gottfried will also be joining his colleagues in opposing a proposal to cut 1/3 of CUNY’s budget and the \$483 million reduction will become a NYC fiscal burden. Ms. Dann-Allel also reminds the community that there are a bunch of free services to help people prepare their taxes and also help people figure out if they can qualify for EITC or child care tax credit.
Gus Ipsen for AM Linda Rosenthal	Mr. Ipsen states that AM Rosenthal, Chair of the Committee of Alcohol and Drug Abuse, will be fighting for an addition of \$30 million in funding for OASAS (which is the state agency on alcoholism and drug abuse). Last month, we had an eviction legal clinic with MFY, HCC, Goddard Riverside SRO Law Project and the Office has seen an uptake of eviction cases even though NYTimes is reporting a decrease. Mr. Ipsen also announces that on 3/10 at 11am at AM Rosenthal’s district office (270 West 72 nd Street), there will be a SCRIE clinic, presented in partnership with the NYC Dept of Finance. Mr. Ipsen urges anyone interested to reach out to the Office.
Dan Campanelli for NYC Comptroller Scott Stringer	Mr. Campanelli reports that the Comptroller performed his chartered mandated duty. He presented his analysis of the FY17 Budget and testified in front of the NYCC Finance Committee hearing on March 1 st . Highlights from the testimony: unemployment has continued to drop, though from 2009 to 2014 real wages for low-income workers has declined by 3%. NYC’s fiscal spending on homeless services has increased by 46% from FY14 to FY16 and reached \$1.7 billion in FY16. There was an audit released last week on HPD that was reported in NYTimes the week before on City Owned Vacant Lots. The audit found that NYC owns more than 1100 vacant lots that can potentially be used to build affording housing. Of the 1100 plus lots, 98 are in Manhattan, though none of the addresses are in CB4. The Comptroller also released a recommendation to create a NYC land bank that can help building 57000 units of affordable housing. Mr. Campanelli also announces an event on Women’s History Month. On March 8 th from 6-8pm, the celebration event will be held at Surrogate’s Courthouse – see flyers for more info.
Matt Green for CM Corey Johnson	Mr. Green encourages attendees to pick up a report for legislative updates and upcoming community events. He hopes to remind residents (anyone over 14 years old) to vote for one of the 15 projects, which are budget priorities identified by District 3 community members, at the upcoming community wide Participatory Budgeting Expo at PS 340 (590 Sixth Avenue). The Expo kicks off on March 22 nd at 6:30pm. The vote will stay open until April 3 rd and votes can also be submitted online (you have to provide your name/email and you will be given a unique ID to vote).

Board Reports & Business	
Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	Agenda was adopted with removal of Item 8 (postponed) and addition of Item 17. February 2016 minutes were approved unanimously.
District Manager Report	<p>Mr. Bodine reports that he attended the following meetings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Site visit with HCC and Lantern Group to review necessary repairs and monitor ongoing renovations at Stardom Hall Buildings at 330-2 West 51st Street • Site visit at HK Flea market with SCPO and stalkholders to review site plan. • Office coordinated meetings btw Avenues School and Tenant Association presidents at three district NYCHA developments to discuss Avenues School’s “robust” Scholarship program. NYCHA TA’s will be able to nominate 2-3 children for the Avenues School’s summer program and will be free of charge for participants. NYCHA will also host open house at the school in May. • Meetings btw Avenues School and elected offices regarding additional community

	<p>outreach</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • District Service Cabinet Meeting <p>New board business:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WPE Committee has a new meeting location: Cameo Studio, 307 W 43rd Street, Studio B. <p>Ongoing office projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Planning fellow will be presenting her work on ways to track TDRs in Chelsea area at Chelsea Land Use Committee meeting in March. • John Jay intern is updating CB4 website with Board's resources list as many have suggested the need for improvement. • The Office is working with CM Johnson's office to schedule meeting with DOB regarding improper demo permits issued. • The Office has coordinated a multi-agency conference call re vandalism and homelessness in Chelsea Park on West 28th Street. • The L train working group is in formation since MTA has announced that L train will be shut down in a year or so and will affect many residents in CB4. • The Office is working with SS Holyman's office on safety on 8th Avenue corridor and Penn Station area. <p>Mr. Bodine wraps up by acknowledging the hard work and dedication of office staff, Nelly Gonzalaz and Patty Gouris, as usual.</p>
Board Chair Report	<p>Ms. Rubin continues to spend time on getting to know stakeholders and players in the district.</p> <p>New board business:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HHHS meeting date will change in March 2016 due to scheduling difficulties. <p>Ongoing projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On March 3rd from 5 to 6:30pm, a group will gather in the District Office to talk about ideas that anyone may have regarding CB4's engagement on social media. If you cannot attend the meeting, please send your ideas to Nelly Gonzalez via email. • Informal and productive meeting with developer of hotel at 351 West 38th Street so that the developer understands the context under which we hope to preserve in our district. • She has met with Avenues School and other schools in the District.

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Quality of Life (QOL)		
Item 01: Letter to SAPO re Street Fair Moratorium	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED; 1 OPPOSED
Business License and Permits Committee (BLP)		
Item 02: Letter to DCA and SLA re 887-889 9th Avenue (57/58) – Vegg 58th LLC d/b/a Masseria Dei Vini	Bundled with 4,5,6,7,9 SLA is added as a recipient	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 03: Letter to SLA re 311 W. 57th Street (8/9) – Variety 57th Street Holdings, LLC	After lengthy discussion	PASSED; 26 IN SUPPORT; 5 OPPOSED; 1

		PRESENT NOT ELIGIBLE
Item 04: Letter to SLA re 312 W. 23rd Street (8/9) – ERS Restaurant Inc. d/b/a Zia Maria	Bundled with 2,5,6,7,9	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 05: Letter to SLA re 730 10th Avenue (49/50) – Mamma Anna 730 LLC d/b/a Abitino’s Pizza	Bundled with 2,4,6,7,9	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 06: Letter to SLA re 1000S 8 Avenue, Store #5 (Underground Subway Platform 57/58) – Wisdom Foods Columbus Circle, LLC d/b/a Ellary’s Greens	Bundled with 2,4,5,7,9	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 07: Letter to SLA re 111 W. 17th Street (6/7) – BKUK 8 Corp	Bundled with 2,4,5,6,9	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 08: Letter to SLA re 544 W. 27th Street (10/11) – Tulip NYC Inc.	REMOVED FROM AGENDA	NA
Item 09: Letter to SLA re 605 W. 42nd Street (42/11) – LTF Club Operations Company, Inc. d/b/a Life Time Fitness	Bundled with 2,4,5,6,7	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee		
Item 10: Letter to Sheffield re: Kiosk Renewal in Balsley Park		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 11: Letter to DOB re 517-525 W. 45th Street	Friendly amendment suggested.	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 12: Letter to EDC re: Covenant House RFP		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Waterfront, Parks & Environment (WPE)		
N/A		
Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU)		
N/A		
Transportation Committee (TRANS)		
Item 13: Letter to DCA re Newsstand at S/W/C 37th Street and 11th Avenue	Bundled with 14,16	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 14: Letter to NYPD re Crash Report Access	Bundled with 13,16	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Housing Health & Human Services Committee (HHHS)		
N/A		
Executive Committee (EXEC)		

Item 15: Letter to the Mayor Bill de Blasio re: Response to FY2017 Preliminary Budget		PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
New Business		
Item 16: Letter to DOT re Sightseeing Bus Stop Rule Testimony	Bundled with 13,14	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
Item 17: Letter to DOB re Demolition Permit Approved for 500 West 22nd and 197 10 th Avenue	With explanation from Chair of HHHS Committee	PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Meeting Resolution	
Adjournment	8:24 p.m. Meeting Adjourned
Next Meeting Date and Location	April 6, Wednesday 6:30 p.m. Fulton Auditorium, 119 9 th Avenue (17/18 St)

AS RECORDED BY: Lily Fan, Co-Secretary