



Delores Rubin
Chair
Jesse R. Bodine
District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

December 18, 2017

Joseph J. Lhota, Chairman
Metropolitan Transit Authority
347 Madison Avenue, 5th Floor
New York, New York 10017

Luis Sanchez
Manhattan Borough Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation
55 Water Street, 37th Floor
New York, New York 10037

Re: SBS M34 Bus Stop West of Dyer Avenue.

Dear Mr. Lhota and Mr. Sanchez,

Manhattan Community Board 4 (MCB4) requests the repositioning of the Select Bus Service (SBS) M34 bus stop approximately 100 feet to the west from its current location in front of 433 West 34th Street. We also request that the NYC Department of Transportation (DOT) install a 24 hour loading zone in front of 433 West 34th Street. These recommendations were voted 42 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstaining and 1 present but not eligible to vote at MCB4's December 6th Full Board Meeting.

As you may be aware, the bus stop west of Dyer Avenue was initially eliminated in 2010; after an outcry from bus riders, it was reinstated at a slightly different location when the SBS program was implemented on the M34 line. The current locations run counter to MCB4's recommendations to DOT to locate the bus stop between Ninth and Dyer Avenues, which date back to 2011. (See attached correspondence for background).

The current location puts the bus stop directly in front of the only entrance to 433 West 34th Street, a co-operative apartment building with over 200 units. This is the sole access point for both residents and deliveries. With enhanced enforcement, residents have received tickets for discharging passengers and delivery items at the bus stop. We think, and hope you can agree that it is not a best practice to co-locate a bus stop with the sole access point to a building of this size when there is a simple solution.

We request that the stop location be relocated slightly to the west so as not to obstruct the building entrance. The stop will still be substantially in front of 433 West 34th Street frontage, without obstructing its entrance. Immediately to the west of 433 West 34th Street there is the bridge over the Lincoln Tunnel Expressway, so the stop's requested location would not obstruct any other building entrances, or otherwise disrupt access.

We further request of the DOT that a 24 hour loading zone be created in front of the building entrance. The remaining areas along the street would be subject to current parking restrictions.

As evidenced in the attached letters, MCB4 maintains its position that the optimal location for the stop is between Ninth and Dyer Avenues. However, relocation of the stop to this location is not feasible in the near term due to ongoing construction and scaffolding, and anticipated traffic pattern changes for Dyer Avenue. We request the re-positioning of the stop slightly to the west in the near term and the eventual relocation of the stop to between Ninth and Dyer Avenues when it becomes feasible.

Thank you kindly for your consideration of this matter.

Sincerely,



Delores Rubin
Chair
Manhattan Community
Board 4



Christine Berthet
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning
Committee



Yoni Bokser
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning
Committee

Enclosure

cc: Hon. Richard Gottfried, New York State Assembly
Hon. Corey Johnson, City Council
Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
Colleen Chattergoon, DOT



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

JOHN WEIS
Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.
District Manager

May 6, 2011

Janette Sadik-Kahn
Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation
55 Water Street, 9th Floor
New York, N.Y. 10041

Re: 34th Street Transitway EAS

Dear Commissioner Sadik-Kahn:

Manhattan Community Board 4 is pleased that NYC Department of Transportation has revised their plan for the 34th Street Transitway to incorporate many of the concerns expressed by this Community Board, its representatives on the 34th Street Community Advisory Committee, and area residents and businesses. We are particularly pleased that the new plan includes a bus lane and building loading/unloading areas on at least one side of the street in most areas, and on both sides of the street West of Ninth Avenue. We understand that NYC DOT will be undertaking an Environmental Assessment Study of this project and its various components before conferring with Community Boards 4, 5, and 6, the CAC, and making a final decision later this year.

While it is an improvement over the previous proposal, there are several aspects to the current design that we have concerns with and request be studied in the EAS:

- **Loading/Unloading at 400 and 408 West 34th Street:** The current plan limits a loading/unloading zone to approximately 10 feet, which is insufficient for the size of most delivery vehicles. This space is constrained by the No Standing zone at the church immediately to the west and a potential turning lane onto Ninth Avenue immediately to its east DOT has proposed to eliminate south turns from 34th Street onto Ninth Avenue and thus convert the turning lane into a Loading/Unloading zone.

While eliminating south turns would enable additional Loading/Unloading for 400 (The Skylight Diner) and 408 W. 34th Street, it might also create traffic problems along West 34th, particularly since delivery vehicles traveling east from that location would not be able to turn off of West 34th Street until Madison Avenue, given current turn restrictions. As indicated about, leaving the right turn would restrict the Loading/Unloading zone and, given its short length, also likely cause some back-up into the bus lane. We hope DOT will examine the implications both alternative, as well as speak with St. Michael's Church

(414/424 W. 34th Street) to see if there might be times they could permit load/unloading along their curb for their neighbors.

Separate from the above, we repeat our request that a Loading/Unloading zone in front of 408 and 430 W. 34th Street immediately be implemented. Since our request for this change last summer, DOT has acknowledged the need for this, but in the interim the tenants still report frequent ticketing for Loading/Unloading and even for drop offs. The implementation of the 34th Street Transitway is not scheduled to take place until mid-2012 at the earliest. There is no reason that some area for a loading/unloading zone should not be immediately installed for the less trafficked hours of 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

- **Bus Stop on the North Side of W. 34th between Ninth and Tenth Avenues:** Since the bus stop at W. 34th and Dyer was removed last year, there has been no bus stop on the North Side of West 34th Street between 9th and 10th Avenues. Given the substantial number of large residential buildings on this block, including a large percentage of elderly residents, this creates a real hardship. We hope the removal of most of the curb cuts in front of Emblem Health might create an opportunity. Emblem Health appeared in front of the committee and committed to have them removed within 12 months.

In addition, this Community Board is already on record as requesting that DOT consider removing the north turn lane from W. 34th Street onto Dyer (and converting the North bound lanes between W. 34th and W. 35th Streets into park land). We hope the EAS will examine this possibility, which would also enable additional space both for loading/unloading for 413 W. 34th Street and a bus stop.

- **No Parking on West 34th Street between Ninth Avenue and Dyer Avenue:** Current DOT plans suggest that the proposed Loading/Unloading zones for this area would also include time for parking. Given the need for Loading/Unloading, and with the support of the residents of the 400 block of West 34th Street, we request that parking not be included.
- **Ensure any disrupted or temporarily removed trees are replaced with similar type and mature trees:** The substantial number and girth of the trees on the South side of West 34th between Ninth and Tenth Avenues creates a more pleasant pedestrian and residential experience, despite its proximity to a major Lincoln Tunnel entrance/exit at Dyer Avenue. It is important that these trees remain or be replaced with similar quality trees, if the installation of the new transit-way and/or the related fare payment machines on the sidewalk disrupt them.
- **Designate a Deputy Mayor to oversee this project:** Even with the revisions, the proposed West 34th Street Transitway is a major realignment of one of the most heavily trafficked pedestrian areas in the city and, particularly when the #7 train extension is built, one of the largest transit hubs in the country. Its implementation will require multi-agency cooperation and communication. Specifically, the Department of Transportation is under the Deputy Mayor for Economic Development, while the NYPD, Traffic Enforcement, NYFD, and Sanitation Departments are under the Deputy Mayor for Operations. We request one of the Deputy Mayor's be assigned to oversee this project's planning and

implementation or, short of that, that there be a designated Project Manager that is a liaison between both departments.

Manhattan Community Board 4 is pleased with the proposed Transitway and the process that included bold thinking and extensive community outreach and lead to the current proposal that ultimately can benefit pedestrians, public bus users and residents. We will continue to work closely with DOT on this project and look forward to the EAS analysis including the above comments.

Sincerely,



John Weis
Chair
Manhattan Community Board No. 4



Christine Berthet
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning Committee



Jay Marcus
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning Committee



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

COREY JOHNSON
Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.
District Manager

October 5, 2011

Margaret Forgione
Manhattan Borough Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation
55 Water Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10041

Re: 34th Street Transitway – Traffic Analysis

Dear Commissioner Forgione:

Manhattan Community Board 4 appreciates being consulted as a member of the Community Advisory Committee (CAC) on the 34th Street Transitway project. On September 25th, the Department of Transportation (DOT) shared with the CAC the design updates and traffic analysis results that will be presented at public meetings next month.

We ask the DOT to provide us with the detailed data from the traffic analysis and we reiterate our request to study the option of barring the northbound turn from westbound 34th Street traffic into Dyer Avenue. As you know CB4 is very supportive of the Transitway.

DOT did not include any data related to turning movements at Dyer Avenue either on the maps or in the presentation to the CAC on September 25th. This is a critical intersection with the Lincoln Tunnel access and the traffic is awful there (see PM pictures below). It is doubtful that reducing turning lanes from two to one will make it any better: we fear that the turning lane will overflow in the bus lanes and affect the performance of buses on the corridor.

CB4 sent to DOT a resolution dated May 6, 2011 with the following paragraph: "In addition, this Community Board is already on record as requesting that DOT consider removing the north turn lane from W. 34th Street onto Dyer (and converting the North bound lanes between W. 34th and W. 35th Streets into park land). We hope the EAS will examine this possibility, which would also enable additional space both for loading/unloading for 413 W. 34th Street and a bus stop."

We ask that such configuration be studied. The Port Authority has already tested the configuration in the filed and found it viable. The Port Authority is on record for supporting that option in various meetings with the Hell's Kitchen Transportation Study team. We also want to make sure the existing 17 seconds Lead Pedestrian Interval on the west crossing of 34th Street at Dyer will remain in place with the same duration.

CB4 is very supportive of the Transitway. However for this project to succeed, known problems must be addressed in advance. We ask that the DOT publish the detailed data behind the traffic analysis and study the option of barring the northbound turn into Dyer Avenue.

Sincerely yours,



Corey Johnson
Chair
Manhattan Community Board 4



Christine Berthet
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning Committee



Jay Marcus
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning Committee

Cc: Christine C. Quinn
Cc: Thomas Duane
Cc: Richard Gottfried
Cc: Jerry Nadler
Cc: Scott Stringer



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

COREY JOHNSON
Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.
District Manager

March 8, 2012

Margaret Forgione
Manhattan Borough Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation
55 Water Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10041

Re: 34th Street SBS project - Project Analysis Report

Dear Commissioner Forgione:

Manhattan Community Board (CB4) has reviewed the recently published **34th Street Select Bus Service Project (SBS) Analysis Report**. We are pleased that the report followed the CEQR Technical Manual format, including discussion of alternatives the proposed project. We are also pleased that the study included (block by block) parking and loading/unloading impacts of the proposed SBS and that many of the recommendations of CB4 were included.

However, the study reveals a serious parking/loading issue on the North Side of W. 34th Street from Ninth to Tenth Avenue and we are very concerned that the study did not analyze or include our recommended alternative of:

- A) Closing the Northbound West 34th Street entrance onto Dyer Avenue;
- B) Moving the bus stop from just west of Dyer Avenue to just east of Dyer Avenue and (thus resulting in);
- C) Increasing the number of permitted parking spots on the North side of West 34th Street between Ninth Avenue and Tenth Avenue from the current projected 7 to approximately 17;

We request that the study be amended to provide a reasonable amount of loading space on the north side of 34th Street between Dyer and Tenth Avenues, no right turns on northbound Dyer Avenue and a bus stop between Ninth and Dyer Avenues.

We also request that the north side and south side of West 34th Street parking regulations be changed to permit three hour metered loading at all times, and 10 a.m. to 3 .p.m loading in portions of the Tenth Avenue turn lane.

Between Dyer and Tenth Avenues, on the north side of W. 34th Street on a 420 foot long block, the configuration studied ¹provides only three parking/loading spaces to service two very large apartment buildings and a restaurant at 433 and 455 West 34th Street. By contrast, this block has currently about 25 spaces of parking /loading allowed overnight from 7 p.m. to 7 a.m. and full time on Saturday and Sunday.

The reduction is due to both a bus stop and a turning lane being proposed on this portion of the block.

This amount of loading space is entirely inadequate for two large buildings with hundreds of apartments and a restaurant. As a result delivery trucks will double park in the bus lane, thus defeating the purpose of the project.

Between Ninth and Dyer Avenues, on the north side of W. 34th Street, the configuration studied provides for a turning lane into northbound Dyer Avenue to enter the Lincoln Tunnel, where CB4 had requested that the study incorporate barring that turn.

The Port Authority often closes this entrance with cones and the DOT did a simulation of such configuration as part of the Hell's Kitchen Traffic Study. There is ample evidence that closing this access works well at both peak and normal hours. The residents of 34th street have observed a better traffic flow and much less honking when this entrance is closed.

The benefits of barring the northbound right turn at Dyer Avenue are multiple: this provides an opportunity to create ten additional loading/parking spaces on the block between Dyer and Tenth Avenues, by relocating the bus stop to this block from just West of Dyer Avenue to just east of Ninth Avenue (instead of the proposed turning lane on to Dyer Avenue). It also will insure a better quality of life for the surrounding residents, it will save NYPD sources by removing the need for agent, and it will eliminate the risk of a blocked bus lane. The Port Authority is on record for supporting the closing this entrance, provided it can be reopened in case of emergency.

Eliminating the turning lane onto Dyer Avenue will also reduce the traffic on the block and permit metered loading at all times

We should mention that among the proposed changes in the report that we support are changing the bus lanes west of Ninth Avenue to an “off-set” bus lane (adjacent to a parking lane, rather than the curb, except for bus stops) on both the North and South Side of West 34th Street. It also includes 17 parking/loading spaces for the South Side of West 34th Street.

¹ Table 1 – No build and Build Loading/Parking spaces, 34th Street SBS Project Analysis Report,

We appreciate your willingness to listen to the community and request that you amend your study to take in account appropriate loading spaces for large residential buildings at this location and barring the right turn in northbound Dyer Avenue.

Sincerely,



Corey
Johnson
Chair



Christine Berthet
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning
Committee



Jay Marcus
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning
Committee

cc: NYC Council Speaker Christine Quinn
Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer
Congressman Jerrold Nadler
NYS Senator Thomas Duane
NYS Senator Liz Kruger
NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried
NYS Assemblywoman Linda Rosenthal
NYC Council Member Gale Brewer
NYC Council Member James Vacca
Veronica Bailey Simmons – DOT



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

COREY JOHNSON
Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.
District Manager

April 4, 2012

Ms. Margaret Forgione
Manhattan Borough Commissioner
New York City Department of Transportation
55 Water Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10041

Re: 34th Street Transitway

Dear Commissioner Forgione:

Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) attended the Community Advisory committee of the 34th Street Transitway; to review proposed parking regulations for the various curbs in our district. The community favors a "no parking anytime" regulation, which will allow both residential and commercial pick up and deliveries at curbside. CB4 is pleased that a solution to the shortage of loading space, west of Dyer Avenue is in sight, but remains very concerned about the Lincoln Tunnel traffic and the Bolt Bus Sidewalk terminal location.

In order to create an adequate number of loading spaces for the north side of W. 34th Street between Dyer Avenue and Tenth Avenue CB4 supports the consolidation of two proposed bus stops (west of Dyer Avenue and east of Ninth Avenue) into a single one just west of Ninth Avenue (we had previously asked for the bus stop to be relocated just to the east of Dyer based on the assumption that the turn lane would be removed). The current proposal is for four-five permanent loading spaces, plus an equivalent amount during off-peak hours, which is insufficient for the amount of residences and businesses located on this curb.

In addition to creating ten additional permanent loading spaces for the large buildings and businesses on the north of W. 34th street, such configuration will reestablish the regular spacing of bus stops and will reduce the crossing length of 34th Street at this busy intersection.

The GHI/Emblem Health building has loading docks on W. 35th Street, and the management has confirmed they are removing the unused curb cuts at the northwest corner of 9th avenue and 34th Street. Loading space and a turning lane will be maintained west of the proposed Bus Stop.

CB4 and the community will pursue the issue of a temporary closing of the westbound turn into northbound Dyer Avenue with the Port Authority and the Hell's kitchen study team. This will provide additional loading space east of Dyer Avenue. Further our experience shows the queuing to be so heavy that the traffic agent prevents the turn most of the time.

CB4 request the relocation of the long distance Bolt Bus Sidewalk Terminal currently adjacent to the Bus stop at the northwest corner of W. 34th Street at Eighth Avenue because it is not consistent with the proposed bus lane. With the addition of a bulb out adjacent to the bus lanes, the two long distance loading spots that are constantly occupied by departing buses would have to be located either in the bus lane, or in front of the Manhattan Center Music Hall. This configuration is not viable from transportation or a loading standpoint.

We appreciate the extensive community outreach on the part of both the Department of Transportation and the Metropolitan Transportation.

Sincerely,



Corey
Johnson
Chair



Christine Berthet
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning
Committee



Jay Marcus
Co-Chair
Transportation Planning
Committee

cc: NYC Council Speaker Christine Quinn
Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer
Congressman Jerrold Nadler
NYS Senator Thomas Duane
NYS Senator Liz Kruger
NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried
NYS Assemblywoman Linda Rosenthal
NYC Council Member Gale Brewer
NYC Council Member James Vacca
Veronica Bailey Simmons – DOT