



CITY OF NEW YORK  
**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY  
 BOARD No. 4**  
 330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor  
 New York, NY 10036  
 tel: 212-736-4536  
 fax: 212-947-9512  
 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

Meeting Date	April 3, 2019
Meeting Time	6:30 PM
Meeting Location	Mount Sinai West 1000 Tenth Avenue 2nd Floor Conference Room B

**BURT LAZARIN**  
 Chair

**JESSE R. BODINE**  
 District Manager

**April 2019 Full Board Meeting Minutes**

**PRESENTATIONS /  
 PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**Presentation:** by Julie Menin, Director, Office of the Census for New York City on the Mayor’s 2020 Census Program, and Jolie Goldin of the U.S. Census Bureau.

The Office of the Census for New York City is focused on ensuring a fair and accurate population count of New York City through the federal 2020 Census survey. The Office came into being as a result of the possibility that the Census will contain – for the first time in seventy years – a question regarding citizenship. There is great concern that the question will stop a large portion of the population from completing the survey. The Office aims to inform residents of the importance of their individual participation and that the City has a great deal to lose if the population is under-counted. At stake is the City’s fair share of the \$800 billion for federally funded programs that is distributed nationwide. Affected programs in the City include public schools and housing, senior centers, SNAP, Medicaid, roads and bridges, and more. The City cannot afford to have an even lower participation rate than the 61.9% it did in 2010 as a result of fears associated with citizenship. The Office’s outreach team will be working with CB4 on a continuing basis after the survey is mailed out next March. And, because the survey can be completed online, there will be multiple locations where people can respond – civic centers, houses of worship, senior centers, libraries, pop-up centers and community board meeting places.

Ms. Goldin provided general information about the Census, including the fact that it seeks to count 300 million people in 140 million households. The Census is the source of information that determines how many representatives each state gets in Congress. An undercount in New York could result in the loss of two seats. Applications for Census taker and other jobs can be submitted online at: [www.2020census.gov/jobs](http://www.2020census.gov/jobs) .

The Census will be delivered on March 12th when counting will begin online, by phone and by mail. The database will be open for business in 12 different languages with online support in 47 other languages. The count must be completed and presented to the President by December 31, 2020; counts will be released for redistricting by April 1, 2021.

**Presentation/Public Hearing:** ULURP Application for 201-207 7th Avenue – HPD and Asian Americans for Equality

Joe Restuccia, Co-Chair of the Housing, Health & Human Services Committee, opened the hearing with a brief description of the site and its history, dating from

	<p>1976 as a City-owned property that is now going to be re-developed through an HPD program that supports the development of affordable co-op apartments. He noted the many meetings that have been held since August of 2017 with Council Speaker Johnson, HPD, CB4 members and committees, Asian Americans for Equity (the developer), and Aime Gross Architects – all of which have culminated in this ULURP application. A full description of the application is contained in the letter that will be voted upon in Agenda Item 1. He then turned the meeting over to Veanda Simmons, the Director of Manhattan Planning at HUD.</p> <p>Ms. Simmons indicated that the ULURP application was certified on January 28th and that she has had multiple meetings with all of the parties involved, both before and after that certification. She said she was pleased to have reached the point where re-located tenants would finally be back in one of the new 26 affordable units. She then turned the meeting over to representatives of the development team, HUD, and Aime Gross who each presented the details of their work.</p> <p>Keyla Espinal, the sole public speaker, is one of the re-located tenants of the site. She was born in one of the apartments where she grew up with her family and said that she was excited about getting back to her building. She asked the Board to approve the application.</p>
--	--

<b>Public Session</b>	
<b>Michael Huaraci</b>	Mr. Huaraci, who lives near the Port Authority Bus Terminal, presented a petition signed by more than 500 residents calling for the renovation plans to include more green space in the area. Specifically, Lot D between 37th and 38th Streets should contain a full public park rather than the micro-space that has been proposed.
<b>Rich Rickaby</b>	Mr. Rickaby gave a visual presentation of the wayfinding signs proposal that he initiated and is the subject of Agenda Item 21. The proposal calls for the installation of cardinal direction signs near subway exits to assist pedestrians to find their way upon reaching street level.
<b>Barbara Eastman</b>	Ms. Eastman also advocated for more green space and believes it should be located beside the Dyer Avenue entrance to the Lincoln Tunnel because of the large number of residents in the area.
<b>Chris Mills</b>	Mr. Mills and his wife are starting a new church, known as One Community Church, to serve in Chelsea, Hell’s Kitchen and Hudson Yards. He announced two upcoming events: an informational session on April 14th at 500 7th Avenue; and, a garage sale in conjunction with the 44th Street Better Block Association on June 1st from 10 am to 5 pm on West 44th Street between 9th and 10th Avenues.
<b>Betty Mackintosh</b>	Ms. Mackintosh announced the eighth growing season of the Hell’s Kitchen Farm Project, which is located on the roof of Metro Baptist Church at 410 West 40th Street. Vegetables grown on the farm are given out in the basement-level food pantry of the church. All volunteer farmers are welcome. An open house will be held on Saturday, April 13th. There is also a summer internship program for high school youth that runs from July 10th to August 17th. Flyers were made available.
<b>Jane Ritter</b>	Ms. Ritter who lives at 77 7th Avenue spoke in support of Option 2 of the 14th Street Traffic Mitigation and Bus Plan. She and the residents of her building want the parking and loading zone to be located on the North side of 14th Street to allow for free access to the building’s service entrance.
<b>Matt Robinson</b>	Mr. Robinson asked the Board to coordinate with the other community boards that are

	also dealing with the issues relating to the 14th Street bus plan.
<b>Nathan Oliver</b>	Mr. Oliver, representing Bike New York, announced its annual Five Boro Bike Tour that will take place on May 5th. It is the organization's main fund-raising event and provides funding for bike-riding and bike maintenance classes throughout the City.
<b>Paul Groncki</b>	Mr. Groncki lives on West 16th Street between 6th and 7th Avenues. He thanked the Board and the Transportation Committee for their work on the M7 Bus re-routing from 16th Street onto 18th Street.
<b>Shaunte Mosely</b>	Ms. Mosely spoke for the Ryan-Chelsea Health Center, noting that it offered primary and specialty care, as well as fitness classes five days a week. She made flyers available.
<b>Mike Dale</b>	Mr. Dale is the business operations manager for a public school located at 41st Street and 10th Avenue. He is advocating for more green space near the school – necessary space for recreation in an area with constant heavy traffic.
<b>James Harvey</b>	Mr. Harvey, of 301 West 48th Street, said he was attending his first CB4 meeting as an advocate for the homeless through Pathways for the Homeless. He asked the community to come together to fight homelessness,

<b>Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives</b>	
<b>Assembly Member Dick Gottfried</b>	<p>Mr. Gottfried noted that Pier 40, while not a part of MCD4, is a part of Hudson River Park – the larger entity that includes the district. He stated that some of the financial needs of the Park must be met by Pier 40 commercial projects which come under review by MCB2. Currently, the Pier houses only a large parking facility with a soccer field in the middle. The parking facility was slated to be moved and replaced many years ago, but the NYPD, which is responsible for such action, has not done so. He suggested that, when the time comes for development to be approved for Pier 40, the same level of restrictions that will apply to Pier 76 in MCD4 be applied to Pier 40. MCB4 should not have to contribute more to the Park when, in fact, it enjoys less green space than MCD2.</p> <p>The new State budget was passed on April 1st. Even though New York has experienced reduced federal aid and lower-than-expected revenue, the budget will still do more for mass transit, education, the environment and criminal justice reform. Although the budget includes substantial in State aid to New York City public schools and increased funding for Medicaid, it was not enough. There are four key factors that led to this outcome:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) The new State leadership had pledged not to support any new taxes.</li> <li>2) Estimates of available tax revenue provided by the Comptroller and the Governor were lower than expected.</li> <li>3) The Governor continues to insist on a 2% limit on year-to-year growth in state spending. That reduction this year was even tighter than the reduction in State revenue, resulting in more funds being set aside in the State's "rainy day fund" than were put aside last year.</li> <li>4) The State Constitution gives the Governor overwhelming authority in setting the State budget.</li> </ol> <p>The Trump administration is proposing a new rule governing Title X funding for family planning. It would block funding of any entity that refers patients for abortion. New York gets about \$16 million of such funding and much of it goes to Planned Parenthood. The Assembly has set aside \$16 million in the budget to offset the gap in funding if the federal cuts goes through.</p>

<p><b>State Senator Brad Hoylman</b></p>	<p>The Senator discussed the FY2020 State Budget, the first one for the new Democratic Majority, noting that it was not perfect, but still one that he was proud to have voted for because it supports vulnerable communities, protects the environment, funds important programs and infrastructure, and generally serves as a counterweight to the Trump agenda in Washington. So, while the Budget fell short on education funding, public financing of elections, NYCHA, and the legalization of recreational marijuana, its accomplishments include measures relating to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Congestion Pricing to help fund the MTA, as well as reduce traffic, clean the air, and make the streets safer.</li> <li>• Criminal Justice Reform to end cash bail for most crimes, ensure speedy trials, reform the discovery process, and limiting the forfeiture of personal assets.</li> <li>• Foundation Aid increases of \$618 million for public schools and a three-year extension of mayoral control of New York City schools.</li> <li>• Vulnerable New Yorkers by securing funding for Runaway &amp; Homeless Youth programs, Holocaust survivors, and the Nurse-Family Partnership program.</li> <li>• Voting Reforms by securing funding for early voting, the use of electronic poll books, online voter registration, and mandatory paid time off for employees to vote on Election Day.</li> <li>• A Statewide Ban on Plastic Bags with a 5-cent fee on paper bags.</li> <li>• LGBTQ Community program funding for groups such as GMHC and SAGE.</li> </ul> <p>The Senator’s Robocall Prevention Act passed in committee last week. It would require telemarketers and debt collectors to obtain the express consent of New Yorkers before targeting them with robocalls. It would also compel telephone service providers to make their call-blocking tools available free of charge to all customers.</p> <p>The Senate passed Mr. Hoylman’s bill requiring more transparency from the State Liquor Authority by making the stipulations connected to a liquor license viewable online.</p>
<p><b>Brian Lewis for BP Gale Brewer</b></p>	<p>Mr. Lewis made the following announcements on behalf of the Borough President:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The BP continues to work with CB4 and the NoVo Foundation to resolve issues surrounding plans for the former Seaman’s House YMCA/Bayview Correctional Facility. She will be convening a meeting with elected officials on April 11th.</li> <li>• The Garment District Alliance Special Programming committee will hold its inaugural meeting this week. The committee is a key component of the city’s plan to preserve fashion manufacturing tenants in the Garment District.</li> <li>• The office will announce community board appointments by mid-April. New applicants’ terms begin effective immediately; departing members should continue to attend meetings until announcements are made.</li> <li>• A congestion pricing plan, the first in the nation, was recently approved and it will impose a fee on most vehicles when they enter Manhattan south of 61st Street, with revenues to be directed mostly to the MTA. A commission is slated to nail down the details by the end of 2020 and implement the congestion plan as early as 2021.</li> <li>• Ms. Brewer recently sponsored a bill in the City Council (along with Speaker Johnson and Congress Member Rosenthal) that calls for the establishment of a database for vacant storefronts. The bill requires landlords to list vacant storefronts, how long they have been empty, the asking rent and contact information for the landlord.</li> <li>• The office will be celebrating Earth Day – Monday, April 22nd – by distributing thousands of reusable bags to grocery stores throughout Manhattan. Locations will be posted on the Borough President’s website.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Robert Atterbury for Congressman</b></p>	<p>There was much recent activity in Congress that involved Judiciary Committee Chairman Nadler:</p>

<b>Jerrold Nadler</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• He introduced the Empower Act, which ends forced arbitration for workers and consumers.</li> <li>• Passed legislation to close the gun show loophole regarding gun registration and providing for nationwide universal background checks.</li> <li>• Held a hearing on child separation at the Southern border.</li> <li>• Reintroduced the 9/11 Victims Compensation Act to ensure continuing funding.</li> <li>• Introduced an appropriations bill that provides \$650 million for the AMTRAK Northeast Corridor and the Gateway Tunnel project.</li> <li>• Held the first hearing ever on the Equality Act, that would prohibit discrimination against the LGBTQ community and strengthen protections for women and others.</li> <li>• Passed a resolution expressing opposition to the Trump Administrations ban on transgender troop serving openly in the nation’s armed forces.</li> <li>• Introduced a resolution nullifying President Trump’s national emergency declaration.</li> <li>• Worked with Assembly Member Gottfried and the tenants of the Polyclinic Apartments, a Section 8 building in CD4, to have gas service restored after being cut off nearly nine months ago.</li> <li>• Held a hearing on the reauthorization of an expanded version of the Violence Against Women Act that will be voted on tomorrow.</li> <li>• Was given the authorization to issue a subpoena to the Department of Justice seeking the full report of Special Counsel Mueller, including underlying evidence.</li> </ul>
<b>Carl Wilson for Speaker Corey Johnson</b>	<p>The Speaker gave his first State of the City address on March 5th during which he called for municipal control of New York City’s mass transit system and for revolutionizing the way in which we plan our street space. The 104-page plan can be found on the Council’s website:  <a href="http://council.nyc.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/LetsGo_Transit_Report.pdf">http://council.nyc.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/LetsGo_Transit_Report.pdf</a></p> <p>Mr. Wilson announced the following upcoming events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Rat Academy free rat prevention training will be given tomorrow at Holy Apostles Church at 6:30 PM</li> <li>• Participatory Budgeting voting in person or online is open through April 7th. Vote online at <a href="https://council.nyc.gov/pb/">https://council.nyc.gov/pb/</a> .</li> <li>• A tax preparation session for income-eligible residents will be held on Monday, April 8th from 12 – 5 PM at the District office, located at 224 West 30th Street, Suite 1206</li> </ul>

<b>Board Reports &amp; Business</b>	
<b>Adoption of Agenda and Minutes</b>	The Agenda, as amended to remove Item 23 and include Item 24, was unanimously approved, as were the March minutes.
<b>District Manager Report</b>	<p>Highlights of events the District Manager or Staff attended on behalf of the board and upcoming events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Meetings and Events attended by CB4 staff on behalf of the board:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District Manager provided testimony to the City Council Government Operations Committee regarding the Preliminary Budget Hearing for the FY2020 Budget</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District Manager hosted a meeting with CB5 and CB2 and City Hall Special Events and Heritage of Pride regarding this year's Pride March</li> <li>• District Manager attended Lincoln Square BID annual Homeless Condition meeting</li> <li>• Applied to the Mayor's Office of Consumer Affairs for a Neighborhood Support Team, which is a multi-agency taskforce, to address neighborhood complaints about construction noise and dust emanating from sites in the lower West 30s between Eighth and Twelfth Avenues</li> <li>• The staff is continuing to look for new CB4 office space in preparation for the move scheduled for next Spring</li> </ul> <p><b>March Committee Updates and Board Reminders:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Confirming the Executive Committee will be meeting on Monday, April 22nd at the CB4 Offices</li> <li>• All other committees will be meeting at their regular times and locations</li> </ul>
<b>Board Chair Report</b>	<p>Mr. Lazarin noted the resignation of Italo Medelius, one of the co-secretaries and that he was going to appoint someone to complete his term which ends at the end of the year. He asked for volunteers. He also noted that because Barbara Davis was resigning, her co-chair position on the Housing, Health and Human Services Committee was vacated and he appointed Maria Ortiz to replace her.</p> <p>He made reference to the \$46,000 that was left over from last year's fiscal budget. The Board was able to make use of some of those funds to hire Tony Robbins to research sites in Hell's Kitchen that might justify the creation of a Hell's Kitchen Historic District. He has experience with his work on the Special West Chelsea District. His report is due by the end of June.</p> <p>He asked the members to consider forming a Census taskforce to inspire interest in the Census among community residents.</p>

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
<b>Joint Chelsea Land Use (CLU) &amp; Housing, Health and Human Services (HHHS) Committees</b>		
Item 1: Letter to HPD and CPC re ULURP Application for 201-207 7th Avenue		<b>Passed Unanimously with 32 Votes</b>
Item 2: Letter to Speaker Johnson re 500 West 28th Street Related Company Demo issue and Affordable Housing Project		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Business License and Permits Committee (BLP)</b>		
Item 3: Letter to DCA re 662 9 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (46/47) – Yum Yum Too - <b>Ratification</b>	Items 3-14 were bundled.	<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 4: Letter to DCA re 206 7 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (22) – The Copper Still		<b>Passed</b>

- <b>Ratification</b>		<b>Unanimously</b>
Item 5: Letter to SLA re 620 9 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (44) – Chipotle Mexican Grill		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 6: Letter to SLA re 601 8 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (44) – Chipotle Mexican Grill #2964		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 7: Letter to SLA re 156 9 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (19/20) – NOPRESSURE LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 8: Letter to SLA re 126 W 18 <sup>th</sup> Street (6/7) – Portal Hospitality LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 9: Letter to SLA re 176 8 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (19) – MVLH Hospitality Group LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 10: Letter to SLA re 460 W 34 <sup>th</sup> Street (9/10) – Rocky’s Bar & Restaurant		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 11: Letter to SLA re 545 6 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (15) – Taco Bell Cantina		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 12: Letter to SLA re 557 12 <sup>th</sup> Avenue – The Pier 84 Chip Shop LLC		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 13: Letter to SLA re 600 11 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (45/46) – Corner Bistro		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 14: Letter to SLA re 600 11 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (45/46) – Gotham West Market		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Transportation Committee (TRANS)</b>		
Item 15: Letter to MTA and DOT re M14A/D Select Bus Service	Items 15-21 were bundled.	<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 16: Letter to MTA re Rerouting M7 Bus to West 18th Street (6/7)		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 17: Letter to DOT re Crosstown Protected Bike Lane Proposals at W. 52nd and W. 55th Streets		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 18: Letter to DOT re Street Proposals for 444 10th Avenue (35) and 511 W. 20th Street (10/11)		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 19: Letter to DOT re Parking Regulation Change at 34th Street (9/10)		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 20: Letter to DOT re Loading Zone outside The		<b>Passed</b>

Vermeer – 77 7th Avenue (14/15)		<b>Unanimously</b>
Item 21: Letter to DOT re Directional Wayfinding Signs		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Executive Committee (EXEC)</b>		
Item 22: Joint CHKLU, WPE, TRANS Letter to Hell’s Kitchen South Coalition re Neighborhood Plan	Friendly amendments accepted.	<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
Item 23: Letter to Letter to Governor Andrew Cuomo re ADA access and Congestion Pricing – <b>Referred Back to Committee</b>		
Item 24: Letter to Elected Officials re Pier 40		<b>Passed Unanimously</b>
<b>Meeting Resolution</b>		
<b>Adjournment</b>	9:00 PM Meeting Adjourned	
<b>Next Meeting Date and Location</b>	6:30 PM May 1, 2019 Hudson Guild Elliott Center 441 West 26th Street 9/10 Dan Carpenter Room	

As recorded by M. Noble