John Weis Chair

CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036 tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512 www.ManhattanCB4.org

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ. District Manager

July 27, 2009

Director Amanda M. Burden Department of City Planning 22 Reade Street New York, New York 10007

Re: ULURP Nos. 090422HAM, N090429ZRM, 090423HAM and 090430ZMM West 48th and 49th Streets, west of 10th Avenue and 806 Ninth Avenue Off-site Affordable Housing sites a/k/a DEP site and MTA site, respectively

Dear Director Burden:

At the recommendation of its Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Committee, Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4), having held a duly noticed public hearing on ULURP application numbers 090422HAM, N090429ZRM, 090423HAM and 090430ZMM adopted the following resolution by roll call vote at its meeting on July 22, 2009 with 23 in favor, 10 opposed, 0 abstaining and 1 present but not eligible to vote). The resolution recommends **denial** of each Application **unless certain conditions are met**.

OVERVIEW

The above applications contemplate the disposition, zoning text and map changes, and zoning map changes relating to two off-site affordable housing developments, at 806 Ninth Avenue and West 48th Street and West 49th Street, west of Tenth Avenue. These Off-site Actions ("Off-site Actions") are related actions to the larger proposed redevelopment ("Proposed Actions") of the Western Rail Yards ("WRY"), located from West 30th Street to West 33rd Street between 11th and 12th Avenues.

Both sites are located in the Special Clinton District ("SCD") and are publicly-controlled by the Department of Environment Protection ("DEP") and the Metropolitan Transit Authority ("MTA") respectively. The off-site affordable housing development sites were identified in a Memorandum of Understanding ("MTA MOU") between the Metropolitan Transportation Authority ("MTA") and the Mayor of the City of New York dated July 11th, 2007. The goals of MTA MOU were acknowledged in a letter from Councilmember Quinn to the Deputy Mayor Dan Doctoroff also dated July 11th, 2007 (Attachments A and B).

The Proposed Actions include the adoption of zoning map and text amendments to the New York City Zoning Resolution ("ZR") and related land use action to permit the

development of the WRY as a mixed-use community with new commercial, residential and open space, including approximately:

- 5.7 million square feet of total development;
- 1.14 million square feet of commercial space;
- 4.56 million square feet of residential;

The resultant changes will encompass, *inter alia*, zoning map and text amendments and accessory parking special permits pursuant to ULURP; the leasing of, with option to purchase, development rights over the WRY, establishment of new legal grades on West 33rd Street between 11th and 12th Avenues; site selection by NYC School Construction Authority ("SCA") for an elementary/intermediate public school; and the disposition and construction of two off-site affordable housing buildings, the subject of the above referenced ULURP applications.

GENERAL COMMENTS

At the outset, Manhattan Community Board 4 ("CB4") celebrates its economic diversity and welcomes development of affordable housing for all income levels. However, the development of the two off-site affordable projects has been the subject of an ongoing spirited debate within the community with widespread community consensus against that part of the special permit seeking height increases beyond what is now permitted within the SCD.

The applications for these two publicly owned sites, located between West 48th and West 49th Street west of Tenth Avenue ("DEP Site") and 806 Ninth Avenue ("MTA Site"), contemplate the construction of a combined 312 affordable units. While the Off-site Actions are currently limited to a zoning text and district map amendment and a zoning map amendment, the ultimate development of these sites is predicated upon future land use actions.

DEP Site

Current Actions

- 1) Disposition of City Owned Property and UDAAP designation for Manhattan Block 1077, Lot 29 for development as affordable housing.
- 2) Text Amendment to the Special Clinton District Map to map Other Area on Block 1077, Lot 29 to facilitate the development of the site as affordable housing.

Future Actions

- 3) The request for the grant of a Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 96-104 to increase the height from 66 feet to 99 feet.
- 4) The request for the grant of a Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 74-681 to build over the below grade Amtrak railroad right of way.

MTA Site

Current Actions

- 5) Disposition of City Owned Property and UDAAP designation for Manhattan Block 1044, Lot 3 for development as affordable housing.
- 6) Zoning Map Amendment on Block 1044, Lot 3, to include a C1-5 overlay to facilitate the development of the site as affordable housing.

Future Actions

- 7) The request for the grant of a Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 96-104 to increase the height from 85 feet (as-of-right) to 115 feet along Ninth Avenue at the MTA site.
- 8) The request for the grant of a Special Permit for General Large Scale Development on the MTA site to facilitate the development of the site as affordable housing.

Community members were outspoken against granting any Special Permits pursuant to ZR § 96-104 in the Preservation Area of the SCD. Such a Special Permit would allow developments in the midblock a maximum height of 99 feet from the as of right height of 66 feet, and developments on the avenues up to 115 feet from the as of right height of 85 feet. Community members were very wary of granting such permits given the strong commitment to preserve both the existing fabric of the community and overall quality of life. In the 38-year history of the SCD, only two such applications have been approved in the Preservation Area. Both of these applications were opposed by CB4 as neither successfully argued that the public benefit outweighed the goals of the SCD in preserving its unique residential character.

At the same time however, the community supports the proposed housing programs for each site and welcomes securing affordable housing for the hard-to-reach 80%/125%/165% AMI (moderate and middle income) bands (Attachment C). However, many residents believe that these projects should proceed at the as-of-right heights of 66 feet and 85 feet respectively. Instead of granting the Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 96-104 to allow the requested increased height on these buildings as proposed, the community would like to see more affordable housing incorporated on-site at the WRY.

Although CB4 has previously taken a position to support Special Permits at these sites (Attachment D), our current position has now been modified to reflect the goal to balance the community's need to maximize affordable housing while at the same time preserve the residential and low-rise character of our neighborhood.

The off-site development of affordable units as mitigation for the WRY cannot take the place of a realistic plan to develop affordable units as part of the on-site development. CB4 is emphatic in its desire to see that this project integrates units affordable to those of low, moderate, and middle incomes. The WRY on-site plan must also include a firm commitment that at least 20% of all on-site residential units be developed as affordable, in perpetuity.

-

¹ 360 West 43rd Street and 404 West 54th Street

AFFORDABLE HOUSING

The Need for a Commitment to a Comprehensive Affordable Housing Plan.

CB4 has strongly articulated a policy for future housing growth affordable to a full range of incomes. We cannot and will not support any WRY development plan that does not provide the amount and type of permanent affordable housing the community needs to retain its diversity. We disagree with the DEIS conclusion that "the Proposed Actions would not significantly alter or substantially accelerate the study area's long-term trend toward increasing residential development, affluence and residential desirability." The City should be mitigating the market trend through public policy initiatives and commitment of resources to ensure affordability for all New Yorkers, not just those with the highest incomes. The Proposed Actions present an opportunity to mitigate and balance that trend to promote inclusiveness for all New Yorkers, not to rationalize creating a high income exclusive community on the Westside. The construction of a great number of market-rate housing units balanced only by the small number of lowincome housing that may be created under existing programs, e.g., 80/20 and inclusionary bonuses, does not achieve the community's goal and is unacceptable.

CB4 has consistently advocated that 30% of the residential development on this public site known as the WRY must be allocated to permanent affordable housing for low-, moderate- and middle-income families. This message was strongly reinforced by the community's comments in reviewing each of the proposals by the respondents to the Request for Proposal's ("RFP"). The New York Times concurs with this position and ran an editorial in March 2008 identifying the need for more affordable housing on the Far West Side. (Attachment E) Yet the RFPs required only that any rental housing be built using New York State Housing Finance Agency's ("HFA") 80/20 program. Condominium or cooperative units are exempt from any affordable housing requirement, and none of the rental units are required to be permanently affordable.

Public land is one of the few places where government can require that development address the housing needs of a broad range of New Yorkers. *The WRY is the largest publicly owned development site left in Manhattan*. While the MTA has a corporate responsibility to maximize the value it gets for the property, it is also a public entity; it is appropriate that the MTA's drive for financial gain be tempered by standards of public responsibility that would not apply to either a privately held corporation or a private land owner.

It is astounding that between 6,000,000 to 7,000,000 square feet will be developed for market-rate and commercial interest in the WRY, yet a just and adequate plan has not yet been fully developed to provide permanent affordable housing for New Yorkers of all incomes, particularly at a time when the need for affordable housing is so critical. CB4 cannot support the Proposed Actions in the absence of a permanent and realistic affordable housing program.

The DEIS states that only 379-390 units out of a total of 4,624 to 5,762 residential units will be affordable. How can this number be considered inclusive? It is simply unacceptable. Furthermore, the temporarily affordable units will only be for those households earning <60% AMI, with no provisions for moderate and middle income families. Such a mix will create a polarized household income range on the WRY and exclude moderate and middle income households, the backbone of our city.

After many productive discussions during the 2005 Hudson Yards rezoning process, the City and CB4 were able to achieve 28% permanent affordability that included provisions for production of moderate income housing through both a modified Inclusionary Housing Bonus and development of off-site publicly-owned land. Although the WRY proposal includes a special on-site Inclusionary Bonus, given the inherent difficult site conditions - with the extreme density proposed on such a limited lot area, CB4 is doubtful the development team will be able to access that housing bonus. CB4 appreciates and welcomes the proposed off-site moderate and middle income developments with a projected 312 affordable apartments. However, the plan for the WRY, even including those moderate and middle income off-site affordable developments, falls far short of the commitment achieved in the Hudson Yards rezoning with less than 4.5% of the square feet dedicated for the development of permanently affordable apartments.

Moreover, this new neighborhood will not be a healthy neighborhood unless it includes the broadly diverse population that is this City's hallmark. CB4's response and comments to the proposed off-site housing at the DEP site, 505 West 48th Street, and the MTA site, 806 Ninth Avenue, are in our related letter.

REQUESTS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING MITIGATION

- 1. Not less than 20% of all residential units constructed on-site in the WRY must be permanently affordable.²
- 2. Identify additional publicly owned off-site affordable housing sites in CB4 for either construction or preservation of permanently affordable housing to achieve an overall goal of 30% affordability in the WRY development. Commit the use of this existing publicly owned land to develop and construct affordable housing (Attachments F and G). In particular, CB4 recommends the sites below for consideration:
 - o 136 West 20th Street (DSNY)
 - o 415 West 40th Street (PANY/NJ)
- 3. Preserve existing affordable housing within CB4 subject to subsidy expiration. (Attachment H) Specifically, those properties currently owned by the applicant, RG WRY LLC, an affiliate of The Related Companies:

² Permanently affordable shall mean that apartments are so designated by deed restriction, regulatory agreement or other legal instrument and may not be converted to market rate units after a given expiration date of a mortgage, tax incentive or any other government program. These specific units shall remain affordable in perpetuity.

- o 425 West 48th Street
- o 525 West 47th Street
- 4. Establish a dedicated fund within existing resources to preserve Single Room Occupancy units in CB4 as mitigation of the anticipated loss of SRO units as a result of the Proposed Actions. (Attachment I) There are over 1000 SRO units noted to be at risk in the WRY study area, CB4 requests preservation of existing SRO housing with at least a 60% community resident requirement.
- 5. Implement the 2005 commitments to apply the Demolition Restrictions of the SCD in both the Hudson Yards Special District and West Chelsea Special District to preserve existing housing.
- 6. Conversion over time of on-site low income units to moderate and middle income units. At the expiration of affordability restrictions for the on-site affordable units built under the 80/20 financing program and upon the vacancy of the tenant and legal successor(s), make those units permanently affordable to households tenants with a range of moderate and middle incomes as follows:
 - o 20% of the affordable units shall be available to people with incomes up to 80% of the Area Median Income (AMI);
 - o 50% of the affordable units shall be available to people with incomes up to 125% of AMI; and
 - 30% of affordable units shall be available to people with incomes up to 165% of AMI.

Accomplish this conversion overtime through deed restriction and regulatory agreement to supplement the bond covenants, similar to the extended use restrictions on Low Income Housing Tax Credit developments.

- 7. Affordable housing distribution within mixed income developments. Eighty% of the floors of any mixed income building should have at least one affordable unit and there should be no more than 33% affordable units on any floor.
- 8. Affordable housing must become available to the real estate market at a similar rate to the market rate housing. The Restrictive Declaration should model such language from the existing Restrictive Declaration used in the Riverside South development in the West 60's.
- 9. Developments of affordable housing on- or off-site units should require of at least 50% two-bedroom or greater units.
- 10. The administering agent should be an independent non-profit organization.

THE ULURP APPLICATIONS

In light of the above enumerated concerns, CB4 has carefully reviewed these ULURP applications; our comments and recommendations follow.

1) ULURP No. 090422HAM--Disposition of City Owned Property and UDAAP designation for Manhattan Block 1077, Lot 29 for development as affordable housing (DEP Site)

CB4 <u>recommends denial</u> of the City Owned Property and UDAAP designation for Manhattan Block 1077, Lot 29 for development as affordable housing (DEP Site) ULURP No. 090422HAM, unless the following conditions are met:

The Affordable Housing Component

- A restrictive declaration be filed that restricts development of the site for affordable housing in perpetuity as follows:
 - o 20% of the units be affordable to those earning 80% Area Median Income;
 - o 40% of the units be affordable to those earning 125% Area Median Income; and
 - o 40% of the units be affordable to those earning 165% Area Median Income.
- At least 50% of the developed units must be family-sized i.e. two bedrooms or larger.
- A permanent easement is granted for unobstructed light and air from the DEP water access tunnel site to the east. Because of the peculiarities of this development site, fronted by a park and/or undeveloped DEP water tunnel access along its eastern border and being situated over the railroad cut, CB4 is not opposed to a future special permit to reduce the lot coverage requirement and to reduce the rear yard depth. However, light and air, including operational windows along the eastern façade cannot be obstructed by the DEP water tunnel structures or subsequent security measures.
- Any future action at this site for a Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 96-104, seeking to increase building height, must not exceed a proposed 76 feet total in height. CB4 arrived at the 76 foot height limitation as a compromise between the City and the strongly held principles of community residents who care deeply about both maximizing affordable housing opportunities while preserving the residential, low-rise character of the neighborhood (Attachment J).
- No retail and/or commercial use shall be included in the development. The community strongly opposes the proposed use to include street level retail on West 49th Street. Retail commercial uses on the residential side streets are a growing problem now exacerbating an already problematic bar/club use on residential blocks, which is negatively impacting the character of the neighborhood.
- DEP release the portion of the site not being used by DEP (that portion over the rail cut and a strip of terra firma to the west) by 2010 in order to allow affordable housing development to proceed prior to 2013.

- The City's prior commitment to use public funds to develop this project must be codified in a Follow-Up Corrective Actions ("FUCA") memorandum of understanding that is executed simultaneously with the rezoning action for the WRY.
- A restrictive declaration be filed stating that the site cannot generate an inclusionary housing bonus or be used to satisfy the SCD District Harassment Cure requirements pursuant to ZR § 96-110.
- Comfort stations for public use in conjunction with the DEP open space be included in the affordable housing development. and
- The RFPs to select a developer for this site be developed in consultation with CB4.

The Open Space Component

Finally, as part of a negotiated agreement between the City, DEP and CB4, the area immediately east of the affordable housing site shall be developed as open space and shall be used as a park with programming for young children. Currently, CB4 ranks 58th among 59 Community Districts throughout the city.

More than a decade ago, the use of the land fronting Tenth Avenue between West 48th and 49th Streets was committed for public open space. In the Negative Declaration dated May 25, 1993, DEP assured CB4 that the site was "to be used for occasional tunnel maintenance and that shaft would be 5 feet by 3 feet with a 14 inch diameter" (Attachment K). By letters dated February 28, 2005 from Adrian Benepe of the New York City Department of Parks ("NYCDP") and dated September 7, 2006 by Deputy Commissioner Alfonso R. Lopez from DEP to Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer (Attachments L and M), both city agencies restated their commitment for public open space on the balance of this site. At that point, even the area that DEP needed for access was intended to be accessible to the public as a park extension. We learned only late last week, on July 16th, 2009, that the West 49th Street site is now intended to serve as the main west side access point to the water tunnel and that security and maintenance needs will result in the full half-block being paved and fenced and that ownership will remain with DEP; therefore:

- Resolution of the exact dimensions of the publicly-accessible open space in relation to the portion of the site needed by DEP for access to the water tunnel, *must be codified in writing by DEP*.
- A clear written timeline for acquisition and development of this open space must be included in the overall WRY development plan and <u>be codified in writing by</u> DEP.
- The identification by the Mayor's office of a DEP or other agency controlled site for replacement open space to be located within a sub-area of CB4 (West 34th to West 57th Streets and West of 8th Avenue), equal to that open space lost due to

DEP's expanded site usage for water tunnel maintenance ((currently approximated at 120 by 200 feet in dimension).

• A written commitment from DEP for the hiring of a landscape architect to plan the landscaping and use of both the undisputed northern portion of open space and the southern portion maintenance area. A further written commitment for the funding of such open space improvements with the agreement to continue to include CB4 and the surrounding community in its development process.

2) <u>ULURP No. N090429ZRM--Text Amendment to the Special Clinton District Map to map Other Area on Block 1077, Lot 29 to facilitate the development of the site as affordable housing</u>

The proposed Zoning Text Amendment seeks to move the boundaries of the Preservation Area of the SCD to the east so that the proposed development falls within the Other Area, which has less stringent rear yard requirements and overall greater lot coverage. This proposed action, reducing the Preservation Area, is in direct contravention with CB4's longstanding policy to expand the Preservation Area. It is also inconsistent with the Department of City Planning's ("DCP") own framework for the 11th Avenue Rezoning that will extend the boundaries of the Preservation Area westward to within 100 feet of 11th Avenue.

This site is unique. It is situated over a rail cut with open space and the DEP access for the water tunnel extends the full length of its eastern façade. The proposed building form makes best use of the site, maximizes the number of affordable units, and has adequate light and air, given the open space to the east. However, we strongly believe that the regulations are best modified through text amendments governing rear yard requirements and permitting greater lot coverage.

CB4 <u>recommends denial</u> of the Zoning Text Amendment for Manhattan Block 1077, Lot 29 (DEP Site) for development as affordable housing), ULURP No. N090429ZRM, <u>unless the following conditions are met:</u>

- The boundaries of the Preservation Area are not changed and that modifications as necessary to expand both rear yard requirements and lot coverage are accomplished through subsequent text amendments.
- 3) ULURP No. 090423HAM, Disposition of City Owned Property and UDAAP designation for Manhattan Block 1044, Lot 3 for development as affordable housing (MTA Site)

CB4 <u>recommends denial</u> of the City Owned Property and UDAAP designation for Manhattan Block 1044, Lot 3 for development as affordable housing (MTA Site) ULURP No. 090423HAM, unless the following conditions are met:

- A restrictive declaration be filed that restricts development of the site for affordable housing, in perpetuity, as follows:
 - o 20% of the units be affordable to those earning 80% Area Median Income;
 - 40% of the units be affordable to those earning 125% Area Median Income; and
 - o 40% of the units be affordable to those earning 165% Area Median Income:
- At least 50% of the units developed must be family-sized i.e. two bedrooms or larger.
- The elimination of the 30,000 square feet reserved for the MTA office/training space; additional MTA needs can be accommodated at the existing MTA Control Center ("Control Center") to the east or on the 7,000,000 square feet to be developed on-site at the WRY. It is outrageous to expect MTA needs to be accommodated within the small lot area dedicated to affordable housing.
- Any future action at this site for a Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 96-104, seeking to increase building height, must maintain a building height of 85 feet along Ninth Avenue frontage, and on West 54th Street, beginning 50 feet east of Ninth Avenue and through the midblock backing against the existing MTA Control Center, the building height must be no greater than 99 feet. CB4 arrived at the 85 and 99 foot height limits at this site as a compromise between the City and strongly held principles of community residents who care deeply about both maximizing affordable housing opportunities while preserving the residential, low-rise character of the neighborhood (Attachment N).
- Eliminate the 15 MTA parking spaces planned for the site.
- MTA release the city owned site from the NYCTA master lease upon approval of the WRY ULURP by the City Council, <u>not</u> a release contingent upon construction start at the WRY. The off-site housing is mitigation under the DEIS for the Proposed Actions, namely the rezoning from an FAR of 2.0 to an FAR of 10.0. Therefore, when the zoning is approved the mitigation is required.
- The RFP to select a developer for this site be developed in consultation with CB4.
- The City's prior commitment of public financing to develop this project be codified in a FUCA memorandum of understanding that is executed simultaneously with the rezoning action for the WRY.
- A restrictive declaration be filed stating that the site cannot generate an inclusionary housing bonus or be used to satisfy the CSD District Harassment Cure requirements pursuant to ZR § 96-110.
- The designation of two potential landmarks identified in the WRY DEIS: (Attachments O, P and Q)
 - o St. Benedict the Moor Church, 342 West 53rd Street NYCL- and S/NR-eligible: Erected in 1869 and designed by R.C. McLane & Sons, the church has seen various congregations and parishioners over its more than 100-year history, yet most famously served as the first black Roman Catholic Church north of the Mason Dixon line. In 1921, due to African American migration to the north, the congregation moved to Harlem and the church was reassigned to the Spanish Order of Franciscans in 1954 who have occupied the site ever since. The church stands as a vestige of

- the days when the neighborhood of Clinton/Hell's Kitchen was a thriving African-American neighborhood.
- Tenement Blockfront (781-795 9th Avenue) S/NR-eligible
 This collection of Hell's Kitchen tenements serves as a reminder of the late 19th century residential character of Ninth Avenue. The Renaissance-inspired stone, brick, terra cotta, and metal ornamentation and largely extant cornices present a valuable collection of tenement architecture.

4) <u>ULURP No. 090430ZMM—Zoning Map Amendment to Block 1044</u>, Lot 3, to include a C1-5 overlay to facilitate the development of the site as affordable housing

This requested Zoning Map change seeks to cover the entire zoning lot with a C1-5 overlay thus permitting a future action that will include a Large Scale Development Plan reducing rear yard requirements and relaxing lot coverage restrictions. Similar to the DEP site, we believe that the proposed building form makes best use of the site, maximizes the number of affordable units and has adequate light and air. However, we are concerned by the wider latitude granted to a developer in a Large Scale Development Plan and the unforeseen consequences. In the history of the SCD, a Large Scale Development plan has never been used. To permit one now on this site would set a precedent for the entire Special District. Similar to the DEP site, we strongly believe that the rear yard and lot coverage regulations are best modified through text amendments.

This proposed action also anticipates a future action for a Special Permit to increase the building height along Ninth Avenue to 115 feet. At the conclusion of the well attended and very engaged public debates on the two off-site developments, we delicately balanced the concerns of the community and arrived at an overall compromise to maximize the affordable units and to preserve community character.

Accordingly, CB4 <u>recommends denial</u> of Zoning Map Amendment ULURP No. 090430 ZMM, unless the following conditions are met:

• C1-5 map amendment covering the entire zoning lot be denied; the City and/or future developers commit to not filing a Large Scale Residential Plan for the site and instead accomplish desired modifications as necessary to rear yard requirements and lot coverage through subsequent text amendments. If a C1-5 map amendment is approved against our objections then the commercial FAR be limited to one (1) FAR.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Manhattan Community Board 4 recommends denial of ULURP Nos. N 090429ZRM, 090430ZMM, N090423HAM, 090422HAM unless the above enumerated conditions are met.

Sincerely,

John Weis, Chair

Manhattan Community Board 4

Elisa Gerontianos, Chair

Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Committee

Joe Restuccia, Co-Chair Housing Health and Human

Services Committee

Housing Health and Human

Services Committee

Sarah Desmond

ATTACHMENTS

A. MTA Memorandum of Understanding, dated July 11, 2007

- B. July 11th, 2007 letter from Councilmember Quinn to the Deputy Mayor Dan Doctoroff
- C. AMI Income Chart
- D. October 14, 2008 letter from CB4 to the New York City Planning Commission
- E. New York Times, "Finally, A Vision for the West Side", March 28, 2008
- F. Map of Publicly Owned Land in CB4: Potential Affordable Housing Sites North of 35th Street
- G. Map of Publicly Owned Land in CB4: Potential Affordable Housing Sites South of 35th Street
- H. Map of Existing Affordable Housing in CB4 Subject to Expiration
- I. Table of SROs in CB4
- J. CB4 recommended massing of DEP Site
- K. May 25, 1993 DEP Negative Declaration
- L. February 28, 2005 letter New York City Department of Parks to CB4
- M. September 7, 2006 letter from DEP to Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer
- N. CB4 recommended massing of MTA Site
- O. Proposed Individual Landmarks Map
- P. Proposed Individual Landmarks Table
- Q. Proposed Individual Landmarks Photos