



CITY OF NEW YORK

**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR**

330 West 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, 26<sup>th</sup> floor New York, NY 10036  
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512  
www.ManhattanCB4.org

**JEAN-DANIEL NOLAND**  
Chair

**ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.**  
District Manager

March 16, 2009

Borough Commissioner Margaret Forgione  
NYC Department of Transportation  
59 Maiden Lane, 35<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10038

**Re: Request to change parking regulations at east side of Eleventh Avenue  
between 46<sup>th</sup> Street and 47<sup>th</sup> Street**

Dear Commissioner Forgione:

Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4) opposes the proposal by Ogilvy and Mather (O&M) to change the parking regulations on a portion of the east side of Eleventh Avenue between 46<sup>th</sup> and 47<sup>th</sup> Streets from 2-hour metered parking to a "No Standing/Bus Zone". The change would result in a loss of three 2-hour parking meters. More importantly, it would suggest we support the creation of a private shuttle service generating 73 trips a day through our most congested avenues and intersections. We do not support a private shuttle service and instead urge the use of adequate, existing public transportation.

The proposed shuttle service would operate mini- and large-size buses between the O&M building on 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Penn Station, the Port Authority Terminal, and Grand Central Terminal. More specifically, O&M is moving its headquarters and its 2,000 employees from World Wide Plaza at Eighth Avenue and 48<sup>th</sup> Street, to the building on Eleventh Avenue. O&M estimates that 1,300 of these employees would utilize these vehicles. According to the estimates from Sam Schwartz & Associates there would be:

- 30 round trips each day during rush hour from O&M to the Port Authority Terminal;
- 14 round trips each day during rush hour from O&M to Penn Station;
- 11 round trips each day during rush hour from O&M to Grand Central Station; and,
- 18 round trips each day during the mid-day (9:30am to 3:30pm) from O&M to Grand Central Station.

Furthermore, the applicant could not explain where the buses would be stored when not in use. This area is overwhelmed with charter buses roaming and idling, as there is a shortage of available parking for them.

However, this site is well served by mass transit. The M42 (runs approximately every seven to nine minutes during rush hours) and the M50 (currently runs approximately every 12 minutes during rush hours) buses stop within three blocks (750 feet) of the site and the M11 stops one avenue block (Tenth Avenue) from the site. The site is also three avenue blocks from the C and E trains.

While CB4 understands that the change of location may be seen as a temporary inconvenience for some of the employees, we believe that given the wide variety of commuting options that are available they will be able to adapt. The public cost of the extra congestion and pollution outweighs the slight extra convenience that private shuttle service might provide for some of the O&M employees.

Sincerely,



Jean-Daniel Noland  
Chair  
Manhattan  
Community Board 4



Christine Berthet  
Co-Chair  
Transportation Planning  
Committee



Jay Marcus  
Co-Chair  
Transportation Planning  
Committee

c.c.

Ogilvy and Mather – Jose Guerrero  
MTA – Adrienne Taub