



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.ManhattanCB4.org

JEAN-DANIEL NOLAND
Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.
District Manager

October 6, 2008

Hon. Robert B. Tierney
Chair
Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building, Ninth floor
One Center Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: Application for proposed rooftop addition on 152 Ninth Avenue in the Chelsea Historic District

Dear Chair Tierney:

Manhattan Community Board 4 is writing to affirm its opposition to the proposed rooftop addition on 152 Ninth Avenue in the Chelsea Historic District. The addition would be widely visible from its surroundings and is inappropriate to the Historic District.

The proposed addition is located in the west edge of the District on a building next to the end of a row of four-story buildings on the east side of Ninth Avenue. Only two buildings separate it from 19th Street to its south, one the current southernmost building of the row and the other a reduced remnant of the original end of the row that is not included within the Historic District. This ensures that the addition with its large glass front enclosed in brick would, although set back 15 feet, be at least partially visible from over six blockfronts on the opposite side of Ninth Avenue, most importantly on the south. The addition would significantly diminish the most important feature of the row, its continuous roofline against the sky, which makes it an impressively solid block.

The addition would also be visible from 19th and 20th Streets to the west of Ninth Avenue. Most significantly, 19th Street well to the west would offer a head-on view of the addition, which would largely block the good view from the street of the tower of Saint Peter's Church of 20th Street over the low rooftops of the Historic District. The church is a major element of the Historic District; and its early Gothic Revival architecture, which probably owes much to its founder, Clement Clarke Moore, makes it a symbol of Chelsea.

These views are accurately laid out in the maps prepared by the applicant, but the photographs, naturally taken in the leafy season, minimize the impact of these views,

especially from the side streets. The views are real, even in this year's particularly rainy season, and the addition would stand out very clearly in the leafless time.

The application is inappropriate and should be denied.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Jd' with a long horizontal stroke extending to the left.

Jean-Daniel Noland
Chair
Manhattan Community Board 4

c.c.
Applicant
Save Chelsea
Chelsea Block Associations