



CITY OF NEW YORK

**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR**

330 West 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, 26<sup>th</sup> floor New York, NY 10036  
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512  
www.ManhattanCB4.org

**JEAN-DANIEL NOLAND**  
Chair

**ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.**  
District Manager

**Item # 1: RATIFICATION**

August 25, 2008

Hon. Amanda M. Burden, Director  
New York City Department of City Planning  
22 Reade Street  
New York, NY 10007-1216

**Re: Manhattan Borough President Scott M. Stringer's August 11, 2008 comments on ULURP Application No. C 080280 PCM – Site Selection and Acquisition to facilitate the construction of a garage serving Sanitation Service Districts 1, 2 and 5**

Dear Director Burden:

The New York City Department of Sanitation seeks site selection and acquisition for the construction of a garage serving Sanitation Service Districts 1, 2 and 5 (C 080280 PCM). Manhattan Borough President Scott M. Stringer has recommended conditional disapproval of the proposed siting of the multi-garage facility unless additional analysis is provided exploring the feasibility of relocating the District 5 garage to a different site. We wish to comment on the proposed alternative sites for the District 5 garage located in Manhattan Community District 4.

**Block 675 – 29<sup>th</sup> to 30<sup>th</sup> Streets, Eleventh to Twelfth Avenues**

During the Hudson Yards rezoning CB4 agreed to the siting of a DSNY garage accommodating two sanitation districts on Block 675. This agreement was part of a negotiated, multi-use package that sought to maximize the utility of the block for the city and for the community. We note that Block 675's environment has changed significantly since the rezoning was approved in January 2005 and that to date DSNY has not found the site to be acceptable. We remain prepared to consider the suitability of the site for a district garage subject to an appropriate analysis of the changed environment.

**Block 670 – 25<sup>th</sup> to 26<sup>th</sup> Streets, Eleventh to Twelfth Avenues - Manhattan Repair Facility**

We oppose the siting of a district garage within the Manhattan Repair Facility on Block 670. This facility is responsible for routine repairs to DSNY vehicles that exceed the preventive maintenance capabilities of the district garages, as well as exceptional repairs such as frame straightening and engine replacement that can only be carried out in a

specially equipped facility. The Manhattan Repair Facility was specifically designed and equipped for these crucial functions, not for the different requirements of a district garage. Siting a district garage here would displace many of these repair functions, underutilize the facility and create an eventual shortage of major repair capability in Manhattan. In addition, the daily in-and-out of trucks typical of a district garage would greatly increase traffic at the repair facility where trucks typically arrive to spend several days or weeks while being repaired.

### **DEIS Alternative Sites**

The DEIS lists and evaluates alternative sites in the western part of CD4 north of 42<sup>nd</sup> Street and concludes that financial constraints prevent the location of the garage at any of them. While we are prepared to work with DSNY on any site that meets its needs, we are concerned that the siting of a third facility on this part of Twelfth Avenue, with two opposite active commercial piers, would lead to unacceptable traffic congestion. Also, CB4 has been working actively with the Department of City Planning to rezone the Eleventh Avenue corridor north of 42<sup>nd</sup> Street with an emphasis on residential infill.

This letter was approved by the Executive Committee of Manhattan Community Board 4 at its meeting on August 25, 2008 and is subject to ratification by the full board at its meeting on September 3, 2008.

Sincerely,



Jean-Daniel Noland  
Chair

Cc: Manhattan Borough President Scott Stringer  
NYC Council Speaker Christine Quinn  
NYS Senator Thomas Duane  
NYS Assemblyman Richard Gottfried  
Congressman Jerrold Nadler  
Dan Klein (DOS)