



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036

tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512

www.ManhattanCB4.org

JEAN-DANIEL NOLAND

Chair

ROBERT J. BENFATTO, JR., ESQ.

District Manager

October 4, 2007

Elliot G. Sander
Executive Director and Chief Executive Officer
Metropolitan Transportation Authority
347 Madison Avenue
New York, New York 10017

Re: Requests for Proposals for Development at the West Side Yard

Dear Mr. Sander:

With the responses to the Requests for Proposal (RFPs) for the West Side Yard (WSY) due October 10 and 11, 2007, we join our State Senator Thomas Duane and our State Assembly Member Richard N. Gottfried and many others in requesting – insisting! – that there be an opportunity for public review of the Project Profile portion of all responses before the MTA selects a developer.

That is precisely what the MTA did in the redevelopment of the Coliseum site at Columbus Circle, which resulted in the development of the Time Warner Center. That request for proposals was released in July 1996 and responses were due November 1, 1996. All nine submissions were publicly displayed in the Coliseum lobby starting January 6, 1997. A shortlist of proposals was released in March 1997, and the MTA made its selection in May 1997. There are abundant reasons why a similar procedure should be followed here.

Development of the WRY will create an entirely new section of the City, with profound implications not only for the immediate surroundings, which this Board represents, but also for the urban and economic development of the City as a whole. There will be public choices and trade-offs involved in terms of return to the MTA, production of affordable housing, creation of public open space, preservation of the High Line, environmental impacts, competition for commercial development, municipal finance, development risk, etc. etc. It is essential that these choices and trade-offs be publicly understood and discussed before a decision is made.

We understand that legal considerations may preclude public disclosure of certain confidential information contained in the responses. We do not seek that information. What we seek is only the information required in the Project Profile portion of the responses, which will be fundamental to a public understanding of the proposals. The Project Profile requires:

- a description of each proposed project concept, approach and vision, including treatment of the High Line;
- a description of the proposed building and site design;
- conceptual design drawings including a site plan;
- a summary of the proposed strategy for financing the development; and
- the conceptual schedule for project completion.

We understand that the MTA must be responsive to a host of sometimes competing priorities and considerations, and we are grateful for the MTA's increased responsiveness to the public under the current administration. We look forward to working constructively with you as plans for the West Side Yard move forward.

In the meantime, we respectfully request that the MTA respond in the next two weeks as to how it intends to make the proposals available to the public.

Sincerely,



Jean-Daniel Noland
Chair
Manhattan Community Board Four

Cc: Pat Foye, Downstate Chairman, Empire State Development Corporation
Bill Wheeler and Roco Krsulic, MTA
Ann Weisbrod, President, Hudson Yards Development Corporation
Brookfield Properties - Joshua Sirefman, Sr. VP, U.S. Development
The Durst Organization - Douglas Durst
Extell Development Company - Gary Barnett, President
Related, LP - Jeff T. Blau, President
Vornado Development - Steve Roth
Electeds
Assembly Member Richard Brodsky