



CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

424 West 33rd Street, Suite 580 New York, NY 10001

tel: 212-736-4536
www.mcb4.nyc

JESSICA CHAIT
Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
District Manager

February 29, 2024

Elizabeth Sellman
President and Chief Operating Officer
Mount Sinai Beth Israel
281 1st Avenue
New York, NY 10003

Re: Mount Sinai Beth Israel Planned Closure

Dear President and Chief Operating Officer Sellman,

At Manhattan Community Board 4's (MCB4) Housing, Health, and Human Services (HHHS) Committee meeting on January 4th, 2024, the committee received a presentation from Brad Korn from Mount Sinai regarding the planned closure of Mount Sinai Beth Israel Hospital. Mount Sinai Beth Israel is located at 281 1st Avenue on East 16th Street.

During the MCB4 full board meeting held on February 7, 2023, the board voted 36 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstaining, and 0 present but not eligible to vote, to request:

- Information regarding emergency room services. With this closure, how can emergency room services be retained in some fashion and/or coordinated with other hospitals? If the ER is not retained, will other local ER's have increased staffing levels? MCB4 requests that NYC DOHMH and NYS DOH please provide:
 - An analysis of staffing levels of remaining emergency rooms and specifically the impact on Mount Sinai West Emergency Room at 1000 10th Ave.
 - Emergency room capacity at hospitals around Beth Israel, including:
 - How many patients per day will be redirected to neighboring hospitals?
 - What excess capacity is available in the adjacent hospital's emergency room?
 - What is the average peak waiting time in these adjacent hospitals?
 - An analysis of emergency vehicle travel time from Lower Manhattan through Chelsea and Clinton when ambulances need to transport patients to Mount Sinai West. Transporting patients in need of critical care through rush hour traffic and

the junctures of the Lincoln Tunnel has the potential for catastrophic results due to dramatic increases in transport times.

- NYS has identified a lack of inpatient psychiatric beds as part of a larger lack of mental health services. MCB4 suggest that when the Mount Sinai Beth Israel campus is repurposed in the future, that part of the campus be designated for such a use or other community facility uses.

NYC and NYS must be more vigilant about the long-term consequences to residents when hospitals want to merge or do deals that may affect their patients.

Background

Mount Sinai Beth Israel, a hospital within the Mount Sinai Health System, is a 696-bed hospital located at East 16th Street and 1st Avenue. The hospital serves Lower Manhattan, an area that has experienced the closure of multiple hospitals serving neighborhoods including Greenwich Village, the Lower East Side, Little Italy, and Chinatown.

Mount Sinai, which bought the Beth Israel hospital on November 22nd, 2013, has cited financial losses and a decrease in inpatient services as reasons for the shutdown. Since opening, Beth Israel has been operating at a loss of \$100 million annually, totaling over \$1 billion. The financial losses are projected to increase, reaching \$150 million in 2023.

Ramp Down Plan

On January 4th, 2024, Brad Korn from Mount Sinai presented an update on the proposed closing plan for the Beth Israel campus. Mount Sinai has set the closing of its Beth Israel campus on 16th Street for July 2024, and has begun gradually closing units, despite not receiving approval from NYSDOH. The gradual closing of units is part of the 16th Street Ramp Down plan:

- Reducing inpatient hospital beds to align with the declining census and decreasing ICU beds to match census.
- Beginning in January, move elective specialty services to other Mount Sinai Hospitals, and completely eliminating surgical services by March.
- Beginning in December 2023, transition non-emergency heart patients and those needing medical imaging to other Mount Sinai Hospitals and serve any heart attack patient until July 12th.
- Beginning in January, stroke patients needing inpatient care will be moved to other Mount Sinai Hospitals that specialize in that type of care after receiving emergency care and being stabilized, and any stroke patient will receive emergency care until July 12th.
- The emergency room will remain open until July 12th.

Emergency Services

The closure of Mount Sinai Beth Israel will close the ER on East 16th Street, increasing the pressure on other hospitals in Lower Manhattan. Mount Sinai's statistics state that 85% of emergency departments at Beth Israel are treat and release. Despite this fact, eliminating emergency services will remove an emergency department from the map, increasing ambulance ride times and wait times at emergency rooms in Lower Manhattan.

MCB4 requests that NYC DOHMH and NYS DOH provide an analysis of staffing levels of remaining emergency rooms, and emergency room capacities at other hospitals that Mount Sinai lists as viable alternatives for emergency services. In this analysis, please include how many patients per day will be redirected to neighboring hospitals, what excess capacity is available in the neighboring hospitals emergency departments, and what are the peak average waiting times in these neighboring hospitals. Quantifying the impact of the Beth Israel hospital closure is important when informing the public of the potential consequences.

City and State Requests

Hospital consolidations and closings have damaging ramifications for the residents they serve. Hospitals submit closure proposals to NYSDOH, who approve or deny the action. MCB4 requests that the City and State be more vigilant about the long-term consequences of hospital closures and consolidations and the effects that these actions may have on patients and residents. MCB4 proposes a robust analysis of how the closure of a hospital will affect other local hospitals' ability to match the service needs of the community.

Future Repurposing of Mount Sinai Beth Israel

NYS has identified a lack of inpatient psychiatric beds as a priority for mental health funding. If Mount Sinai Beth Israel is to close in July 2024, there would be a large vacant medical campus which could be used for future community facility use. MCB4 proposes that the future repurposing of the Beth Israel campus includes a mental health facility with inpatient and residential beds or be repurposed for other community facility uses.

Sincerely,



Jessica Chait
Chair
Manhattan Community Board 4



Joe Restuccia
Chair
Housing, Health, Human Services
Committee



Maria Ortiz
Chair
Housing, Health, Human Services
Committee