



CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY
BOARD No. 4
 424 West 33rd Street, Suite 580
 New York, NY 10001
 tel: 212-736-4536
 www.nyc.gov/MCB4

Jeffrey LeFrancois
 Chair

Jesse R. Bodine
 District Manager

December 2022 Full Board Minutes

Meeting Date / Location	The Manhattan Community Board 4 (MCB4) Full Board met at 6:30pm on Wednesday, December 7, 2022, in a fully virtual meeting format. The meeting was accessible via Zoom webinar and live streamed on YouTube. It can be viewed at: https://youtu.be/NyUS2_rMjIk
-------------------------	--

Public Hearing: Land Use Application for 260 11th Avenue for a zoning text amendment to ZR Section 98-423 to facilitate an enlargement

Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU) Co-Chair Jessica Chait opened a public hearing regarding the zoning text amendment for 260 11th Avenue, which was also discussed at the CLU Meeting.

- There were no speakers for the public hearing.

Public Session Speakers

Bobby Vangelatos	Mr. Vangelatos is Center Manager at Chelsea Recreation Center. Next Friday, December 16 from 5pm-7pm, the Center will be hosting Winter Paint Night painting classes. December 17 from 8am-4pm is an all-day goal ball tournament. Junior basketball clinics are being held on Tuesdays and Thursdays for ages 5-10 and Saturdays for ages 11-14. If anyone is interested in more information or to register for these programs, please call the Center.
Deborah Ramer	Ms. Ramer lives in Penn South above the Penn South dog park. She loves dogs but gets woken up every morning by noise from the dog park, which has been causing sleep deprivation. Ms. Ramer started a petition advocating that the dog park should be closed now that the Chelsea Waterside Park dog park is open. The Penn South dog park was sold to residents as temporary and a trial, and the trial is not working.
Jane Darcy	Ms. Darcy is a resident of Penn South and has found that the barking from the dog park is causing intense stress and anxiety. It is causing sleep issues, and prevents her from peaceful use of her apartment and balcony. The barking bounces off the building and amplifies as the sound travels. Ms. Darcy asserts that there are other ways for members of the community to connect, and it does not need the Penn South dog park for this purpose.
Lyudmyla Sossa	Ms. Sossa lives in Penn South and the dog park has been causing a mental nightmare due to the sound of barking every day. The owners do not control the barking and the sound echoes. The location of the park is not appropriate and it's affecting quality of life of the 300+ nearby apartment dwellers, as well as creating a smelly nuisance. Ms. Sossa loves dogs but the quality of her life has been badly impacted by the dog park.

Susan Wallitt	Ms. Wallitt lives in Penn South across the street from the dog park. She asserts that now that Chelsea Waterside dog run is open, the Penn South dog run should be closed. Ms. Wallitt has asked several times to close the dog park; only as a last resort should the hours be limited to 12-2pm and 5-7pm instead of entirely closing the park. Over 50% of the residents of Penn South are senior citizens, who are impacted by the dogs barking all day. Dog owners had previously been able to walk to Chelsea Waterside Park before the Penn South run was open, and should be able to return there.
Rita Mullaney	Ms. Mullaney states that the Penn South dog run was sold as a temporary measure until the Chelsea Waterside dog park was completed. It is causing a quality of life issue, and the initial premise that it was just a temporary measure should be adhered to. Therefore, Ms. Mullaney advocates for closing the park now that the Chelsea Waterside Park run has been completed.
Lisa Wager	Ms. Wager is Director of Government and Community Relations at the Fashion Institute of Technology (FIT). A recent Newsweek ranking placed FIT first among colleges in New York State and 22 nd in the nation for online education. A new exhibition at FIT opened today; students created showstopping designs inspired by art as part of their capstone projects. A new exhibition, Designing Women: Fashion Curators and their Interiors, also opened at the Museum of FIT. It explores the intersection between fashion and interior decoration; the exhibition will be up through June.
Shelli Rosen	Ms. Rosen is a resident of Penn South and spoke in support of the dog run on behalf of the people who use it. She asserts that the barking is not constant; she has spent time directly above the park on a high floor. Over a hundred people signed a petition supporting the dog run. Traveling to the dog run on 11 th Avenue can be a mile roundtrip for residents, which makes it inaccessible to some. There should be an alternate location for a dog park if the park at Penn South is closed, in order to serve the hundreds of supporters of the park.
Marilyn Rivera	Ms. Rivera lives at Penn South and is against the dog park. She has lived in apartments with a lot of noise from traffic and had gotten used to that type of noise, but the dog park noise is distinct and has a very negative quality of life impact. She loves dogs but believes the noise from the dog park is unacceptable.
Joan Starr	Ms. Starr is a Penn South resident who uses and supports the dog park. She asserts that the level of barking has been exaggerated, based on her observations from the time she has spent there.
Inge Ivchenko	Ms. Ivchenko asserts that the 22 nd Street open street was created as temporary, but is concerned that things that are temporary tend to become permanent. Further, there are unclear criteria about street closures, and these criteria are inconsistent. Barriers on the street are troublesome. Ms. Ivchenko asks if independent traffic studies of the impact been conducted, and asserts that there are issues with access-a-rides and delivery and other vehicles accessing the street.
Barak Friedman	Mr. Friedman is a supporter of the 22 nd Street open street. Almost 85% of residents do not have a car, whereas cars take up most of the street space. He asserts that it's an equity issue for people without cars.
Candace Worth	Ms. Worth asserts that people without cars still rely on taxis and Ubers that need to access the street. The closed street has inconvenienced neighbors as well as created a safety issue, requiring cars to sit on 8 th Avenue and blocking traffic while moving the heavy gates from the street. Barriers signal that the street is closed to cars that would otherwise have been able to use the street.
Cindy Loomis	Ms. Loomis understands the reason for closing 22nd Street during the COVID-19 pandemic but asserts that this is the worst block in the neighborhood to close as it has a

	garage, and no park, school or open restaurants on the block. She has not seen many people using the open street.
Jeff Preston	Mr. Preston lives on the 400 block of west 22 nd street. He asserts that residents have not been given a forum to voice their perspectives about the open street. The 200, 300 and 400 block associations have yet to hold meetings to address the issue and gain consensus. The October 15 visioning meeting included many people opposed to the barricades, but they were not allowed to speak. There are over 250 petition signatures from zip 10011 and hundreds more from surrounding blocks calling for the reopening of the street. The block is the wrong one to close and restrict the natural flow of traffic.
Joseph Neuhaus	Mr. Neuhaus lives a block away from the closed section of 22 nd Street and opposes the continuing street closure. He asserts that the advocates for street closures are not defending the status quo, but promising a better future state. There's no dispute that there is little support for the existing barriers; the neighborhood should allow future plans for the block to sink or swim on their own merits rather than maintaining the street closure.
Katherine Nessel	Ms. Nessel supports the 22 nd Street open street. She reiterates that 85% of the neighborhood does not have a car and 94% of zip code 10011 does not use a car to get to work. People who do not use a car are entitled to their fair share of the street, and the needs of this majority of residents should be prioritized.
Lowell Thomas	Mr. Thomas is against the barricades on the block. He lives on the next block over and has many times passed the 22 nd Street intersection and saw traffic backed up there, creating a dangerous situation. The free flow of traffic is integral to safety and the proper functioning of the city.
Keith Lichtman	Mr. Lichtman lives on the block of 22 nd Street between 7 th and 8 th Avenues. The closed block takes away basic transportation services for people who live on the block. It's unjust and unfair to take access to these services away from residents. He asserts that the block should return to its earlier state.
Melodie Bryant	Ms. Bryant fully supports the open street. The nearest parks for adults are Hudson River Park and Madison Square Park; the open street is needed as an additional area for recreation. The real inconveniences are the pollution, honking and harassment from drivers. Taxis, Ubers and deliveries still do access the open street block, as do the fire department and sanitation. There are other alternatives for drivers to cross town. Open streets are also one way residents can help to fight climate change. Ms. Bryant invites other Chelsea blocks to help create a linear park to the river.
Molly Harris	Ms. Harris is a member of the 200 west block association. She has not received communication from the block association about the street closure despite asking to be added to their mailing list. She is interested in other solutions for reducing drivers' speeds on the block. Pitting car owners against other residents is unhelpful.
Nico McLane	Ms. McLane is a longtime resident of west 22 nd Street between 7 th and 8 th Avenue and is opposed to the open street. The barricades are not maintained, and at night the barricades are sometimes knocked over or people trip over them. Her 91-year old stepdad was recently unable to quickly get an emergency vehicle, due to the driver not wanting to move the barriers. No one reached out to her as a resident for feedback.
Samir Lavingia	Mr. Lavingia is a resident who lives nearby and enjoys using the open street. He finds it pleasant to walk and bike on a quiet street without cars. He has observed drivers closing the barriers after driving through, an indication that they are working as intended.
Shana Cohen	Ms. Cohen lives on the 200 block of west 22 nd Street and loves the open street. She enjoys seeing people walking on the block in the middle of the street.

Steven Schram	Mr. Schram asserts that the open street was a temporary designation during the pandemic, and the street should return to how it was prior to these extraordinary circumstances. He was blindsided by the October visioning meeting, where the baseline was to keep the barriers up, while the majority of attendees were opposed to the open street. The block association has remained silent on the issue and has left residents without a voice on the issue. The 22 nd Street block is a bad choice to designate as an open street.
Tom Lunke	Mr. Lunke states that the 22 nd Street open street is maintained by a large group of volunteers, and accommodates pedestrians as well as vehicles. The commercial parking garage on the block appears to have rebounded from the pandemic. The October community visioning workshop generated a large number of comments; a report from the workshop will be available by the end of the month. Proposed designs include those that will not require safety gates; the plans are intended to slow traffic and provide greenery and seating.
Tret Tierney	Mr. Tierney has lived on the block since December 1989. He wants to create greater safety for kids as well as elderly residents on the block. He was violently assaulted by a vehicle on the block on west 22 nd and 8 th Avenue.
Rich Saum	Mr. Saum lives on the 200 block of west 22 nd Street and is grateful to the organizers of the pedestrian street and hopes that it continues.
Paul Krikler	Mr. Krikler is a supporter of the open street. He doesn't own a car and wants his fair share of street space. Basic transportation needs are still served for those on the open street via busses, public transportation and bikes.

Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives	
New York State Assemblymember Dick Gottfried	<p>(As he is our outgoing Assemblymember, retiring at the end of this month after serving for 52 years (!!!), MCB4 members applauded and gave him a virtual standing ovation at his introduction.)</p> <p>Board 4 is unbelievably amazing! It has a group of people who are smart, hard-working, and dedicated to pursuing the best interests of the community. Community Board 4 has been unusually effective at wrestling with developers and keeping the district livable. I am proud that I hired Jeffrey LeFrancois years ago and brought him to this district.</p> <p>I am very confident in my successor to the Assembly, Tony Simone, whom I have known for many years. When he takes office in January, Tony can be reached at simonet@nyassembly.gov and at (212) 807-7900. Tony will be a strong and effective ally for MCB4.</p> <p>Again, MCB4 has done an amazing job of educating and informing all of the elected officials about the needs and concerns of its constituents. Keep at it! Thank you very much! (Many tributes to Dick from MCB4 members followed his remarks, all acknowledging the skillful efforts he put in to advocate for our neighborhoods in the last 52 years.)</p>
Olivia Glen-Rayner from Congressman Nadler's Office	<p><u>Helicopters</u>: Rep. Nadler submitted public comment in late November opposing a new FAA/NPS proposed voluntary agreement that would increase tourism helicopter traffic over Manhattan. Rep. Nadler is circulating a multi-Member letter on the issue currently. Our office is also trying to move legislation through the House to restrict non-essential helicopters over NYC. Finally, we are working on a letter to Mayor Adams requesting that his administration end concession contracts for tourist and commuter helicopters at city owned heliports.</p> <p><u>Student loans</u>: The Biden Administration has extended the pause on federal student loan payments again. As of now, the payment pause will expire on June 30 of 2023.</p>

	<p><u>Things to celebrate:</u> We are thrilled that Senator Warnock won reelection last night. This is a huge win for Democrats as it makes confirming judges much easier (and quicker) among other benefits. Another thing to celebrate is that the Respect for Marriage Act which Rep. Nadler has been working on for almost 15 years passed the Senate! It is being sent back to the House where it will pass and then on to President Biden to sign.</p>
Deputy Manhattan Borough President Keisha Sutton-James, from MBP Mark Levine's Office	<p>First, we want to lift up Dick Gottfried, and acknowledge his tremendous service and work over the many years, and thank him again.</p> <p>The Executive Order allowing public meetings to meet remotely has been extended through Dec. 20. We will continue to keep everyone updated to allow for seamless meetings.</p> <p>We would like to lift up the Manhattan Borough President's Training Series, which occurred the week of Nov. 14. Both Community Board members and community members were invited to participate, and there will be another round in the spring. These trainings are a great resource to learn about how to be more engaged with our city.</p> <p>Applications to serve on Community Boards will be opened later this week, so look out for information coming to you in just a few days about how to apply. Also, capital funding applications will also be released shortly. Our Budget Office hosted two webinars last week on the process of applying for capital funding and you should be able to find the webinars on our YouTube channel.</p> <p>We would like to remind everyone to get their COVID booster shots and their flu vaccines. Appointments are readily available. You can look online or go to your local pharmacy.</p>
Erik Bottcher, City Councilmember	<p>I am very excited about MCB4's Housing Plan. MCB4 is a willing and sophisticated partner on housing issues. The future of NYC depends on us implementing MCB4's Housing Plan and creating the affordable housing that we so desperately need. I want to thank MCB4 for being a leader on this issue.</p> <p>The Watson Hotel has recently been turned into a HERC – Humanitarian Emergency Relief Center – for newly arrived asylum seekers. Health and Hospitals is the operator. We are working with them to help address any issues that arise to make sure they have everything they need.</p> <p>On West 17th street, there is an abandoned shuttered building that is the property of the Dept. of Sanitation. It is a historic site as it is the site of the Former Colored School No. 4. We want it to be landmarked, and in the meantime we want to make sure that the physical structure doesn't deteriorate any further. We are working with MCB4 and local block associations on this issue.</p> <p>I passed two pieces of legislation recently. The first is part of the rat action plan, and it requires developers to hire a pest control specialist before obtaining building permits. My 2nd bill is an issue that is close to my heart – it addresses suicide prevention among young people. The bill requires the Dept. of Education to distribute to students information about the new 988 Suicide and Crisis Lifeline and related supports.</p> <p>My office has announced a new initiative to combat graffiti vandalism. We've allocated \$30,000 and are teaming with WildCat, and will be focusing first in Hell's Kitchen to remove graffiti vandalism there. We are also offering this service to private businesses so if there are any businesses that would like help to remove graffiti, please contact our office.</p> <p>Next week we will be planting the first of 1,000 street trees in the district. Please send addresses where you would like trees planted.</p>

Board Reports & Business

Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	<p>Agenda Item 9 was been sent back to committee and Item 14 was withdrawn, with an agreement from the applicant to go back to committee. The Agenda as amended was adopted unanimously. The November Full Board Minutes were adopted unanimously.</p>
--------------------------------	--

Executive Officers Election	<p>MCB4 executive officer elections were held. Electronic ballots were sent to all Board members. The following were elected:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jeffrey LeFrancois for Chair • Jessica Chait for First Vice Chair • Leslie Boghosian-Murphy for Second Vice Chair • Roberta Barnett and Katy Stokes for Co-Secretaries
District Manager Report	<p>The District Manager gave the following update:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-person meeting update: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Currently the City Executive Order for COVID-19 remains in effect. Per the board’s determination we will remain 100% virtual until further notice. • December Committee Schedule changes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ CLU Committee – Meeting on Wednesday, December 14th at 6:30pm due to schedule conflicts. ○ EXEC Committee – Tentatively rescheduled for Tuesday, December 27th at 6:30pm due to Christmas Holiday observed on Monday, the 26th. ○ All other Committees meet at their regularly scheduled time.
Chair’s Report	<p>The Chair gave the following updates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Chair acknowledged and expressed alarm at men being targeted at gay bars in the neighborhood; 2 have died and had their bank accounts drained. These crimes are being investigated by the District Attorney and NYPD. • Neckdowns that the Board advocated for, which provide additional space for pedestrians to step off of the curb, have been installed at four intersections during the past couple of weeks. • Small Meetings and Upcoming Events: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Board held a successful coat & diaper drive in November and has plans to do a similar drive for the single adult population in the shelters in the district. ○ CLU & Housing, Health & Human Services Committee (HHHS) met with New York Empire State Development (ESD) re: Upcoming RFP for the Bay View building at 550 West 20th Street – Coming to both committees this month ○ HHHS Meeting with all elected representatives and City Hall to present the MCB4 Affordable Housing Plan. ○ HHHS and MCB4 Staff went on a tour of the Watson Hotel, which now houses 700-800 asylum seekers. The facility is being managed well relative to others in the district. ○ Clinton Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee (CHKLU) continues to work with the Historic District Council on the upcoming Hell’s Kitchen Historic District Brochure, maintaining awareness of the desire for a historic district. • Ongoing Working Groups: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ NYU Capstone Project is continuing; provided tours of district to participants ○ Cannabis Working Group – Met with Senator Brad Hoylman’s Office regarding state legislation on illegal cannabis and will be

	<p>attending the December 13 Town Hall on Cannabis hosted by Councilmember Gale Brewer and Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Penn Station Area Civic and Land Use Project Working Group-Public Realm Task Force held its second meeting. The State has committed funding for public realm improvements. ○ Port Authority Bus Terminal Replacement Working Group-awaiting opportunity to walk neighborhood with the group
--	--

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Business License & Permits Committee (BLP)		
Item 01: Letter to SLA re 258 W 15th Street - Gadfly Lounge LLC.		Passed Unanimously
Item 02: Letter to SLA re 344 W 52nd Street - Via Toscana LLC - RATIFICATION		Ratified Unanimously
Item 03: Letter to SLA re 650 9th Avenue, South Retail - Master Tokyo Ramen Inc		Passed Unanimously
Item 04: Letter to SLA re 683 9th Avenue – Topsy Shanghai 683 Inc		Passed Unanimously
Item 05: Letter to SLA re 320 W 37th Street, 2nd Floor - Emmanuel Pierre-Antoine Dance Studio LLC		Passed Unanimously
Waterfront, Parks & Environment Committee (WPE)		
Item 06: Letter to New York Outrigger in support of community programs		Passed with 35 in Favor, 1 Present Not Eligible
Transportation Planning Committee (TRANS)		
Item 07: Letter to DOT re 10th Avenue Bike Lane Design	Friendly amendments accepted	Passed Unanimously
Item 08: Letter to ConEd re EV Chargers		Sent to Exec Committee for joint letter with WPE

Housing, Health & Human Services Committee (HHHS)		
Item 09: Letter to HPD re Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Application—495 11th Avenue (Slaughterhouse)		Sent back to committee per applicant’s request
Item 10: Letter of support to Housing Conservation Coordinators re Funding		Passed with 33 In Favor, 3 Present Not Eligible
Item 11: Letter to Mayor’s Office, DHS & Electeds re Watson Hotel & Community notice for new facilities	Friendly amendments accepted	Passed with 31 In Favor, 2 Opposed, 2 Abstentions, 1 Present Not Eligible
Item 12: Letter to DHS and Westhab re West 41 Street Family with Children Shelter and Forming a Community Advisory Committee		Passed Unanimously
Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU)		
Item 13: Letter to CPC re Land Use Application for 260 11th Avenue for a zoning text amendment		Passed Unanimously
New Business		
Item 14: CLU Letter to LPC re 458 West 20th Street		Sent back to committee
Meeting Resolution		
Adjournment	Meeting was adjourned at 9:41pm	
Next Meeting Date and Location	6:30pm on Wednesday, January 4, 2023 Virtual Meeting	

As recorded by Blake Kurisu and Katy Stokes

VOTING KEY															
Y=Yes															
N=No															
A=Abstain															
PNE=Present, not eligible															
A'-- = No vote ATTENDANCE KEY															
P=Present (IP v. V)															
Ab=Absent															
E=Excused															
	IP#	ATTENDANCE													
	V#	1. Letter to SLA re 258 W. 15th Street - Gadfly Lounge LLC	2. Letter to SLA re 344 W. 52nd Street - Via Toscana LLC - Ratification	3. Letter to SLA re 650 9th Avenue, South Retail - Master Tokyo Ramen Inc.	4. Letter to SLA re 683 9th Avenue - Topsy Shanghai 683 Inc.	5. Letter to SLA re 320 W. 37th Street, 2nd Floor - Emmanuel Pire-Antoine Dance Studio LLC	6. Letter to New York Outrigger in support of community programs	7. Letter to DOT re 10th Avenue Bike Lane Design	8. Letter to SLA re ConEd re EV Chargers - Sent to Exec Committee for joint letter with WPE	9. Letter to SLA re HPD re Mandatory Inclusionary Housing Application - 495 11th Avenue (Slaughterhouse) - Sent Back to Committee per Applicant's Request	10. Letter of Support to Housing Conservation Coordinators re Funding	11. Letter to Mayor's Office, DHS & Electeds re Watson Hotel & Community notice for new facilities	12. Letter to DHS and Westhab re West 41 Street Family with Children Shelter and Forming a Community Advisory Committee	13. Letter to CPC re Land Use Application for 260 11th Avenue for a zoning text amendment	14. CLU Letter to LPC re 458 West 20th Street - Withdrawn
P / Y	39	36	36	36	36	36	36	36	0	0	33	31	36	36	0
Ab / N	10	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0
E / A	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0
PNE	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	3	1	0	0	0	0
A'--	0	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	0	0	3	3	3	3	0
Theodore Arenas	A														
Roberta Barnett	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Christine Berthet	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Gwen Billig	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Leslie Boghosian Murphy	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Viren Brahmabhatt	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Jessica Chait	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Dale Corvino	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	N	Y	Y	
Aurora P. Cruz	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			PNE	Y	Y	Y	
Maarten de Kadt	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Paul Devlin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Pete Diaz	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Tina DiFelicianantonio	P	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--			A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	
Tina Nelson	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	PNE	Y	Y	
Wendy Gonzalez	A														
Matt Green	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Jesse Greenwald	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Candice Hewitt	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
David Holowka	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Frank Holozubiec	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Josephine Ishman	A														
Yadira Jimenez	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Kerry Keenan	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Lowell Kern	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	PNE			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Blake Kurisu	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Burt Lazarin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Christopher LeBron	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Jeffrey LeFrancois	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			PNE	Y	Y	Y	
Betty Mackintosh	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Sarah Mills	P	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--			A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	
Michael Noble	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
J.D. Noland	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Maria Ortiz	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Allen Oster	A														
Brad Pascarella	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Joe Restuccia	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			PNE	Y	Y	Y	
Sabrina Reveron	A														
Delores Rubin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
David Solnick	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Katy Stokes	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Charles Todd	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Kit Tollerson	A														
Hector Vazquez	A														
Mrinal Vikram	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	N	Y	Y	
James Wallace	A														
David Warren	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y	
Leslie Williams	A														
Carl Wilson	A														
Alice Wong	P	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--			A'--	A'--	A'--	A'--	

DEFERRED BACK TO COMMITTEE

DEFERRED BACK TO COMMITTEE

WITHDRAWN WITHDRAWN WITHDRAWN