



CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY
BOARD No. 4
424 West 33rd Street, Suite 580
New York, NY 10001
tel: 212-736-4536
www.nyc.gov/MCB4

Jeffrey LeFrancois
Chair

Jesse R. Bodine
District Manager

January 2023 Full Board Minutes

Meeting Date /	The Manhattan Community Board 4 (MCB4) Full Board met at 6:30pm on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, in a fully virtual meeting format. The meeting was accessible via Zoom webinar and live streamed on YouTube. It can be viewed at: MCB4 January 2023 Full Board Mtg
Location	

Agency Update: Department of Parks and Recreation Trial Dog Run at Penn South Playground at West 25 Street (8/9 Aves)

Terese Flores from the NYC Parks Department presented.

The Parks Department created a dog run, on a trial basis, at Penn South in April, 2022. This trial was in response to a temporary closure of the nearby Chelsea Waterfront Dog Run and a closure at Dewitt Clinton for resurfacing. Since the Penn South dog run opened, we've received numerous complaints regarding the location due to disruptive noise levels that are impacting nearby residents.

We understand that there's a resolution being voted on today with regard to the Penn South dog run, and we look forward to hearing the results of that vote and reviewing the resolution with you.

Should this board vote to support the closure of the Penn South dog run, we will welcome input as to other options. For example, someone suggested that Chelsea Park handball courts be turned into a dog run. This site has been identified as an underutilized space and we think it's a location that would mitigate some of the concerns regarding noise levels in residential areas and we'd like to explore the possibility of converting a portion of the handball court into a dog run. We value the thoughts and the input in this process, and we hope to explore this idea and other ideas about the sites such as pickleball courts, for a potential win-win solution that can be discussed at the next CB4 Parks Committee Meeting, which is on January 12th.

Ultimately, the Parks Department wants to be responsive to the needs and concerns of the community, and we want to both actively listen to these concerns and be proactive about identifying potential solutions.

Presentation and Public Hearing: NYS Upcoming Request for Proposal for the Bayview Building at 550 West 20th Street

CLU/HHHS Committee Co-Chairs Joe Restuccia (HHHS) and Jessica Chait (CLU) opened a public hearing regarding the Bayview Building at 550 W20th St. Joe presented a detailed powerpoint presentation. See attached.

The 3 key components of the proposal for the Bayview Building are as follows:

1. Affordable Housing
 - a. 115 units of permanently affordable housing
 - b. 30 beds for psychiatric residential housing

- c. No market-rate units at the site
- 2. Community Center
 - a. Swimming pool, basketball courts, etc., for people to use who live in the neighborhood
- 3. Historic preservation of the key components of the building

In January, both Chelsea Land Use and HHHS committees will have more public discussions about this proposal, and then the Board will work in February with its local elected officials to discuss the terms for the RFP for this site.

Public Hearing Speakers	
Marilyn Rivera	Ms. Rivera spoke in favor of the proposal. It will be really great for the youth to have a community center.
Miguel Acevedo	Mr. Acevedo spoke in favor of the proposal. He pointed out that there is no gym or community space at Fulton House, so the community center at Bayview Chelsea would be a great thing for Fulton House residents. He also suggested that work-force development could happen in the industrial kitchen.
David Holowka	Mr. Holowka spoke as a representative of Save Chelsea. He asked that the terra cotta be preserved as part of the historic preservation.
Pamela Wolff	Ms. Wolff is very supportive of the Bayview Chelsea project. She suggested that MCB4 do more to publicize the opportunities for public input on this project.
Public Session Speakers	
Shelli Rosen	Ms Rosen said that the Board should not approve the letter written by WPE, which she believes was written in bad faith and does not represent the views of the community. She said that elderly and disabled residents need the dog park to remain at Penn South as they are unable to walk to the dog runs at Waterside Park and Madison Square Park. Ms Rosen also criticized the WPE for not acknowledging the sheer number of supporters of the dog park at Penn South.
Rosalie Regal	Ms. Regal is a resident of Penn South and she overlooks the dog run. She said that the noise from the dog park is horrendous and that it was a ludicrous idea to create a dog run in the middle of Penn South. She said that she is not able to read or write given how horrible the noise is from the dog park, and that she wants it gone as soon as possible. She is glad that WPE recommends closing the dog park.
Susan Walitt	Ms. Walitt is a resident of Penn South who faces the dog park, and she thanks the WPE Committee for voting to recommend closing the dog park and for supporting efforts to find an alternative location for the dog run. Please approve the committee's draft letter recommending the dog park be closed now and find a more appropriate nearby location that is not in the middle of a residential complex.
Deborah Ramer	Ms. Ramer lives in Penn South facing the dog park. She said that she represents over 100 Penn South residents and all the nuns of Saint Columbus. Ms. Ramer said that she and the people she represents are directly impacted by the noise of the dog run and want the Penn South dog park closed as promised now that the Chelsea Waterpark site has reopened. She has gathered over one hundred signatures on a petition to close the dog park, and her petition is verifiable according to WPE guidelines and includes names addresses and signatures of Penn South residents. The people who signed the petition told her about the loud barking which awakened them every morning, of not being able to work or concentrate at home because of the noise, and of being deprived of the peaceful enjoyment of their homes. So many of our residents are elderly and have no idea who to complain to or how to complain. She also said that many of the elderly residents who have dogs don't

	use the dog park as they're afraid of being knocked over or having their dogs trampled by the other dogs that are wildly running around.
Rita Mullaney	Ms. Mullaney fully supported this dog run when it was presented as a temporary solution until the other dog run was completed. As a resident of Penn South who faces this park, her quality of life has been negatively impacted daily. This location is not situated where barking from dogs can dissipate. It is nestled between two buildings and the noise has nowhere to go but up. Please consider who is complaining and where we live. We are not anti-dog people; I support dog runs, but not in the backyards of our homes. We live here; we're not asking for anything more than what we all want and deserve in our homes, and that is a peaceful place to live, which we do not have anymore.
Margaret Kelly	Ms. Kelly started by saying that the presentation on Bayview at the beginning of the meeting was great. Ms. Kelly also lives in Penn South, and she supports the WPE letter recommending the closure of the dog run. She said that the barking often goes on incessantly, which really affects our quality of life. We also have a power station here and no one has mentioned that we listen to the power station all summer long. Between the barking and the power station, the noise is horrific
Inge Ivchenko	Ms. Ivchenko asked that the Board advocate for the removal of the barricades on 22nd Street between 7th and 8 th avenues until a study has been done by DOT. Not for the first time, fire engines had a problem getting through last weekend. The firefighters had to jump out of the truck, throw the barricades through the air onto the sidewalk, and then jump back on the truck. The truck still had a hard time coming around the planters that have been placed on the corners. The fire truck barely fit through. Also, there are people that have been trying to join the Block Association since 2019 and their applications haven't been entertained.
Tom Lunke	Mr. Lunke thanked CB4, especially the Transportation Planning Committee, for its support of the West 22 nd Open Street Community Visioning Workshop and final report. Mr. Lunke said that the findings and suggestions have expanded the discussion on how to remake our public streets into relaxing and experiential open space. The more streets we have dedicated to neighborhood strolling and socializing, the stronger our local health and economy will be. Thank you to Councilman Eric Botcher, Jordan Feiner, and the fire, police, sanitation and delivery workers for continuing to support our efforts. Finally, a special thank you to all the participants and volunteers of the workshop, whose input helped shape our 114 page Visionary Report.
Bobby Vangelatos	Mr. Vangelatos is Center Manager at the Chelsea Recreation Center. He announced three events this month that will be free and open to the public. The first one is this Sunday, January 8th from 3 to 5 p.m. We're hosting a clinic led by the New York Knicks staff, with an appearance from a special guest. This Knicks event is open for youth ages 7 to 17, and they will have the chance to work on drills and learn different fundamentals of basketball. The other two events are for adults. On Friday, January 13th from 5:30 to 7:30 p.m, we will be hosting a glow-in-the-dark pickleball event. Pickleball is fun all the time, but it's even better when it's under the lights and in neon colors! On the same theme, on Friday January 27th from 6 to 7:30 pm, we're going to have a glow-in-the-dark fitness circuit event. We're going to do circuit training at various fitness stations and then a spin bike session as well.
Steven Baum	Mr. Baum works for the Parks Department and lives at Penn South. He said that the noise from the dog run is unescapable, and that it is similar to "death by a thousand paper cuts ." He also said that the dog run is very different from the dog runs located in parks and overseen by the Parks Department as it has no water and no irrigation. He also pointed out that only a handful of dog runs managed by the Parks Department are concrete like the one at Penn South.
Molly Harris	Ms. Harris wants the "Open Streets" barricades removed on West 22nd Street. She thanked MCB4 for addressing the Urgent concerns of 250 of her neighbors, who signed a

	petition asking for the barriers to be taken away and equal access to the street be returned. Ms Harris supports a compromise of limited hours when the barricades would go up to create a more limited “Open Street.”
Aaron Schwartz	Mr. Schwartz is an architect and urban designer who has lived on 22nd Street for over 30 years. He opposes the current barricade system on 22 nd Street. Instead, he supports research that could identify a shared-street program that benefits the entire neighborhood, not just a single block. He thinks that a holistic, community-analysis should be designed by professionals who know about the best interests of sharing streets between pedestrians and vehicles. He also believes that the barriers should be removed immediately.
Pamela Wolff	Ms. Wolff said that the Chelsea West 200 Block Association has been in existence since 1976. It had its ups and downs, but it has survived through all of that with a very healthy list of members. Ms. Wolff reaches out frequently to the members to share information and tell them about events in the community. Ms. Wolff also said that she agrees with the suggestion that there should be a comprehensive study done of the vehicular, pedestrian and safety needs connected with the Open Street on West 22 nd St.
Melodie Bryant	It's been a really exciting time for public space in Chelsea and it's been great to coalesce with the community on a project that speaks to the future of the city as a whole. We look forward to working with the D.O.T on funding for programming and implementation of options A and B that came out of the report from our October Community Visioning Workshop. These alternatives offer both traffic calming, more greenery and obviate the need for barricades on our Open Street, and so these are redesigns that our Workshop showed will be welcomed by the community at large. We're energized to take this promising vision forward. I'd like to thank our dedicated volunteers on the ground and thanks also to Checkpeds, our sponsors and retailers, and especially for the support of MCB4.
Barak Friedman	Mr. Friedman is a huge supporter of the 22nd Street Open Street. He supports the redesign, and more greenery, and the slow speeds. He has heard people say that the Open Street design is dangerous, but he doesn't think there is data to support that claim. He would like to see the data if it exists.
Miriam Fisher	Ms. Fisher asked about following up on traffic safety issues raised in a letter by CB4 to DOT in March about traffic lights on 8th and 9th Avenues. The heads of the Transportation Committee indicated that they would follow up by email and at the next committee meeting.
Andrew Hyatt	Mr. Hyatt supports exploring new alternatives for the Open Street on West 22 nd Street. He hopes that rethinking the design can happen quickly, without excessive analysis. He said that the sidewalks of Chelsea are some of the worst to walk on in general, and that Chelsea needs to do a better job of rethinking the streets.
Dylan Kennedy	Mr. Kennedy works near West 22 nd Street and he likes having the Open Street. He supports options A and B from the Community Visioning Workshop.
Marilyn Rivera	Ms. Rivera lives at Penn South and she opposes the dog run. She said that the noise at the dog run is horrific, and that she is grateful to MCB4 for listening to everyone's concerns.
Albert Taylor	Mr. Taylor is a 43-year resident of West 20th Street. He opposes the Open Street on West 22 nd Street as currently configured. He noted that with West 22 nd Street barricaded, there are only two eastbound streets between 14th Street and 26th Street that are not restricted, so the traffic that would have gone across 22 nd Street gets pushed to 20 th Street, which isn't fair to 20 th street residents. Mr. Taylor supports MCB4's draft letter (item 14) about the Open Street, but requests that MCB4 consider amending the paragraph at lines 36 and 37, to request that a solution that is not only “equitable” for all street users, but also

	equitable for the residents of the neighboring streets who are threatened with increased traffic.
Lydia Andre	Ms. Andre lives on West 20 th Street and she opposes the Open Street on West 22 nd Street. She says that her block on West 20 th Street now has far more traffic than before West 20 th Street was barricaded for its Open Street. She believes West 22 nd Street shouldn't be barricaded to traffic until there is much more research and data about the impact of such closure on surrounding streets.
Richard Marans	Mr. Marans is part of the Block Association of 47 th /48 th Streets, and is alarmed by the number of people who ride bikes on sidewalks. His Block Association is working with other Block Associations to try to mobilize about this safety issue, and will work closely with the Transportation Committee to seek a resolution to this dangerous practice.
Jim Burke	Mr. Burke said that he loves the Open Street on West 22 nd Street, and he thinks that there should probably be more Open Streets. He is also grateful for the volunteers who have made this a reality.
Joe Neuhaus	Mr. Neuhaus thanked the Transportation Planning Committee for its thoughtful attempt to address an interim solution concerning the Open Street on West 22 nd Street. As for the letter to the DOT, the letter endorses choosing West 22 nd Street as a street to run this experiment, and that seems to me to be premature. I urge the community board to take a more neutral stance with respect to the choice of a block to choose. He agrees with the previous remarks by the two residents of 20 th Street about the unfair traffic increase on nearby streets.
Lisa Wager	Ms. Wager is Director of Government and Community Relations at the Fashion Institute of Technology (FIT). She was home sick, but didn't want to miss a meeting. She promises to be back next month to provide updates on FIT.
Lyudmyla Sossa	Ms. Sossa lives at Penn South facing the dog run on 25 th Street and opposes the dog run. She thanked the WPE Committee and NYC Parks Department for hearing the concerns of the residents and recommending the closure of the dog run. She said that the incessant barking and fighting among the dogs greatly impacts the quality of life for nearby residents.
Elizabeth VanDyke	Ms. Van Dyke is the Producing Artistic Director of New Federal Theater (NFT). We reside at 543 West 42 nd Street, where we produce plays and have been doing so for over 53 years. Our space is up for sale and in negotiation. So we are in need of a performing arts space and theater offices. Tonight, you will be voting on a letter drafted by the ACES committee, and I am just humbly asking you to support us in our effort. Art is vital. Art is healing. Thank you for your help.

Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives	
Senator Brad Hoylman	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Senator has returned to Albany for the 2023 session. The Senate elected leadership. • Bayview- Elected officials have been fighting for a supportive housing project at the Bayview site alongside the community. The Senator thanks the board for endorsing supportive housing on the site and looks forward to working with Assembly

	<p>Member Tony Simone and Congressman Jerry Nadler as well as the community to make the project a reality.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Affordable Housing Plan- The Senator applauds Community Board 4's housing plan and looks forward to bringing those plans to life. ● Legislation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Stop the Chop Bill was vetoed by the Governor due to concerns about pre-emption. The Senator will work to redouble efforts to limit chopper flights over Manhattan and close the 30th Street Heliport. ○ The Governor signed the Senator's bills mandating insurance cover PREP and PEP (anti-HIV drugs) ○ The Governor signed legislation banning PFAS from Teflon in apparel ○ The Governor signed legislation mandating that residential leases provide flood insurance information ○ Senator is still awaiting Governor's action on the Grieving Families Act, which would expand the current limits on penalties that can be obtained in wrongful death suits. ● The Senate Judiciary (chaired by the Senator) committee is conducting a hearing to select the next Chief Judge of New York State. Governor Hochul nominated Justice LaSalle on December 22, and the Senate has 30 days to act on the nomination. ● Criminal Justice- Midtown Community Court- Senator and colleagues convened a meeting to develop a reopening schedule. Senator was also pleased to stand with District Attorney Alvin Bragg as he announced \$9 million toward mental health and substance abuse. ● Cannabis- There is a new legal marijuana dispensary just outside of Community District 4 on 8th Street and Broadway. The Senator is working with the Office of Cannabis Management and Senator Krueger legislatively to address the issues with illegal dispensaries. ● The Senator is sponsoring a virtual event on January 12 6-7:30PM on RSV
Council Member Gale Brewer	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Managed Care vs Senior Care- There is a proposal from Mayor Adams to change the healthcare benefits of the 250,000 seniors who are retired City public servants. Council will take up the matter at a hearing on January 9 at 10AM. The Council Member does not support changing healthcare for retirees. There may be a compromise to be made with the Mayor between his proposal and the current healthcare plan. ● 59th Street Shelter- There is a new site proposed as a homeless shelter on 59th Street (technically in Community District 7), but it is near CD4. The site as proposed would be managed by Project Renewal and serve 200 women. The Council Member urged the City to consider permanent housing (with 60 units) over a shelter. ● Harborview- The Council Member is pushing to get 100% affordable new housing built. ● Cannabis- The Council Member's office conducted a study from 54th St to 108th St, and found 61 new smoke shops. At least half of them raised questions as to whether they were operating legally. The Council Member will go with the Sheriff tomorrow to investigate the 26 that may be selling cannabis illegally. The Council Member is

	<p>in discussion with City and State officials to determine the best course of action with regard to regulation and enforcement.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Short-term rentals- There is a hearing coming up on short-term rentals (ie: AirBnB) requiring the owner to publicly identify themselves. The Council Member has testified on this issue before. • Catalytic converter thefts- Following an increase in catalytic converter thefts, the Council Member passed a bill requiring vehicle sales to have a VIN number and a copy of the vehicle title when they sell vehicles. • Helicopters- there may be limited legislative possibilities to limit flights over Manhattan absent federal legislation. However, the Council Member is looking at local legislation to prevent flights originating in Manhattan. • School buses- the Council Member is investigating school bus contracts in the Oversight Committee to see which operator is best getting kids to school on-time and reduces latenesses. • Food Sourcing- The Council Member is working in partnership with Council Member Bottcher to increase the amount of food the City is sourcing from local sources. • The Council Member noted the following upcoming events: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ There will be some participatory budgeting items in MCB4 ○ There will be a Local Law 97 Workshop in March ○ There will be a recurring Housing Clinic with Goddard Riverside and Housing Conservation Coordinators this month
Dana Schmerzler, Office of Senator Liz Krueger	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Senator Liz Krueger now represents a portion of Community District 4. Dana Schmerzler will serve as the liaison between CB4 and the Senator's office.
Donna Shashoua, Office of Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assemblymember Rosenthal has been appointed as chair of the Housing Committee and looks forward to working with MCB4 on housing issues • SNAP benefits skimming- the Assemblymember wrote a letter to OTDA about issues with stolen SNAP benefits, requesting that they enhance security on their cards. Due to federal law, localities are unable to replace stolen funds at this time. The Assemblymember also wrote to the Mayor's Office with concerns over reports that HRA is only processing 40% of SNAP applications due to staffing shortages. • Puppy Mills- The Assemblymember's Puppy Mill Bill was signed into law, prohibiting pet stores from selling dogs, cats, and rabbits from breeders and encouraging them to partner with rescues. • Save the date for the homeowner benefit clinic with the Department of Finance for February 10, 2023 10AM-2PM. • The Assemblymember has masks and COVID tests available at 230 W72nd St
Yiyi Wang, Office of the Manhattan Borough President Mark Levine	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Borough President would like to congratulate MCB4 on the release of its affordable housing plan and thank the MCB4 Sanitation Working Group for presenting at the December Borough Board meeting.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community Board applications are now open. The application deadline is March 17. Those board members who are up for re-appointment will receive a notice from Yiyi Wang. • State of the Borough will take place on January 31, 2023 at City College. Doors open at 5PM and the program will begin at 6PM. All are welcome. • The borough president would like to remind the public to get their COVID boosters and flu vaccines.
--	--

Board Reports & Business	
Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	The Agenda as amended was adopted unanimously. The December 2022 Full Board Minutes were adopted unanimously.
District Manager Report	<p>The District Manager gave the following update:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · In-person meeting update: Currently the City E.O. for COVID-19 remains in effect. Per the board's determination we will remain 100% virtual until further notice. · MCB4 Staff attended the following meetings on behalf of MCB4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site visit to Clean Curb Pilot Project on West 45 Street ○ Community meeting with Project Renewal ○ Virtual clothing and needed items drive for adult men and women living in shelter. On our website. · January Committee Schedule changes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ CLU Committee – Meeting on Tuesday, January 17th at 6:30pm due to MLK Holiday. <p>All other Committees will meet at their regularly scheduled time.</p>
Chair's Report	<p>The Chair gave the following updates:</p> <p>MCB4 held Press Conference to highlight the re-release of the MCB4 Affordable Housing Plan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · CLU & HHHS members took a tour of the Bayview building at 550 West 20th Street · CLU members along with CM Bottcher's Office and DSNY took a tour of the 128 West 17th Street, Former Colored School #4. · HHHS members attended a follow up tour of Watson Hotel which now houses 700-800 Asylum Seekers. · CHKLU continues to work with Historic District Council on the upcoming Hell's Kitchen Historic District Brochure. · Ongoing\Upcoming Working Group: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ NYU Capstone Project ○ Cannabis Working Group ○ Penn Station Area Civic and Land Use Project Working Group <p>Port Authority Bus Terminal Replacement Working Group</p>

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Business License & Permits Committee (BLP)		
Item 01: Letter to SLA re 25 11th Avenue, Market 57, Kiosk 11 – Nom Wah Delancey Corp.	44 (Y)	Approved
Item 02: Letter to SLA re 329 W 49th Street - Midtown Barking Dog LLC.	44 (Y)	Approved
Item 03: Letter to SLA re 485 10th Avenue – T&P 10th Avenue Host LLC.	44 (Y)	Approved
Item 04: Letter to SLA re 506 W 28th Street - Sogno 85th Chelsea LLC.	44 (Y)	Approved
Item 05: Letter to SLA re 585 8th Avenue – IMDN Holdings LLC & Mianor Restaurant Group LLC	44 (Y)	Approved
Item 06: Letter to SLA re 10 Hudson Yards a/k/a 501 W 30 th Street, Unit 00RET3 – Hudson Hall & Mercado Investor LLC as Mgr.	44 (Y)	Approved
Waterfront, Parks & Environment Committee (WPE)		
Item 07: Letter to Parks re Penn South Dog Run	40 (Y) - 1 (N) - 3 (A)	Approved
Item 08: Joint WPE\TRANS Letter to ConEd re Electric Vehicle Chargers and Stations	N/A	Tabled
Arts, Culture, Education, and Street Life Committee (ACES)		
Item 09: Letter of Support to the New Federal Theatre at 543 West 42nd Street	44 (Y)	Approved
Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee (CHKLU)		
Item 10: Letter to Garment District Alliance re Residential Opportunities in the Garment District	44 (Y)	Approved
Transportation Planning Committee (TRANS)		
Item 11: Letter to MTA re 28 th Street Substation Project Construction Update	43 (Y) - 1 (N)	Approved
Item 12: Letter to DOT re: Open Street Applications for Hudson Blvd East and West	43 (Y) - 0 (N) - 1 (A)	Approved
Item 13: Letter to DOT re 22 nd Street Open Street (7/8) Community Workshop Report	32 (Y) - 6 (N) - 1 (A) - 5 (PNE)	Approved
Item 14: Letter to 22 nd Street Open Street Representatives re 22 nd Street Open Street Recommendations	32 (Y) - 6 (N) - 1 (A) - 5 (PNE)	Approved
Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU)		
Item 15: Letter to LPC re 458 West 20th Street for legalization of existing window violations and proposed changes to the façade and HVAC louvers.	43 (Y) - 0 (N) - 1 (A)	Approved
New Business		
Item 16: Letter to PANYNJ re Restarting Participating Agency Community Consultations	43 (Y) - 1 (N)	Approved
Meeting Resolution		
Adjournment	Meeting was adjourned at 9:55 pm	

Next Meeting Date and Location	6:30pm on Wednesday, February 1, 2023 Virtual Meeting
--------------------------------	--

As recorded by Roberta Barnett and Katy Stokes

