



CITY OF NEW YORK  
**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY  
 BOARD No. 4**

424 West 33<sup>rd</sup> Street, Suite 580  
 New York, NY 10001  
 tel: 212-736-4536  
[www.nyc.gov/mcb4](http://www.nyc.gov/mcb4)

**Lowell D. Kern**  
 Chair

**Jesse R. Bodine**  
 District Manager

December 2021 Full Board Minutes

|  |   |
|--|---|
| <p>Meeting Date /<br/>Location</p>       | <p>The Full Board met at 6:30 pm on Wednesday, December 1, 2021, via Zoom webinar and was simultaneously live streamed on YouTube. It can be viewed here:<br/> <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=S7EAXnEPmMs">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=S7EAXnEPmMs</a></p>  |
| <p>Presentation /<br/>Public Hearing</p> | <p><b>Presentation:</b> Captain Robert Gault from the 10th Precinct (230 West 20th Street)<br/>     Captain Gault gave a status report and overview of conditions in the 10th Precinct over the past year and during the last 28-day period. He stated that, contrary to perceptions, indexed crimes are down 1% for the year. As to the past 28 days, there were 908 crimes compared to 917 during the same period last year. The main driver of that decrease was fewer burglaries and grand larcenies. There was an uptick, however, in robberies with an 8.7% increase for the year. The same is true for felony assaults with a 17% increase – 117 versus 100 last year. Another problematic area has been an increase in grand larcenies of automobiles – grand theft auto. There were 57 this year to date, compared to 44 last year, a 29.5% increase.</p> <p>The precinct analyzes crimes using a precision policing model that looks for local crime patterns. They are seeing a pattern now involving drugstore robberies where someone enters a store with the intention of clearing products off the shelves and ends up assaulting or threatening a worker or security guard with a weapon. The people who are committing these crimes are often desperate individuals suffering from drug addiction. And it is the same people who are committing these crimes over and over because they have been released by the courts without the imposition of bail.</p> <p><b>Public Hearing:</b> Penn Station Area Civic and Land Use Project</p> <p>The public hearing was held to give the community the opportunity to weigh in on Agenda Item 13 – the Board’s letter to the Empire State Development Corporation regarding the Penn Station Area General Project Plan (GPP). And because only one block in the GPP exists in MCD4, the letter deals only with matters concerning that block. The presentation given by ESD, however, covers the entire area and is the same as that which will be given to the public on December 8.</p> <p>Marion Phillips, the Senior Vice President of ESD, began the presentation by thanking the Board members who participated in the Community Advisory Council – Jeffrey LeFrancois, Lowell Kern, Christine Berthet, and Paul Devlin. He then turned the presentation over to Holly Leicht, the Executive Vice President of Real Estate Development at ESD.</p> |

Ms. Leicht gave an overview of the GPP focusing on the revisions to the original plan that were made over the Summer after consideration of the recommendations of the Community Advisory Council, elected officials, Community Board 5, stakeholders, and advocates. She stated that the revised draft GPP is based on the premise that the Penn Station reconstruction and expansion is not optional – they are necessities. Penn Station was built to serve 300 thousand daily commuters. By 2019 it was serving twice that many, and by 2038 it is projected by the railroads to be serving around 890 thousand. Ms. Leicht noted that the Penn Station area is at the heart of the central business district and that sustainable urban growth focuses density at transportation hubs. The proposed GPP is mindful of that idea because the Penn Station area is the largest transportation hub in the Northern Hemisphere.

The guiding principles of the GPP can be summarized as follows:

- Develop a comprehensive redevelopment plan to generate revenue that will help fund the reconstruction and expansion of Penn Station and other improvements.
- Support the reconstruction and expansion of Penn Station through an integrated network of transit and public realm improvements.
- Catalyze sustainable transit-oriented, mixed-use development and enhance the public realm around Penn Station.
- Foster New York City's long-term economic growth through the creation of jobs, modern office space, and new mixed-income housing.

The Penn Station Area GPP's project area stretches from 6th to 9th Avenues and from 30th to 34th Streets and contains 8 potential redevelopment sites. Three of those sites fall on the southern portion of the project area and their redevelopment is contingent on the NEPA review that the railroads are about to launch. If that area is not selected as the preferred alternative for Penn Station expansion through the NEPA process which starts next year, then there will be no redevelopment of those 3 sites.

Governor Hochul has proposed a new way forward because she believes that New Yorkers deserve a new Penn Station, and the community deserves a great neighborhood around Penn Station. So, the revised GPP will therefore focus less on the expansion and more on the reconstruction of the current Penn Station and enhancements to the surrounding neighborhood. The revised GPP is shaped by the information that was gathered during 18 Advisory Group meetings and 8 public meetings and town halls. Some of the highlights of those revisions include:

- Reduced density by 1.4 million square feet.
- Up to 1,800 residential units, 540 of which would be permanently affordable.
- About 8 acres of public space and the creation of a Public Realm Task Force and a Public Realm Fund.
- Increased public transit access.
- More space for community and innovative social services.
- More than 50,000 good-paying construction jobs.
- Greener, transit-oriented commercial growth with a requirement that all new buildings be electric.

Ms. Leicht offered the following timeline:

- December 8 – Public Hearing on Draft GPP, DEIS, and proposed revisions followed by a 30-day public comment period.
- January 10 – End of public comment period.
- Q1/Q2 2022 – ESD makes a final decision on the EIS and GPP. The Public Realm Task Force is launched if it is approved.

| Public Hearing Speakers |   |
|-------------------------|---|
| Eugene Sinigalliano     | Mr. Sinigalliano, who is a member of the Community Advisory Council, limited his comments to the area within MCD4: Block 1 which represents about 5% of the total project area. He said, the way the plan is set up now and unless things change according to the suggestions in the Board’s proposed letter, the only promise that displaced residents have for residential housing is 10 years down the road on Block 1. Only if the Board’s proposed changes to have housing built on other earlier-completed sites is accepted, will displaced residents have a place to return to before 10 years. Otherwise, he stated, they must rely on the housing slated for Block 1 – something that CB4 should take responsibility for. In that regard, he believes that the statement in the letter about residents being able to return to housing at the same affordability levels is not accurate based on conversations he has had with ESD. He wants CB4 to push for that in its letter and to include specific mention of displaced rent-stabilized residents and seniors.   |
| Pamela Wolff            | Ms. Wolff, who is a public member of CB4, read a statement on behalf of the Empire State Coalition, which is composed of 13 community and civic organizations: “The Coalition opposes the Empire Station Plan for the Penn area, including the minor variations recently proposed by Governor Hochul. The plan is unnecessarily destructive of our city’s historic fabric and eliminates a functioning valuable swath of the city. It unnecessarily demolishes peoples’ homes. unnecessarily destroys thousands of small business jobs, and foolishly builds 10 new Class A office towers -- an extension of the widely detested Hudson Yards. This bloated development plan is one that benefits only Vornado, the city’s largest real estate investment trust. This push for a developer’s fiefdom, the so called Vernado Campus, destroys a church, a beloved sky bridge, multiple landmarked hotels, and a rare remnant of the original Penn Station. It is a plan filled with displacement and destruction. Moreover, the proposed improvements to Penn Station are minor and do not need to be funded by Vornado skyscrapers. They are lipstick-on-a pig improvements and could easily be funded through other means. Ten new towers cannot be justified with any reasonable argument. Tossing in a bit of affordable housing does not improve the plan, nor does pedestrianization of a street soon to be in dark shadows. The tragedy is this: better ideas exist and are being ignored. Madison square garden could easily be moved by repurposing the billions in funding slated for an unnecessary borough jail. And converting Penn Station to allow through running is a solid proposal that would avoid most of the wanton destruction and is an idea whose time is now, not in the future. Last, an above ground station is also an idea that is easily achieved and would better serve the broad public than the attempts to make it palatable through superficial tweaks.” |
| Public Session Speakers |   |
| Bjorn Thorstad          | Mr. Thorstad is a resident of West 17th Street across from the nightclub 1Oak. He complained about the noise produced by their sound system and requested that the Board not approve any liquor license applications by 1Oak unless adequate soundproofing is installed.  |
| Ivana Cepeda            | Ms. Cepeda moved to Hell’s Kitchen from the Bronx in February, and she works in Chelsea. She commented on the rising number of thefts at business establishments in Hell’s Kitchen and noted that the Target store had to change its hours because of it. She   |

|                |  |
|----------------|--|
|                | also mentioned that aggressive panhandling is more prevalent now and that she has been personally affected by it.  |
| Caroline Wood  | Ms. Wood spoke in praise of the Open Streets program and how much it has increased the quality of life on her block of West 22nd Street with less car traffic and cleaner streets. She feels the neighborhood has also become safer and friendlier. She thanked her neighbor Melodie Bryant for her work in facilitating it.   |
| Miriam Fisher  | Ms. Fisher lamented the fact that she was not able to be heard during Captain Gault's presentation because she wished to speak about a robbery that occurred in her building. Then, as she was speaking, Captain Gault emailed a response. Ms. Fisher went on to ask the Board to be sure to follow up on its letter to the Governor about congestion pricing as it relates to people with disabilities needing an exemption from having to pay tolls.   |
| Lisa Wager     | Ms. Wager is the Director of Government and Community Relations at the Fashion Institute of Technology. She provided her customary monthly updates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• For the 20th year, an FIT faculty member, Barbara Berman, was the Macy's Thanksgiving Day Parade costume chief. She led the Parade's costume crew in assembling and dressing 600 clowns, 300 float escorts, 160 teens, 75 stilt walkers, 2000 balloon handlers, 450 officials, 100 banner carriers, and other lucky participants.</li> <li>• Virginia Bonofiglio, an assistant professor and associate chair of the Cosmetics and Fragrance Marketing Department, was inducted into the Fragrance Foundation circle of champions. The Foundation is a nonprofit devoted to expertise, innovation and education in the fragrance industry and her induction into the circle marks the first time that an educator with given this honor. And, along with the induction the Foundation announced a fragrance foundation FIT diversity scholarship, a \$100,000 academic award that will benefit undergraduate and graduate students of diverse backgrounds in the cosmetics and fragrance marketing program who are interested in pursuing a career in fragrance.</li> <li>• Ms. Wager noted what she called the "astounding work" of the FIT associate degree students in the Fashion Design program that is now on display in the lobby of the Pomerantz Building located on the North corner of 27th Street and 7th Avenue.</li> </ul> |
| Melodie Bryant | Ms. Bryant spoke in favor of the Open Street improvements on West 22nd Street outlined in the Transportation Committee draft letter. She and her neighbors have been operating West 22nd as an Open Street since May of 2020 and it has been extremely popular with residents and the neighborhood at large. In a survey taken last year, 91% of respondents approved of Open Streets, and a full 73% wanted more greenery.  |

| Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives |  |
|--|--|
| Senator Brad Hoylman                               | Senator Hoylman spoke while riding a train to Albany. He presented Chair Lowell Kern with a Proclamation signed by his colleagues in government commemorating his successful term as Chair. The Proclamation recites, among other things, the Chair's progression up the ranks of CB4, his success in transitioning to remote Board meetings, and for retaining the Board's stability during the pandemic. The Proclamation also recites other Board accomplishments during his term, such as improvements to parks, the creation of affordable housing, and the Board's participation in the discussions about the Port Authority Bus Terminal, Penn Station, and the rehabilitation of the Elliott-Chelsea and |

|   |   |
|---|---|
|   | <p>Fulton Houses. It notes his creation of the Social and Racial Justice Task Force and his being appointed to the Board of Directors of the Hudson River Park Trust. The Proclamation declares Wednesday, December 1st to be Lowell Kern Appreciation Day in New York State's 27th Senate District, New York State's 67th and 75th Assembly Districts, the Borough of Manhattan, and New York City's Third Council District.</p>   |
| <p>Assemblymember<br/>Linda Rosenthal</p> | <p>Ms. Rosenthal thanked Chair Kern for his extraordinary service and steering the ship during one of the most tumultuous times in our history. She went on to give the following updates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• She did a walkthrough around West 42nd and 11th Avenue with Christine Berthet of the CB4 Transportation Committee and the DOT Borough Commissioner and other staff to discuss bus traffic concerns in that area. It's well known that the intersection is a mess and on that day cars and trucks were in the bike lane, vehicles were blocking the box and cutting off pedestrians and forcing them to walk in between cars. Ms. Rosenthal and Ms. Berthet came up with some solutions that were memorialized in a letter to DOT.</li> <li>• In older transportation news, the West 57th and Eighth intersection was finally redesigned. Ms. Rosenthal had been working with CB4 on this for years and years to change the flow of traffic in that area. The intersection was one of the most dangerous and DOT finally implemented the changes right before the pandemic.</li> <li>• A building in the district had an open facade violation for close to five years. The tenants were reporting that the landlord failed to make repairs. Ms. Rosenthal wrote to DOB requesting an inspection and a plan of action to compel the landlord to resolve this complaint. As a result, the DOB made the inspection, and an emergency work order was placed on the building. And because the building is at risk of collapsing due to the landlord's neglect, the tenants were issued a vacate order and will be forced to move out over the course of the year. Ms. Rosenthal is awaiting an audit report from the DOB on scaffolding throughout the City.</li> <li>• DOT finally removed the Donald Trump sign from the West Side Highway at 79th Street after a monthslong request to the Commissioner to do so.</li> <li>• In response to constituents' concerns, Ms. Rosenthal wrote to the new Chair of the USPS asking that Postmaster General DeJoy be replaced.</li> <li>• The bill that Ms. Rosenthal and Senator Hoylman sponsored banning the sale and possession of ghost guns was signed into law this month.</li> <li>• After 13 years of Ms. Rosenthal carrying the bill, the Employer Privacy Law was signed into law. That means that employers must inform new employees upon hiring that all internet-related devices are their property, not the employees and that they can monitor an employee's activity at will. The issue became resonant during the pandemic when everyone was sitting at home on Zoom and being monitored by an employer. The bill levels the playing field in a way to protect both employees and employers.</li> <li>• After Ms. Rosenthal heard from a constituent that they were unable to get copies of utility bills to show proof of legal tenancy, Ms. Rosenthal got a bill passed that requires telephone companies, cable providers, and utilities to furnish copies of bills free to poor people.</li> </ul> |
| <p>Councilmember<br/>Helen Rosenthal</p>  | <p>Ms. Rosenthal congratulated Chair Kern for "his wonderful tenure." She then announced that the meeting would be her last as a City Council representative for part of the district. She thanked everyone for giving her the opportunity to serve them and called out some</p>  |

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  | <p>members for educating her about the issues that are most important to the district, specifically, land use and NYCHA.</p> <p>Ms. Rosenthal said she appreciated everyone who shared their thoughts on two positions that she took that became somewhat controversial: the desegregation plan in the rezoning of the district north of MCD4 that resulted in the desegregation of 3 schools, and support for the homeless who were staying at the Lucerne Hotel during the pandemic. She proceeded to mention that, in 2019, she was identified as the No.1 Legislator by City &amp; State Magazine for having passed lots of bills and helping lots of people. More information about Ms. Rosenthal can be found at <a href="https://helenrosenthal.com/">https://helenrosenthal.com/</a></p>   |
| <p>Jordan Feiner for Speaker Corey Johnson</p> | <p>Mr. Feiner introduced himself as the new CB4 liaison in the Office of Speaker Johnson – a position that he will maintain in the Office of Erik Bottcher. He mentioned that he has been working on special events and projects in the Speaker’s Office since 2018. He noted two upcoming events:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The 4th Annual Holiday Season Toy Drive will begin tomorrow, December 2. Drop-offs of unwrapped toys can be made at the district office, located at 224 West 30th Street, from 12:00 – 5:00pm. Drop-offs can also be made on December 7 during the same hours.</li> <li>• A holiday season meal distribution will be conducted with the Migrant Kitchen of Hudson Guild on December 23 at both the Fulton Community Center and the Hudson Guild Elliott Center.</li> </ul>   |
| <p>Borough President Gale Brewer</p>           | <p>MS. Brewer made her final virtual appearance as Borough President while riding in a car. She commented on the tough times that community boards had to face in recent times and that Chair Kern and the Board displayed strength to overcome those difficulties. As an example, she cited her conversation earlier in the day with the Chair of NYCHA who indicated to her his intention to employ the same resident engagement process that was used by CB4 in Chelsea at the Manhattanville development in district 9. She thanked everyone on the Board who was part of that process. She also thanked the members who have been involved in the Penn Station reconstruction, noting that Governor Hochul has indicated her willingness to work more closely with the community than the previous Governor.</p> <p>Ms. Brewer spoke about the “awesome feeling” she had while touring Pier 57 earlier in the day, noting the work of CB4 on the open space project that makes all of its assets easily accessible to the public. She provided some additional updates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• She continues to work on the issues concerning the homeless and stated that Brian Lewis of her office has been trying to bring the Business District Recovery Initiative into the conversation along with the Midtown South Homeless Forum.</li> <li>• She continues her efforts in getting the Midtown Court fully reopened and having it funded adequately.</li> <li>• She voiced her concern about the increase in the number of fulfillment centers in the Borough. These centers are essentially warehouses that enable rapid delivery services to deliver food items in 15 or 30 minutes. She believes the very concept is dangerous because of the danger that delivery workers pose for pedestrians. There is also a question about whether a warehouse is legal in a commercial district, the place where these fulfillment centers tend to operate.</li> <li>• Every Tuesday at 3:00pm, there is a meeting in her office to discuss vaccines and funding. The Deputy Comptroller of the City of New York gave a presentation at the</li> </ul> |

|  |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>last meeting where he presented Scott Stringer’s latest assessment of current and future funding.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Borough President’s year-end reception will be held on Sunday, December 2, at John Jay College from 2 – 4pm.</li> </ul> |
|--|---|

| Board Reports & Business       |  |
|--------------------------------|--|
| Adoption of Agenda and Minutes | The Agenda and November minutes were unanimously approved.   |
| Election of Board Officers     | <p>The District Manager conducted the election of Board officers for the coming year under state law allowing for online elections. After each member submitted a vote sheet online, the votes were tallied, and Mr. Bodine announced the following results:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Chair – Jeffrey LeFrancois</li> <li>2. First Vice Chair – Jessica Chait</li> <li>3. Second Vice Chair – Leslie Boghosian Murphy</li> <li>4. Co-Secretary – Blake Kurisu</li> <li>5. Co-Secretary – Katy Stokes</li> </ol>   |
| District Manager Report        | <p>The District Manager provided the following updates:</p> <p>December Committee Schedule:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Arts, Culture, Education &amp; Street Life Committee will meet on Monday, December 13 at 6:30pm</li> <li>• The Business Licenses &amp; Permits Committee will meet on Tuesday, December 14 at 6:30pm</li> <li>• All other committees will meet at their regular scheduled times.</li> </ul>   |
| Board Chair Report             | <p>The Chair reviewed the following:</p> <p>Small Meetings and Ongoing Working Groups:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Empire Station Complex Working Group is ongoing.</li> <li>• The Port Authority Bus Terminal Replacement Working Group continues to participate in the EIS process and holds one-on-one meetings with PANYNJ on a bi-weekly basis.</li> <li>• The Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee continues to work with HPD regarding the two public sites in Hell’s Kitchen – the MTA and DEP sites.</li> <li>• The Chelsea Land Use Committee continues to monitor the status of the landmarked buildings on the edge of Gansevoort Market at West 14th and 9th Avenue.</li> <li>• The Housing, Health &amp; Human Services Committee continues to work with DHS regarding the placement of facilities within the district.</li> </ul> |

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Waterfront, Parks &amp; Environment Committee attended a tour of renovated Pier 57 and has been meeting with EDC and Vornado on Pier 94.</li> </ul> <p>Board Business:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Board offered condolences to Board member Elzora Cleveland and her family on the passing of Elzora’s husband Myles Cleveland.</li> <li>The Chair thanked Co-Secretary Mike Noble for his many years of service, noting that this would be his last meeting in that position. He asked Mr. Noble for an update on the Chelsea NYCHA Working Group of which he is a member. Mr. Noble stated that a Resident Review Committee was formed after the release of the Working Group Report in February to help draft a request for proposals (RFP), review developer proposals, and interview candidates. Yesterday, it was announced at the tenant association meetings of Fulton and Elliott-Chelsea Houses that a development team was selected jointly by NYCHA and the Resident Review Committee: Essence Development and the Related Companies. He went on to note that their proposal meets all of the Working Group recommendations and that repairs and upgrades to the developments would commence in 12 to 18 months.</li> </ul> |
|--|--|

| Action Items   | Motions, Amendments, & Comments | Result             |
|--|---------------------------------|--------------------|
| <b>Business License and Permits Committee (BLP)</b>                            |                                 |                    |
| Item 1: Letter to SLA re 613 9th Avenue - El Cartel Inc.                       | Items 1-8 were bundled.         | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 2: Letter to SLA re 458 9th Avenue - The Wrecking Club LLC                |                                 | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 3: Letter to SLA re 10 Hudson Yards, 24th Floor - Hudson Dining Group LLC |                                 | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 4: Letter to SLA re 200-202 7th Avenue - Kaito Group LLC                  |                                 | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 5: Letter to SLA re 201 8th Avenue - OC 8th Ave LLC                       |                                 | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 6: Letter to SLA re 405 W 51st Street - Over a Drink LLC                  |                                 | Passed Unanimously |
| Item 7: Letter to SLA re 609 9th Avenue - Swift Eats Restaurant Group Corp.    |                                 | Passed Unanimously |



|  |                               |   |
|--|-------------------------------|---|
| Item 8: Letter to SLA re 644 10th Avenue - The Farrier LLC   |                               | Passed Unanimously                                    |
| <b>Transportation Planning Committee (TRANS)</b>   |                               |   |
| Item 9: Letter of Support to DOT re Interim Resurfacing of 9th Avenue  |                               | Passed Unanimously                                    |
| Item 10: Letter to Governor re Penn Station Advisory Group   |                               | Passed with 42 In Favor and 1 Abstention              |
| Item 11: Letter to DOT re Proposal of Open Street changes at West 22nd Street  | Friendly amendment accepted.  | Passed Unanimously                                    |
| <b>Housing, Health &amp; Human Services Committee (HHHS)</b>   |                               |   |
| Item 12: Letter to New York City Criminal Court re: Staffing at Midtown Community Court at 314 W 54th Street                 | Friendly amendments accepted. | Passed Unanimously                                    |
| <b>Executive Committee (EXEC)</b>  |                               |   |
| Item 13: Letter to ESD re Penn Station Area Civic and Land Use Project   | As amended.                   | Passed with 36 In Favor, 1 Opposed, and 6 Abstentions |
| Item 14: Letter to Mayor's Office and HPD re Rezoning of Affordable Housing project at 806 9 <sup>th</sup> Avenue (MTA Site) |                               | Passed with 41 In Favor and 2 PNE                     |

|                                |   |
|--------------------------------|---|
| <b>Meeting Resolution</b>      |   |
| Adjournment                    | 9:43 PM Meeting Adjourned                         |
| Next Meeting Date and Location | 6:30 PM January 5, 2022<br>Video/Phone Conference |

As recorded by Leslie Boghosian Murphy and Michael Noble

| VOTING KEY<br>Y=Yes<br>N=No<br>A=Abstain<br>PNE=Present, not eligible<br>A'-- = No vote ATTENDANCE<br>KEY<br>P=Present<br>Ab=Absent<br>E=Excused | ATTENDANCE  |  |   |  |   |   |  |   |  |   |  |  |   |   |      |
|--|---|--|---|--|---|---|--|---|--|---|--|--|---|---|------|
|  | 1. Letter to SLA re 613 9th Avenue - E1 Cartel Inc. | 2. Letter to SLA re 458 9th Avenue - The Wrecking Club LLC | 3. Letter to SLA re 10 Hudson Yards, 24th Floor - Hudson Dining Group LLC | 4. Letter to SLA re 200-202 7th Avenue - Kaito Group LLC | 5. Letter to SLA re 201 8th Avenue - OC 8th Ave LLC | 6. Letter to SLA re 405 W. 51st Street - Over A Drink LLC | 7. Letter to SLA re 609 9th Avenue - Swift Eats Restaurant Group Corp. | 8. Letter to SLA re 644 10th Avenue - The Farrier LLC | 9. Letter of Support to DOT re Interim Resurfacing of 9th Avenue | 10. Letter to Governor re Penn Station Advisory Group | 11. Letter to DOT re Proposal of Open Street Changes at West 22nd Street | 12. Letter to New York City Criminal Court re: Staffing at Middleton Community Court 244 | 13. Letter to ESD re Penn Station Area Civic and Land Use Project | 14. Letter to Mayor's Office and HPD re: Rezoning of Affordable Housing project at 806 9th Avenue (AMTA Site) |      |
| P / Y  | 45  | 43   | 43  | 43   | 43  | 43  | 43   | 43  | 43   | 43  | 42   | 43   | 43  | 36  | 41   |
| Ab / N   | 3   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 0   | 1   | 0    |
| E / A  | 1   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 1  | 0  | 0   | 6   | 0    |
| PNE  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0   | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0   | 2    |
| A'--   | 0   | 2  | 2   | 2  | 2   | 2   | 2  | 2   | 2  | 2   | 2  | 2  | 2   | 2   | 2    |
| Theodore Arenas  | P   | A'--   | A'--  | A'--   | A'--  | A'--  | A'--   | A'--  | A'--   | A'--  | A'--   | A'--   | A'--  | A'--  | A'-- |
| Sara Appleton  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Robert Barnett   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | A   | PNE  |
| Christine Berthet  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Gwen Billig  | P   | A'--   | A'--  | A'--   | A'--  | A'--  | A'--   | A'--  | A'--   | A'--  | A'--   | A'--   | A'--  | A'--  | A'-- |
| Leslie Boghosian-Murphy  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Viren Brahmhatt  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | N   | Y    |
| Jessica Chait  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| T. Elzora Cleveland  | E   |  |   |  |   |   |  |   |  |   |  |  |   |   |      |
| Dale Corvino   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Maarten de Kadt  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Paul Devlin  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Pete Diaz  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Tina DiFelicianantonio   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Tina Nelson  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Wendy Gonzalez   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Jesse Greenwald  | A   |  |   |  |   |   |  |   |  |   |  |  |   |   |      |
| Candice Hewitt   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| David Holowka  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Frank Holozubiec   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Josephine Ishman   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | A   | Y    |
| Peggy Kauh   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Kerry Keenan   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | A   | Y    |
| Lowell Kern  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Blake Kurisu   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Burt Lazarin   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Christopher LeBron   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Jeffrey LeFrancois   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Betty Mackintosh   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Sarah Mills  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Michael Noble  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| J.D. Noland  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Maria Ortiz  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Allen Oster  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Brad Pascarella  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | A  | Y  | Y   | A   | Y    |
| Thuy Pham  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Joe Restuccia  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Sabrina Reveron  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | A   | PNE  |
| Delores Rubin  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| David Solnick  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Katy Stokes  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | A   | Y    |
| Kit Tollerson  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Hector Vazquez   | A   |  |   |  |   |   |  |   |  |   |  |  |   |   |      |
| Mrinal Vikram  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Rob Walker   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| James Wallace  | A   |  |   |  |   |   |  |   |  |   |  |  |   |   |      |
| David Warren   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Leslie Williams  | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |
| Alice Wong   | P   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y   | Y  | Y  | Y   | Y   | Y    |