

Lowell D. Kern Chair

Jesse R. Bodine District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD No. 4

424 West 33rd Street, Suite 580 New York, NY 10001 tel: 212-736-4536 www.nyc.gov/mcb4

July 2021 Full Board Minutes

Meeting Date / Location	The Full Board met at 6:30 pm on Wednesday, July 28, 2021, at the Fulton Center Auditorium, 119 9th Avenue, New York, NY. The meeting was live streamed on YouTube and can be viewed at:
	https://tinyurl.com/wwbvt87x
	Public Hearing : City Wide Text Amendment for Permanent Open Restaurants JD Noland, Chair of the Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Committee, conducted the hearing on Agenda Item 28 relating to the proposal by DCP to make the Open Restaurants Program permanent. He stated that the committee rejected the three text amendments that were proposed by DCP because they would remove all protections that zoning provides now for outdoor cafes. A written statement opposing the proposal that was submitted by a local resident was read aloud and two members of the public spoke in person:
	 Catie Savage stated that she was generally in favor of outdoor dining, but that the proposal needed modifications to provide for more regulation of restaurant business operations and sanitation planning by the City. Pamela Wolf, who is a public member of the Board, spoke for herself as a resident of Chelsea. She voiced her concern that the proposal would perpetuate the shortcomings of the current Open Restaurants Program that are mainly due to a lack of enforcement by the City of rules governing outdoor space boundaries, for example.
	Public Hearing: City-Wide Text Amendment for Health and Fitness Paul Devlin, Co-Chair of the Chelsea Land Use Committee, conducted the hearing on Agenda Item 30, which is a ratification of a letter that had already been sent to the DCP approving the proposal to remove the requirement that Physical Culture Establishments obtain a special permit from the Bureau of Standards and Appeals. With no public speaker coming forward, the hearing was closed.
	Public Hearing: Western Rail Yard Infrastructure Project Draft Environmental Impact Statement Comment Period JD Noland conducted the hearing on Agenda Item 29. There were no public speakers, so the hearing was closed.
	Public Hearing: Starrett-Lehigh Building (601 West 26th Street) and Terminal Warehouse Building (261 11th Avenue) Rezoning

Paul Devlin conducted the hearing on Agenda Item 32 relating to a rezoning application for the two blocks between West 26th and West 28th Streets between 11th and 12th Avenues. No public speakers came forward and the hearing was then closed.

Community Update: MCB4 to provide update on Empire Station Complex Project

Jeffrey LeFrancois, First Vice Chair of the Board, gave updates on the activities of the
Advisory Committee that he has been a part of since last Summer dealing with the State's
proposal to develop the area around Penn Station under a plan known as the Empire
Station Complex Project. About four months ago, a decision was made by Community
Boards 4 and 5 and our elected officials from the district to create a bigger Working Group.
It has been meeting for the last three months on Tuesday at 4:00 in the afternoon for
about two to two and a half hours for 11 weeks. The work is now wrapping up on getting
recommendations to the State. Part of the process included gathering input from the
public at a Town Hall that was co-hosted by CB4 on July 16th wherein the State presented
its plan to the public. The Town Hall was done on Zoom and had over 200 participants and
150 questions submitted. It turned out that skyscrapers and affordable housing were the
issues that were of most concern to the public. At this point, we are awaiting a response
from the State, some of which we expect to be favorable.

	Public Session
Larry Marcus	Mr. Marcus announced that he had just gotten a job to promote, educate, and install solar powered trash cans. He lives at 46th and 10th Avenue and has had experience in the solar power industry before being offered his new job with a new product. He stated that he wants to work with the Board in finding ways to use his trash cans in Chelsea and Hell's Kitchen.
Brian Weber	Mr. Weber, who is a public member of the Board, is on the Midtown South Precinct Community Council. He announced the National Night Out Against Crime event that will take place on Tuesday, August 3rd from 5-8 pm at the McAffery Park Playground, located at West 43rd Street between 8th and 9th Avenues. Guests can enjoy free pizza, Italian Ices, and music. There will also be a mobile vaccination van on site.
Frank Parillo	Mr. Parillo is the attorney representing the Gadfly Lounge in its liquor license application to the SLA that is the subject of Agenda Item 2. He thanked the BLP Committee for the hard work that went into their difficult application.
Edward Curtis	Mr. Curtis has lived on 16th Street between 7th and 8th Avenues for more than 20 years. He spoke in favor of the Gadfly Lounge application, stating that it will enhance the quality of life in the neighborhood.
Cara and Joe Pally	Ms. Pally introduced herself and her husband as the owners of the Gadfly Lounge and thanked everyone at the meeting who came out to support them.
Chris Lebron	Mr. LeBron, who is a member of the Board, spoke for himself in noting the large number of SLA applications on the Agenda and the fact that many bars and restaurants are reopening. He noted the latest CDC advisories on COVOD-19 precautions and urged those establishments to embrace the Excelsior Pass on their own before the Mayor and Governor make statements announcing mandates.
Cathy Curtis	Ms. Curtis has been a resident of West 15th Street for 35 years. She stated that she is in favor of businesses thriving in the City so long as they do not disturb the peace of the residents where they are located. She is concerned that the stipulations that are part of

	the Gadfly Lounge application may not be enough to mitigate the noise issues that have prevailed at their location when it was managed by another operator.
Lauren Donovan	Ms. Donovan spoke in favor of the Gadfly Lounge because she looks forward to there being more people around at night to discourage those who come into her neighborhood to do harm to its residents. She lives directly across from the Gadfly Lounge and has had several bad experiences recently. She thinks the new establishment will add an element of safety to the area.
Lisa Wager	 Ms. Wager is the Director of Government and Community Relations at the Fashion Institute of Technology. She reviewed the following upcoming events: FIT will be opening for in-person classes in the Fall Semester, with the campus opening on Monday, August 2nd. The first day of classes is Monday, August 30th and the SUNY vaccination policy will be adhered to at the college. That means that all dormitory residents must be vaccinated before they arrive. The Museum at FIT is re-opening after its closure nineteen months ago. It will reopen on Friday, April 6th with a new exhibition titled <i>Ravishing the Rose</i>. The Museum has new hours and protocols: capacity has been reduced to 50 people with groups limited to 5 people; hand sanitizer stations are in place; and gallery seating is available. The new hours now provide for being open on both Saturday and Sunday from 10 am to 5 pm. Hours on Wednesday, Thursday, and Friday are from Noon to 8 pm.
Kathleen Treat	Ms. Treat spoke in favor of the position taken by the Board in Agenda Item 28 regarding the Mayor's proposed permanent outdoor dining measure. She referred to current problems with structures on 9th Avenue that impede the passage of ambulances and the encroachment on sidewalks that impede pedestrians.
Marni Halasa	Ms. Halasa does outreach for the homeless. She spoke about the Mayor's ongoing efforts to relocate about 8,000 temporary hotel shelter residents back to congregate shelters. She stated that it has been disorienting for many residents because they aren't sure where they will end up when they have a special need due to a disability. She is concerned that the vaccination rate for these temporary shelter residents is only 14%, posing a problem for them and the community at large.

	Remarks from Elected Officials and Representatives
Borough President	The Borough President and all elected officials agreed not to speak at the meeting because
Gale Brewer	of the long agenda. They will appear at the next General Meeting in September.

	Board Reports & Business
Adoption of Agenda and Minutes	The Agenda, as amended, and the June minutes were unanimously approved.
District Manager Report	The District Manager updated the status of temporary DHS hotel shelters in the district:

The following shelters have returned to their permanent locations:

- o Springhill Inn Suite West 36th Street
- o Four Points Sheraton West 40th Street
- Skyline Hotel 725 10th Avenue
- o Watson Hotel West 57th Street

The following temporary shelters are in the process of returning:

- o Hilton Garden W. 37th Street
- Comfort Inn West 44th Street

The following shelters will be transitioning back to the following sites in the coming weeks:

- WIN West Women's Shelter West 51st Street
- Care For the Homeless West 52nd St Women's Center West 52nd Street

August Committee Schedule:

- The Business License and Permit Committee (BLP) will meet on Tuesday, August 10th at 6:30 pm at the Fulton Center Auditorium, located at 119 9th Avenue.
- There are no other committee meetings scheduled for August.

Board Chair Report

The Chair announced the appointment of three new Public Members:

Jennifer Cook – Waterfront, Parks, and Environment Brett Firfer – Transportation Planning Tamara McCraw – Arts, Culture, Education, and Street Life

Small Meetings and Ongoing Working Groups

- MCB4 will be participating in the official PANYNJ PABT Replacement Environmental Impact Statement Process
- MCB4 continues to work with MCB5, Elected Officials, and ESD on the Empire Station Complex Proposal
- MCB4 Leadership continues to correspond with ESD and PANYNJ regarding Highline East Expansion and West 30th Street improvements

Full Board Business Session Procedure:

- Committee Co-Chairs will stand at the microphones to present their letters
- It is recommended for board members who want to speak on that item to go to one of the microphones and wait to be called on.
- Voting will be done by standard vote sheet and collected at the end.
- Roll Calls for the three land use items will be bundled into one roll call at the end.

Action Items	Motions, Amendments, & Comments	Result
Business License and Permits C	ommittee (BLP)	
Item 1: Letter to SLA re 134 9th Avenue (18/19) – Susi Villa TPlayground Inc	Items 1 – 27, except for Item 2, were bundled	Passed Unanimously
Item 2: Letter to SLA re 258 W 15th Street - Gadfly Lounge LLC	A substitute letter was introduced and voted upon in place of the one initially voted on at BLP. The new letter asks the SLA to postpone consideration until BLP can review the application again.	Passed with 34 In Favor
Item 3: Letter to SLA re 524 W 36th Street (Hudson Blvd E & Hudson Blvd W) — Paradise in the Park LLC		Passed with 34 In Favor and 1 Opposed
Item 4: Letter to SLA re 857 9th Avenue (55/56) – Across the Park		Passed Unanimously
Item 5: Letter to SLA re 383 W 31st Street - Gift New York No. 3 LLC		Passed Unanimously
Item 6: Letter to SLA re 401 9th Avenue - Aramark Services Inc.		Passed Unanimously
Item 7: Letter to SLA re 329 W 49th Street - Eastside Barking Dog Inc.		Passed Unanimously
Item 8: Letter to SLA re 30 Hudson Yards, 74th-80th Floors - Hudson Dining Group LLC		Passed Unanimously
Item 9: Letter to SLA re 216 7th Avenue - Counter & Bodega Inc.		Passed Unanimously
Item 10: Letter to SLA re 458 W 17th Street - Noz 17 LLC 2		Passed with 34 In Favor and 1 PNE
Item 11: Letter to SLA re 692 10th Avenue - 692 10th Avenue LLC		Passed Unanimously
Item 12: Letter to SLA re 751 9th Avenue - CC751 Corp.		Passed Unanimously
Item 13: Letter to SLA re 757 6th Avenue – MBG Taverns on 6 th		Passed Unanimously
Item 14: Letter to SLA re 327 W 57th Street (8/9) – Alaia Wings Inc.		Passed Unanimously

Item 15: Letter to SLA re 370 W 51st Street - NPD West 51 Inc.	Passed Unanimously
ltem 16: Letter to SLA re 709 9th Avenue (48/49) — Kohoku-ku	Passed
LLC	Unanimously
Item 17: Letter to SLA re 729 8th Avenue (45) – AV 8th Ave. LLC	Passed Unanimously
Item 18: Letter to SLA re 75 9th Avenue (15/16), Suite 01A66 — Bombay House Hospitality LLC	Passed with 34 In Favor and 1 PNE
Item 19: Letter to SLA re 315 W 46th Street (8/9) — Harlem CD	Passed
LLC	Unanimously
Item 20: Letter to SLA re 601 W 26th Street (11/12) – 11-26 LLC	Passed Unanimously
Item 21: Letter to SLA re 639 W 46th Street (11/12) – 46 & 12	Passed
LLC	Unanimously
Item 22: Letter to SLA re 656 9th Avenue (45/46) – 656 9th Ave	Passed
LLC	Unanimously
Item 23: Letter to SLA re 830-840 9th Avenue (54/55) — Canicatti	Passed
Corp.	Unanimously
Item 24: Letter to SLA re 679 9th Avenue (46/47) – Mari	Passed
Hospitality NYC Inc.	Unanimously
Item 25: Letter to SLA re 202 9th Avenue (22/23) — The Canuck	Passed
202 9th Avenue LLC	Unanimously
Item 26: Letter to SLA re 383 W 33rd Street, Unit 189 & 188,	Passed
Moynihan Train Hall - Moynihan Overlook Bar LLC	Unanimously
Item 27: Letter to SLA re 55 Hudson Yards - BL 55 Hudson Yards	Passed
NY LLC	Unanimously
Clinton/Hell's Kitchen Land Use Co	ommittee (CHKLU)
Item 28: Letter to DCP & DOT re City Wide Text Amendment on Permanent Open Restaurants Program	Passed with 29 In Favor and 4 Abstentions
Item 29: Letter to Federal Railroad Administration re Western	Passed
Rail Yard Draft Environmental Impact Statement	Unanimously

Chelsea Land Use Commi	ttee (CLU)	
Item 30: Letter to DCP re City-Wide Text Amendment for Health and Fitness – Ratification		Passed with 34 In Favor and 1 Abstention
Item 31: Letter to LPC re 547 West 26th Street LPC Application for a Proposal for Signage and a New Canopy —Ratification		Passed with 34 In Favor and 1 Abstention
Item 32: Letter to DCP re Starrett-Lehigh Building (601 West 26th Street) and Terminal Warehouse Building (261 11th Avenue) Rezoning		Passed Unanimously
Arts, Culture, Education, and Street L	ife Committee (ACES)	
Item 33: Letter to Organizers of the Restoration of Arnold Belkin's mural, "Against Domestic Colonialism" at Mathews- Palmer Playground (445 West 45th Street)	Items 33 and 34 were bundled	Passed Unanimously
Item 34: Letter to DSNY re Future Dept. of Sanitation Budget Priorities for Community District 4		Passed Unanimously
Waterfront, Parks and Environmen	t Committee (WPE)	
Item 35: Letter to Elected Representatives re Legislation for Heliport Closure	Items 35 and 36 were bundled, as amended	Passed with 33 In Favor, 1 Abstention, and 1 PNE
Item 36: Letter to HRPT re Safety and Future Removal of Heliport		Passed with 33 In Favor, 1 Abstention, and 1 PNE
Housing, Health & Human Services	Committee (HHHS)	
Item 37: Letter to Mt. Sinai West re Closure of 34 Bed Medical Detox Unit – Ratification		Passed Unanimously
Item 38: Letter to DOB re Fire at 501 W 52 nd Street (10/11)		Passed with 34 In Favor and 1 PNE
Transportation Planning Comr	mittee (TRANS)	
Item 39: Letter to SAPO & DOT re Open Culture Program	Items 39 – 46, except for Item 45, were bundled	Passed Unanimously
Item 40: Letter to ESD re High Line East Project – Ratification		Passed Unanimously

Item 41: Letter to DOT re Safety Improvements at 40 th Street & at 11 th Avenue		Passed Unanimously
Item 42: Letter to DOT re 25 th Street Cargo Bike Corral Application		Passed Unanimously
Item 43: Letter to Electeds re Scaffolding Reforms		Passed Unanimously
Item 44: Letter to DOT re The Jet, LLC Intercity Bus Permit Application for 555 W. 33 rd Street (Hudson Blvd/11 th Ave)		Passed Unanimously
Item 45: Letter to Gov. Cuomo re Congestion Pricing	Friendly amendments accepted	Passed with 26 In Favor, 4 Opposed, and 5 Abstentions
Item 46: Letter to DDC and DOT re 9 th Avenue Bike Lane Conditions (30 th -33 rd Streets)		Passed Unanimously
Executive Committee	(EXEC)	'
Item 47: Letter to DSNY, DOB, and DOT re Proposed Rules for Building Waste Management Plan – Ratification		Passed with 33 In Favor
and the state of t		
Item 48: Letter to DCP re Special Permit Renewal for Western Rail Yard Parking Permits – Ratification		Passed with 34 In Favor
Item 49: Social and Racial Justice Task Force Open Letter to Community District 4		Passed with 32 In Favor, 1 Opposed, and 1 Abstention
Item 50: Letter to Mayor and FDNY re Siting of EMS Station #7 on West 29 th Street		Passed with 34 In Favor
Item 51: Letter to DOT re Fatality at 25 th Street and 8 th Avenue – Ratification	-	Passed with 34 In Favor
Transportation Planning Committee	(TRANS) – Continued	Į
Item 52: Letter to DOT and DCP re Proposed Permanent Open Restaurant Program	Friendly amendments accepted	Passed with 33 In Favor and 1 Abstention
New Business		
Item 53: Letter to Mayor de Blasio and PANYNJ re Lincoln Tunnel Congestion on Ninth and Eleventh Avenues	Friendly amendments accepted	Passed with 33 In Favor and 1 Abstention

Meeting Resolution	on
Adjournment	9:00 PM Meeting Adjourned
Next Meeting Date and Location	6:30 PM September 1, 2021

As recorded by Leslie Boghosian-Murphy

VOTING KEY Y=Yes N=No A=Abstain PNE=Present, not eligible A'= No vote ATTENDANCE KEY P=Present Ab=Absent E=Excused	35	35	2. Letter to SLA re 258 Street (7/8) - Gadfly Lc SUBSTITUTE	3. Letter to SLA re 524 W. 36th & Street (Hudson Blvd E & Hudson Bvd W) - Paradis in the Park LLC	- 55	35	35	35	35	35	0: 15 34	11. Letter to SLA re 692 10th S. Avenue (48/49) - 692 10th Avenue LLC	35	13. Letter to SLA re 757 6th G Avenue (25/26) - MBG Taverns on 6th	35	15. Letter to SLA re 370 W 51st Street (8/9) - NPD West 51 Inc.	16. Letter to SLA re 709 9th Avenue (48/49) - Kohoku-ku LLC	7. Letter to Avenue (45)	ا18. Letter to SLA re 75 9th پ Avenue (15/16) - Suite 01A66 - Bombay House Hospitality LLC	19. Letter to SLA re 315 W. 46th Street (8/9) - Harlem CD LLC	35	21. Letter to SLA re 639 W. 46th Street (11/12) - 46 & 12 LLC	22. Letter to SLA re 656 9th	35	24. Letter to SLA re 679 9th G. Avenue (46/47) - Mari Hospitality NYC Inc.	25. Letter to SLA re 202 9th GAVenue (22/23) - The Canuck 202 9th Avenue LLC	26. Letter to SLA re 383 W. 33rd Street, Unit 189 & 188, Moynihan S Train Hall - Moynihan Overlook Bar LLC	27. Letter to SLA re 55 Hudson G Yards - BL 55 Hudson Yards NY LLC
Ab / N E / A	11 3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
PNE	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
A'	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Theodore Arenas	Α																											
Sara Appleton Robert Barnett	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Christine Berthet	A		ſ	ī					ī	1	I			T	I		ı	I	1		1	-			1	ī	I	
Gwen Billig	Р	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ
Leslie Boghosian-Murphy	Р	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ
Viren Brahmbhatt	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Jessica Chait T. Elzora Cleveland	A	T	T	T	ı	1	T	T T	T	T	T	T	T	T	T	T	T	Υ	T	T	T	ı	T	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Dale Corvino	P	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ
Maarten de Kadt	Α																											
Paul Devlin	Р	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ
Pete Diaz Tina DeFeliciantonio	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Tina Rea Eskreis-Nelson	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Wendy Gonzalez	Р	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Jesse Greenwald	Е																											
Candice Hewitt	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
David Holowka Frank Holozubiec	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Josephine Ishman	E	•	-				_					-		-					-									
Peggy Kauh	Α																											
Kerry Keenan	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Lowell Kern Blake Kurisu	E	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Burt Lazarin	P	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ
Christopher LeBron	Р	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ
Jeffrey LeFrancois	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	PNE	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	PNE	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Betty Mackintosh Sarah Mills	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	V	Y
Michael Noble	Α	•	-				_					-		-					-						•			
J.D. Noland	Р	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ
Maria Ortiz	Р	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y
Allen Oster	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Brad Pascarella Thuy Pham	P	Y	Y	Y N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Joe Restuccia	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Sabrina Reveron	Р	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ý	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Delores Rubin	Α																											
David Solnick	A	V	Y	Y	V	V	V	Y	Y	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	V	Y	V
Katy Stokes Kit Tollerson	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Hector Vazquez	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ý	Y	Y	Y	Y
Mrinal Vikram	Р	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ
Rob Walker	Р	Y	A'	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y
James Wallace	A																											
David Warren																												
David Warren Leslie Williams	A P	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ

VOTING KEY Y=Yes N=No A=Abstain PNE=Present, not eligible A'= No vote ATTENDANCE KEY P=Present Ab=Absent E=Excused P / Y Ab / N E / A	32 Letter to DCD & DOT re City		Program 22. Letter to Federal Railroad Administration re Western Rail Administration re Western Rail Statement	30. Letter to DCP re City Wide	31. Letter to LPC re 547 West 26 Street LPC Application for a Proposal for Signage and a New Canopy - For Ratification	32. Letter to DCP re Starrett- Lehigh Bulding (601 W 26 Street) o of and Terminal Warehouse Building (261 11th Avenue)	33. Letter to Organizers of the Restoration of Amold Belkin's Co o Simural, "Against Domestic Colonialism" at Mathews-Palmer Playground (445 West 45th	34. Letter to DSNY re Future 0. 0; Dept. of Sanitation Budget Priorities for Community District 4	35. Letter to Elected L O S Representatives re Legislation for Heliport Closure	36. Letter to HRPT re Safety and Euture Removal of Heliport	37. Letter to Mt. Sinai West re	o o k W. 52nd Street (10/11)	O O S Open Culture Program	O C East Project - For Ratification	A1. Letter to DOT re Safety O 😅 Improvements at 40th Street & at		43. Letter to Elected o O G Representatives re Scaffolding Reforms	44. Letter to DOT re The Jet, LLC Intercity Bus Permit Application o 9 % for 555 W. 33rd Street (Hudson Bivd/11th Ave)	45. Letter to Gov. Cuomo re Congestion Pricing	46. Letter to DDC and DOT re 9th	47. Letter to DSNY, DOB, & DOT re Proposed Rules for Building Waste Management Plan - For Ratification	48. Letter to DCP re Special O O P Permit Renewal for Western Rail Yard Parking Permits - For	49. Social and Racial Justice 1 C Task Force Open Letter to Community District 4	50. Letter to Mayor and FDNY re	51. Letter to DOT re Fatality at Co Co Letter and 8th Avenue - For Ratification	52. Letter to DOT and DCP re C S Proposed Permanent Open Restaurant Program	53. Letter to Mayor de Blasio and PANYN. re Lincoln Tunnel © © Congestion on Ninth and Eleventh Avenues
PNE	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
A'	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	1	1	1	1	1	1
	-																										
Theodore Arenas Sara Appleton Robert Barnett	A	Δ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Christine Berthet	A		-					-					-													<u> </u>	
	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Gwen Billig	P	V	Y	V	Y	V	Y	Y	V	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	^	V	Y	A'	A'	A'	A'	A'	A'
Leslie Boghosian-Murphy	P	Y	Y	Y	-	, ,	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	V	Y	•	Υ Υ	Υ Υ	Y		Y	Υ Υ
Viren Brahmbhatt	P	Y Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	V	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Jessica Chait		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T
T. Elzora Cleveland	Α						.,											.,									
Dale Corvino	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	A'	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ
Maarten de Kadt	Α												_														$\overline{}$
Paul Devlin	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Pete Diaz	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Tina DeFeliciantonio	P	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Tina Rea Eskreis-Nelson	P	A'	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Α	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ
Wendy Gonzalez	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y
Jesse Greenwald	E																										
Candice Hewitt	P	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
David Holowka	P	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y
Frank Holozubiec	P	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y
Josephine Ishman	E																										
Peggy Kauh	Α																										
Kerry Keenan	Р	A'	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Α	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Lowell Kern	Р	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	PNE	PNE	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y
Blake Kurisu	E																										
Burt Lazarin	P	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ
Christopher LeBron	Р	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ý	Ý	Ý	Y	Ý	Ý	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ý
Jeffrey LeFrancois	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Betty Mackintosh	P	Ý	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ý	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Sarah Mills	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ý	Y	Ý	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Ÿ
Michael Noble	A																										
J.D. Noland	P	v	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	v	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	N	v	Υ	Y	N	Y	Υ	Y	Y
	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Maria Ortiz		Y Y			-		Y		-		Y		_	Y	Y	_	-			-			1				
Allen Oster	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	•	Y	Y	_		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	A'	Y	A	Y	Y	Y	Y
Brad Pascarella	P	A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	A	A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	A	A
Thuy Pham	P	Y	Y	A	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	•	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Joe Restuccia	Р	<u>Y</u>	Y	Y		<u> </u>	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	PNE	Y	Y		Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y
Sabrina Reveron	P	A	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y
Delores Rubin	Α																										
David Solnick	Α																										
Katy Stokes	P	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Kit Tollerson	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Hector Vazquez	P	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ
Mrinal Vikram	P	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y
Rob Walker	Р	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y
James Wallace	Α																										
David Warren	Α																										
Leslie Williams	Р	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Υ	Y	Υ	N	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Υ
Alice Wong	Р	Α	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Υ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
				-		-	•	•				-												-		-	