



LOWELL D. KERN
Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

424 West West 33 Street, Suite #580
New York, NY 10001

Mailing Address
P.O. Box 2622
New York, NY 10108
tel: 212-736-4536
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

July 19, 2021

Sarah Carroll, Chair
Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building, 9th Floor
One Centre Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: Paddy's Market and Hell's Kitchen Historic Districts, Manhattan

Dear Chair Carroll,

Thank you for your April 1st letter on the evaluation of the proposed Hell's Kitchen and Paddy's Market Historic Districts in Manhattan. We greatly appreciate your time and considered opinion.

Nevertheless, we were saddened to read that you "determined that the proposed Paddy's Market historic district on Ninth Avenue between West 35th and West 40th Streets does not retain sufficient historic fabric to communicate the buildings' connection to the open-air sidewalk markets of the early 20th century. Due to its mixed integrity and lack of cohesiveness across both sides of the street, it lacks the intact historic character and sense of place necessary for consideration as a historic district."

This determination is disappointing considering the political will engendered during the Garment Center District rezoning, in which Manhattan Community Board 4 (MCB4) found ways to preserve the historic integrity left of the existing and abutting district, all within Hell's Kitchen proper. In fact, on January 21, 2021, MCB4 submitted, with the suggestion from NYS Historic Preservation Office, a nomination for NYS Historic District recognition. We ask for a reconsideration of our request.¹

¹ At its May 5th Full Board meeting, MCB4 voted to approve this letter by 36 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstaining, and 0 present but not eligible to vote.

We were pleased to see “staff determined that smaller areas centered on West 44th Street and West 47th Street, and certain individual buildings within the larger area, may merit further consideration.” We look forward to discussing this smaller area with you as well as certain other individual buildings and streets within the larger area.

MCB4 has been fighting for years to get recognition, not only for individual buildings, but also for the remarkably intact built environment of the neighborhood. All this in the face of constant City imposed changes through special district rezonings. MCB4 still believes that the New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) needs to recognize the significance of both the architecture and history laid out in the MCB4 Report² of both the proposed Paddy’s Market and Hell’s Kitchen historic districts in the Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen neighborhood, issued in September 2019, by working with us to see them designated.

Sincerely,



Lowell D. Kern
Chair
Manhattan Community Board 4



Jean-Daniel
Chair
Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen Land Use Committee

cc: Hon. Bill de Blasio, Mayor
Hon. Corey Johnson, Speaker, City Council
Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
Hon. Jerry Nadler, U.S. Congress
Hon. Brad Hoylman, New York State Senate
Hon. Richard Gottfried, New York State Assembly
Hon. Linda Rosenthal, New York State Assembly
Hon. Helen Rosenthal, City Council
Marisa Lago, Chair, City Planning Commission
Raju Mann, Director of Land Use, NYC Council
Edith Hsu-Chen, Manhattan Director, Department of City Planning Historic Districts Council

² In March 2019, MCB4 retained the services of Anthony W. Robins, of Thompson & Columbus, Inc., to undertake a thorough review of the architecture and history of Clinton/Hell’s Kitchen with the goal of identifying potential historic districts to be proposed to the LPC. See the [Proposed Historic Districts in Hell’s Kitchen Report \(September 2019\)](#).