



CITY OF NEW YORK

**MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR**

330 West 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, 26<sup>th</sup> floor New York, NY 10036  
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512  
[www.nyc.gov/mcb4](http://www.nyc.gov/mcb4)

**BURT LAZARIN**  
Chair

**JESSE R. BODINE**  
District Manager

July 5<sup>th</sup>, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair  
Landmarks Preservation Commission  
Municipal Building, 9th floor  
One Centre Street New York, NY 10007

**Re: 305-313 West 22<sup>nd</sup> Street Window Replacement**

Dear Vice Chair Bland:

Manhattan Community Board 4's (CB4) Chelsea Land Use Committee (CLU) held a duly noticed public hearing regarding the application for 305-313 West 22<sup>nd</sup> Street at the Committee's meeting on June 18, 2018. At its regularly scheduled Executive Committee (EXEC) meeting on June 25, 2018, EXEC voted to support the consensus of the CLU Committee, by a vote of 9 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstaining and 0 present but not eligible to vote, to recommend against staff-level Commission approval of the proposed window replacement at 305-313 West 22<sup>nd</sup> Street in the Chelsea Historic District. This letter is subject to ratification by the Full Board to be held on Wednesday, July 25<sup>th</sup>.

**Background**

305-313 West 22<sup>nd</sup> Street is a single residential condominium apartment building created in 1986 behind four historic former rowhouse façades and a new infill façade. The existing street façade windows are of wood construction and date from the 1986 gut renovation of the former rowhouses. Their replacement with insulated glass aluminum windows is now proposed, on the basis of an applicant-cited provision allowing replacement of windows with non-original material in buildings having a street frontage of more than 41 feet. The current proposal also calls for the top floor mansard dormer windows to have square-topped upper sash within existing arch-roofed dormers. According to the applicant, old photos show that these windows historically had upper sash glazing which passed behind an arched outer frame, creating the appearance of windows with arched tops. The applicant has asked CB4 to advise the Commission as to the appropriateness of LPC staff level approval versus bringing the proposal before a public hearing.

**Analysis**

CB4 does not agree that any 41-foot façade length provision should apply, given that the building has what remain, historically and architecturally, individual rowhouse facades. These

should logically be governed by the guidelines of the Commission's *Rowhouse Manual*, which calls for historic window materials and details to be matched on primary façades. This, rather than a legal technicality invoked to skirt the spirit of the *Manual*, should prevail.

CB4 also disputes the applicant's stated concern that thermally efficient, insulated glass windows are not available with wood sash and frame construction, and that such windows would require such frequent maintenance as to impose an undue hardship. Factory-applied paint finishes have a proven track record for long durability. Wooden sash for insulated windows is widely available.

CB4 also disputes the applicant's claim that square-topped dormer windows must have been approved by the Commission in 1986 and so must be approved again.

### **Conclusion**

CB4 asks the Commission to conduct a public hearing on the proposed window replacement and to guide the applicant toward compliance with the *Rowhouse Manual*, including simulation of the cited historic top-floor window head detail as documented in early photos.

Sincerely,



Burt Lazarin  
Chair  
Manhattan Community Board 4



John Lee Compton, Co-Chair  
Chelsea Land Use Committee



Betty Mackintosh, Co-Chair  
Chelsea Land Use Committee

cc: Hon. Corey Johnson, City Council  
Hon. Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President