



CITY OF NEW YORK

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FOUR

330 West 42nd Street, 26th floor New York, NY 10036
tel: 212-736-4536 fax: 212-947-9512
www.nyc.gov/mcb4

BURT LAZARIN
Chair

JESSE R. BODINE
District Manager

July 31, 2019

Sarah Carroll, Chair
Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building, 9th floor
One Centre Street New York, NY 10007

Re: Front Façade Window Project at 456 West 23rd Street

Dear Chair Carroll:

On the unanimous recommendation of its Chelsea Land Use Committee, following a duly noticed public hearing at the Committee's meeting on July 15, 2019, Manhattan Community Board 4 (CB4), at its regularly scheduled meeting on July 24, 2019, voted, by a vote of 35 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstaining, and 0 present but not eligible to vote, to recommend approval of the application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) for a front façade window renewal project with one condition requiring a determination of the original window style.

Description of the Proposal

The building at 456 West 23rd Street, known as Christy House, is a rowhouse located in the Chelsea Historic District. The proposed project would replace the front façade windows with new ones made of Fibrex, a composite material which is 40 percent wood fiber. LPC has already given approval of this material for the rear façade of Christy House. A total of 14 windows would be replaced in the front.

Analysis and Recommendation

456 West 23rd Street and the rowhouses to its west appear to have originally matched the design of number 454, immediately to its east, which is in much less altered condition and may thus serve as an indication of the original condition of all the houses in the uniform row. The group's consistent cornice is the most obvious remaining indicator of its unified conception. It is likely that the heads of 456's windows originally had arched frames and glazing similar to 454's, as do the windows in some of the row's houses to the west. 456's existing flat-topped windows with arched panels above may be later replacements which don't reflect the original design. If this is

the case, these would historically be “special” windows as defined by the Commission’s Rules and require replacement with wood windows, matching the original material. Historic photos of 456 presented to CB4 were not of sufficient size or resolution to clarify the original condition.

The Board suggests that the Commission research and establish the actual or likely original design of 456’s windows and require that it be matched, including arched tops if any, division of glazing lights, and frame and sash profiles. We leave it to the Commission to determine whether the proposed 40 percent wood fiber material would constitute a match for original wood, if such is required. CB4 feels that the ability of the proposed material to match original frame and sash profiles as effectively as solid wood is the overriding concern. If LPC determines that it is unlikely that the heads of 465’s windows originally had arched frames and glazing similar to 454’s, then CB4 recommends approval of the proposed 40 percent wood fiber material for the existing windows.

Sincerely,



Burt Lazarin
Chair
Manhattan Community Board 4



Lee Compton
Co-Chair
Chelsea Land Use Committee



Betty Mackintosh
Co-Chair
Chelsea Land Use Committee

cc: Hon. Corey Johnson, Speaker, City Council
Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
Owners/Representatives of 456 West 23rd Street