

Antony Wong, Treasurer Amy Brenna, Secretary Mark Diller, District Manager

Community Board No. 2, Manhattan

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

April 21, 2023

Sarah Carroll, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9th Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Carroll:

At its Full Board meeting on April 20, 2023, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

1. 17 W. 9th St. – Application is to construct a 1-story rooftop addition.

Whereas:

- A. Certain modifications to the building, including the roof, were heard at a prior Landmarks Committee meeting and subsequently approved by the Commission; and
- B. There is a rooftop addition proposed at the rear of the building that is not visible from any public thoroughfare, as illustrated by drawings and photographs; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Manhattan recommends approval of the non-visible rooftop addition at the rear of the house.

Vote: Unanimous, with 42 Board members in favor.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Amy Brenna, Secretary Mark Diller, District Manager

Community Board No. 2, Manhattan

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

April 21, 2023

Sarah Carroll, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9th Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Carroll:

At its Full Board meeting on April 20, 2023, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

2. 32 Jane St – Application is to convert the house to a single-family residence from the current condition of five units and alter the entryway allowing the entry door to be level with the sidewalk with a window above, add a stair bulkhead and modifications to the roof, and modifications of the rear facade windows.

Whereas:

- A. The entrance door will be raised from below grade to grade level; and
- B. The front facade will be restored including replacement in kind of all windows except the window above the door which is proposed to be elongated, creating an oddly modern and unappealing appearance to the otherwise quiet façade; and
- C. A masonry band above the ground floor, not thought to be original, is proposed to be painted white which gives it undue prominence and sharply contrasts the otherwise dark grey facade; and
- E. At the rear, the fire escape will be removed, the masonry restored, and the windows will be rearranged to conform to the new ceiling heights required by code in the existing extension; and
- F. The top floor windows should be reduced in height to better conform to the rowhouse typography; and
- G. A rooftop stair bulkhead is to be added and the rear terrace will be enclosed with a railing not visible from a public thoroughfare; and

H. The stair bulkhead is visible from either side of the building but is not objectionable as it is typical to numerous bulkheads on row houses in the neighborhood; now

Therefore be is resolved that CB2, Man. recommends

- A. **Approval** of the restoration of the front facade and the replacement of the double hung windows; and
- B. **Denial** of the tall window above the entrance which has no historic reference and introduces an unwelcome and out of scale modern element to the facade; and
- C. That the masonry band above the ground floor be less prominent; and
- D. Approval of the rooftop additions and the rear facade.

Vote: Unanimous, with 42 Board members in favor.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Amy Brenna, Secretary Mark Diller, District Manager

Community Board No. 2, Manhattan

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

April 21, 2023

Sarah Carroll, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9th Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Carroll:

At its Full Board meeting on April 20, 2023, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

3.. *56 W. 12th St. – Application is to restore the facade, replace all windows, construct new stoop to match the historic original, construct a rooftop penthouse addition, construct a stepped-back rear-yard addition that retains the rear historic cornice line and three top-floor window openings, and construct a lap pool in the rear yard

Whereas:

- A. The front facade will be restored with a new stoop, replacement of windows, and restored cornice; a reconstructed entry, front steps, and areaway are in historic design similar to neighboring buildings except the new proposed ironwork, though historically inspired, does not conform to any of the many distinguished examples of period ironwork in the neighborhood including the proposed new newel posts shown as open squares, rather than the typical solid round historic design; and
- B. The steps are in line with a tree pit, leaving a narrow sidewalk space and the applicant agreed to make a diligent effort to foreshorten the treads in order to provide more space between the steps and the tree pit; and
- C. The tower portion of an ADA lift in the areaway is obtrusively positioned in front of a window: and
- D. There is a rooftop penthouse addition that is not visible from a public thoroughfare as illustrated by photographs of a mockup; and
- E. The cellar excavation is within the existing cellar footprint and requires no underpinning; and

- F. The stepped rear addition is less deep than the neighboring houses, retaining the original top floor rear facade and cornice line, and the proposed windows on the basement, parlor, and second floor metal divided full-width windows and the third floor double hung wood windows are located In a tripartite configuration that reflects the historic architecture; and
- G. A lap pool is to be installed at the side of the garden; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Manhattan recommends:

- A. Approval of the front facade restoration and windows; and
- B. **Denial** of the front steps unless it is determined that they cannot be redesigned to extend less far into the sidewalk; and
- C. **Denial** of the proposed ironwork and that it be more aligned with other district examples and include round newel posts as appropriate to the house; and
- D. **Approval** of the lift provided that a diligent effort be made to make it less obtrusive by relocating its mechanical tower away from the front of the basement window; and
- E. Approval of the non-visible rooftop addition and the cellar excavation; and
- F. Approval of the mass of the rear extension and the windows; and
- G. **Approval** of the lap pool, noting that it occupies a modest amount of the garden and is not objectionably visible from the neighboring gardens.

Vote: Unanimous, with 42 Board members in favor.

Please advise us of any decision or action taken in response to this resolution.

Sincerely,

Susan Kent, Chair

Community Board #2, Manhattan

Chenault Spence, Chair

Landmarks & Public Aesthetics Committee

Community Board #2, Manhattan

SK/fa

c: Hon. Dan Goldman, Congressman

Hon. Brad Hoylman, NY State Senator

Hon. Brian Kavanagh, NY State Senator

Hon. Deborah J. Glick, Assembly Member

Hon. Grace Lee, Assembly Member

Hon. Brad Lander, NYC Comptroller

Hon. Mark Levine, Man. Borough President

Hon. Erik Bottcher, NYC Council Speaker

Hon. Christopher Marte, NYC Council Member

Hon. Carlina Rivera, NYC Council Member

Gregory Cala, Community & Intergovernmental Affairs Associate, LPC