



## Community Board 12 - Manhattan Washington Heights & Inwood

530 West 166<sup>th</sup> St. 6<sup>th</sup> Floor, New York, NY 10032

Phone: (212) 568-8500, Fax: (212) 740-8197

Website: [www.nyc.gov/mcb12](http://www.nyc.gov/mcb12)

Shahabuddeen A. Ally, Esq., Chairperson  
Ebenezer Smith, District Manager

May 30, 2018

Hon. Polly Trottenberg  
Commissioner  
NYC Department of Transportation  
55 Water Street  
New York, NY 10041

Hon. Reymundo Mundo  
Commanding Officer  
34<sup>th</sup> Precinct - NYPD  
4295 Broadway  
New York, NY 10033

Hon. Robert O'Brien, Captain/FDNY  
Ladder 36 and Engine 95 Company  
Battalion 13  
29 Vermilyea Avenue  
New York, NY 10033

### **Re: Resolution Regarding Dyckman Street between Nagle Avenue & Broadway.**

Dear Commissioner Trottenberg, CO Mundo and Capt O'Brien:

Community Board 12 Manhattan at its General Meeting, Tuesday, May 22, 2018, passed the following resolution submitted by the Executive Committee based on testimony from a series of prior hearings with a vote of 32 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 abstention to recommend that action be taken to offer immediate temporary relief due to public safety concerns about the impassible traffic barriers and conditions associated with increased traffic congestion on Dyckman Street and the greater and compelling need for rapid response and road accessibility by emergency service vehicles and to immediately remove the protected bike lane on the south side of Dyckman Street between Nagle Avenue and Broadway and change the one-way lane on the north side of Dyckman between Nagle Avenue and Broadway to a two-way bike lane along with removal of related road markings and signage to effect this new pattern to provide that access until a long-term evidence-based solution is identified for implementation.

The Community Board also requested that the New York City Department of Transportation conduct a long term review of actual, real-time vehicle, bicycle, and pedestrian usage counts; recommending the installation of two DoT Real Time Cameras with public access 24/7 traffic video cameras; urging the placement and use of more traffic agents for this corridor both to manage double-parking and the flow of traffic on Dyckman Street; recommending that DoT work with the community and elected officials to explore new ideas and search for a safe and viable alternative east/west bike passage; and calling on the City Council, the State Legislature and the federal government to provide sufficient funding for such traffic and transportation infrastructure improvements.

**Whereas:** Community Board 12, Manhattan (CB12M) has long supported and continues to support a crosstown connector for the Harlem and Hudson River Greenways, passing resolutions in 2008 and 2009 calling on the New York City Department of Transportation (DoT) to evaluate the Dyckman Street corridor for the installation of bike lanes as the shortest path between the two greenway termini, and cohosting with DoT many meetings of Community District 12's (CD12's) residents, including members of the cycling and business communities; and

**Whereas:** The City of New York since has implemented its Vision Zero initiative to reduce conflicts, accidents, injuries, and deaths, and increase safety for cars, buses, bicyclists, and pedestrians, all of whom share our public roadways; and

**Whereas:** DoT originally proposed installing a two-way protected bike lane east of Nagle Avenue on the south side of Dyckman Street and two 5' one-way unprotected bike lanes (one on each side) on Dyckman Street between Nagle Avenue and Broadway, with a 9' parking lane on each side at the curb and a single 11' travel lane in each direction, as well as commercial loading zones, and various traffic calming measures, and on March 28, 2017 CB12M approved the proposal relating to Dyckman Street east of Nagle Avenue, but did not approve the proposal for Dyckman Street between Nagle Avenue and Broadway out of concern for exacerbated traffic conditions and negative operational impact on Dyckman Street's many small businesses, stating that "the second part of the project requires a much broader discussion because aspects of the proposed design... will affect not only residents in the area but also business owners" and calling on DoT to "hold a workshop on the needs of Dyckman Street from Broadway to Nagle... to produce enhancements and refinements to the proposed plan... and foster support and ensure successful implementation"; and

**Whereas:** Two such meetings were held, on April 20, 2017 to gather community feedback, and on June 5, 2017, at which DoT presented a revised design to install protected one-way bike lanes on both sides of the street, identical buffer zones and parking with only two lanes of traffic, pedestrian islands, two loading zones, a narrowing of the Dyckman Street corridor and a predictable outcome of traffic congestions, which plan was approved by CB12M on June 27, 2017, and a DOT roll-out proceeded later that year; and

**Whereas:** CB12M's June 27, 2017 meeting made no mention of a loss of parking spaces but the implemented changes resulted in a number of lost parking spaces, and the condition of a "normalization of the intersection at Dyckman Street and Broadway" that would not result in major traffic congestion was not met; and

**Whereas:** Double-parking has always been a serious problem on Dyckman Street's business corridor and while the bike lanes have enhanced cyclist safety, the redesign exacerbated existing traffic conditions to the point that local business owners have asserted that their business are suffering, and the FDNY Ladder 36 Captain wrote on January 31, 2018 to Manhattan Borough President to "recommend [she] consider possible alternatives to the bicycle lanes on Dyckman Street", stating that "[with the current set up, if someone attempts to double park they basically shut down all travel. The gridlock on Dyckman also increases traffic on the intersecting streets: Vermilyea Ave., Sherman Ave., Post Ave., and Nagle Ave. These traffic issues have caused Engine 95 and Ladder 36 to have delayed responses and the bicycle lanes will continue to delay the fire companies in the future if they remain as they are currently"; and

**Whereas:** CB12M passed a resolution on April 22, 2018 demanding that DoT, NYPD, FDNY attend both a joint meeting of CB12M's Traffic & Transportation, Public Safety, Licensing, and Business Development Committees on May 1<sup>st</sup> for fact-finding, and a May 8<sup>th</sup> Public Hearing to be held in Inwood, at which meetings there was much public testimony from members of the bicycling public who support the bike lanes as a valuable public safety enhancement, and much public testimony, including from all of the elected officials representatives and their representatives and the FDNY regarding their public safety concerns due to traffic, and from business owners who state that their businesses are suffering from increased issues with deliveries as well as decreased clientele since the bike lanes were installed; and

**Whereas:** DoT recognized and addressed at the public hearing some of the problems and issues cited by stakeholders at the earlier fact-finding meeting and proposed several modest measures to improve the current implementation and/or noted the following:

### **I. DoT Proposals for Immediate Changes (including Board comments)**

1. DoT failed to agree with testimony it heard that traffic congestion has significantly increased on Dyckman Street since the December 2017 rollout without offering supporting traffic counts or complete information on how that conclusion was reached.

***Note:** Only a bar graph was submitted suggesting that if there were increased traffic congestion it has now decreased without offering contributing factors or explanations for these changes, and without offering distinctions between real time versus extrapolated data or comparative YTD, 28 day and 24/7 weekly data. If DoT's Automatic Traffic Recorders (ATRs) have been used no data was presented for the frequency duration or where these recorders were installed. There was also a failure to release the NYPD Traffic Stat data on collisions during this nearly six month rollout or correlate it with the graph presented. DoT also fails to explain, if traffic congestion has decreased why does the FDNY no longer use Dyckman St. for emergency response calls from it Vermilyea Avenue firehouse or why does the NYPD use the sidewalks on Dyckman St. in its emergency response.*

2. DoT presentation failed to offer any data on a cyclist use or types of cyclists, or the direction on either protected bike lanes or whether any data has been collected to date.
3. DoT proposed minimal traffic signal timing updates in the Green Phase from 0 to 4 seconds in the AM and PM rush hours on all cross streets from Broadway to Nagle Avenue, except at Nagle Avenue in the PM rush hours the Green Phase will be increased 10 seconds.

***Note:** This is a passive approach and may need continuous traffic agents, more NYPD manpower or some kind of remote traffic priority signal (TPS) operating system to be successful.*

4. All parties agreed that Nagle Avenue/Dyckman Street is a bottleneck, but there is no agreement over the prevalence of bottlenecks at Dyckman Street's intersections with Broadway, and Vermilyea, Sherman, and Post Avenues;
5. DoT proposed a series of street marking/painting/signage updates including one to allow for a new right turn lane at Nagle Avenue going east from Dyckman Street to the south of Nagle Avenue;
6. DoT proposed narrowing both protected bike lanes by one foot and narrowing both parking lane by four feet to create an additional five-foot buffer between the parked cars and the vehicle travel lanes, which would themselves remain eleven feet wide;
7. DoT proposed the following curb management improvements: adding two loading zones bringing the total to four, staggering the loading zone hours, making the loading zones longer, extending meter hours from 7pm to 10pm so as to increase parking availability;

***Note:** One change may affect or negate other changes in this entire proposal changes. The loading locations are not listed and there is no evaluation of the success or failure of existing ones.*

*No dimensions or proposed size changes are given, nor is it clear what are the best times for each business to stagger their delivery hours, given the problem of delivery-time reliability. There is also no mention of garbage pickup for merchants given the space occupied by both parking and bike lanes. As for extending meter hours it is unclear how this would make more parking available as there is no control over refills. In fact, the NYPD reports that current loading zone on Nagle Avenue is used by taxis when not in use;*

8. DoT recommends an increase in traffic enforcement and motorist education, and enforcement of double-parking rules. DoT also is open to working with local business services to conduct surveys, identifying other streetscape improvements, and offering on-street outreach for changes and safety features in the new design.

***Note:** The 34<sup>th</sup> Precinct and NYPD Traffic Agents vigorously enforce moving violations and statistics are readily available on the NYPD website historically to support that claim. Those numbers were also presented to DoT. In addition, the NYPD states that there are no changes in traffic congestion despite issuing summonses. It is unclear what new outreach programs DoT will be using for motorists, cyclists or pedestrians on Dyckman Street this time around. The proposed outreach for merchants does not specify what effect these short term changes may have on businesses in terms of loss customer base and revenue, or how long will it take for DoT to act affirmatively for the more aggressive design changes.*

## **II. DoT Proposal for Long Term Changes and Board Comments:**

DoT proposed to keep the two-way parking protected bike lanes, better community engagement and education and requests more time, until the fall of 2018, to monitor and evaluate the effects of the proposed immediate changes

***Note:** There is no guarantee that any of the proposed changes will work, and this proposal fails to take into account the necessity for rapid response and continuous street access for emergency service vehicles and ignores the fact that NYC DOT has been studied the Dyckman Street corridor for over ten years; and*

**Whereas:** There is no material evidence that the bulk of these changes will have a significant effect on traffic congestion for emergency vehicles used by the FDNY, EMS, NYPD, or DHS for which every second counts in an emergency situation, and this raises a serious concern for public safety, with no real time data to justify having two one-way bike lanes located on the north and south sides of Dyckman Street rather than some other east/west route in this narrowest of sections of Manhattan; and

**Whereas:** These concerns call for immediate action; now, therefore be it

**Resolved:** CB12M recommends that action be taken to offer immediate temporary relief, while a long-term evidence-based solution is identified for implementation; and be it further

**Resolved:** Community Board 12, Manhattan recommends the immediate removal of the protected bike lane on the south side of Dyckman Street between Nagle Avenue and Broadway and the change of the one-way lane on the north side of Dyckman between Nagle Avenue and Broadway to a two-way bike lane along with removal of related road markings and signage to effect this new pattern, and to implement these changes by June 30, 2018; and be it further

**Resolved:** CB12M requests that the New York City Department of Transportation conduct a long term review of actual, real-time vehicle, bicycle, and pedestrian usage counts in this complex and complicated corridor and report back to the CB12M's Traffic & Transportation Committee in September, 2018 with a better design based on material evidence rather than on modeling, including analyses of both traffic and accident data and business/sales surveys, and ensure that all data and details are made available for public review at that time other than through a synopsisized PowerPoint© presentation; and be it further


**Resolved:** CB12M recommends the installation of two DoT Real Time Cameras with public access 24/7 traffic video cameras (ten are already present in the district) be installed at the intersections of Dyckman Street with Broadway and Nagle Avenue to monitor pedestrian, motor vehicle, and bicycle traffic to allow a more fact-based and transparent analysis of the current conditions and the likely effects of proposed solutions; and be it further

**Resolved:** CB12M urges the placement and use of more traffic agents for this corridor both to manage double-parking and the flow of traffic on Dyckman Street especially at its various intersections, as well as the use of NYPD's Traffic Stat to confirm traffic collisions, injury and enforcement data (similar to how CompStat is used) and reports from the 34<sup>th</sup> Precinct and NYS Department of Motor Vehicles to determine contributing factors for traffic accidents; and be it further

**Resolved:** CB12M recommends that DoT work with the community and elected officials, including business owners, residents, cyclists, and other stakeholders, to explore new ideas and search for a safe and viable alternative east/west bike passage, particularly looking at W. 204<sup>th</sup> St., and report back to CB12M in the September 2018; and finally be it

**Resolved:** CB12M calls on the City Council, the State Legislature and the federal government to provide sufficient funding for such traffic and transportation infrastructure improvements along the Dyckman Street corridor.

Sincerely,

  
Shahabuddeen A. Ally, Esq.  
Chairperson

cc: Hon. James P. O'Neill, Commissioner, NYPD  
Hon. Daniel A. Nigro, Commissioner, FDNY  
Hon. Luis Sanchez, Manhattan Borough Commissioner NYC DOT  
Hon. Bill de Blasio, Mayor  
Hon. Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President  
Hon. Letitia James, Public Advocate  
Hon. Scott M. Stringer, Comptroller  
Hon. Adriano Espaillat, Congressman  
Hon. Brian Benjamin, State Senator  
Hon. Marisol Alcantara, State Senator

Hon. Alfred Taylor, Assembly Member  
Hon. Carmen De La Rosa, Assembly Member  
Hon. Ydanis Rodriguez, Council Member  
Hon. Mark Levine, Council Member  
Hon. Aldrin R. Bonilla, Deputy MBP  
Hon. Michael Pilecki, CO Traffic Enforcement District  
Hon. Thomas Chan, Chief of Transportation  
Hon. John Dudley, Chief/FDNY Battalion 13  
Hon. Chiefs at Battalion 13 - FDNY  
Hon. Gypsy Pichardo, Sgt/NYPD