

Community Board 12, Manhattan
530 West 166th St., New York, NY
DRAFT Executive Committee Minutes (11/21/16)

Board Members Present: Shahabuddeen Ally, Chair; Isaiah “Obie” Bing, Second Vice Chair; Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Secretary, and Chair, Parks & Cultural Affairs; Betty Lehmann, Assistant Secretary; Maurice Owen-Michaane, Chair, Business Development; Richard Allman, Chair, LGBTQ Task Force, Nominating Committee; Steve Simon, Chair, Health & Environment; Ayisha Ogilvie, Chair, IT Task Force and Chair, Housing & Human Services; Wayne Benjamin, Chair, Land Use; Arlene Schulman, Chair, Public Safety; Jim Berlin, Parliamentarian and member, Traffic & Transportation; Gerard Dengel, member, Licensing; Richard Lewis, member, Public Safety; Ebenezer Smith, District Manager. **Absent:** Yahaira Alonzo, Chair, Traffic & Transportation; Aldemar Diaz, Chair, Licensing, Fe Florimón, Chair, Youth & Education; Liliana Saneaux, Chair, Aging. **Excused:** Pamela Palanque-North, First Vice Chair.

A quorum being present, the meeting was called to order at 7:15pm.

7:25pm **Chair’s Report, Shahabuddeen Ally:**

- Note that this evening’s agenda includes voting on 18 Licensing Committee resos, as well as one from the Land Use Committee and two from the Traffic & Transportation Committee, all of which were not voted on by the full Board at our October meeting due to lack of quorum. Our bylaws provide for the reso to be voted upon at the subsequent Executive Committee meeting, and then for the full Board to consider a resolution at its subsequent meeting to ratify the actions taken by the Executive Committee.
- Discussing w/ GWB Bus Station developer to come to CB12 meeting to discuss progress of project and explain delays. Many local small businesses are ready to take their places, but the project is delayed. Date TBD, but likely to be Dec. 5th, which is Traffic & Transportation Committee meeting. Q: (Jim) why not have it go through Economic Development Committee? A: That would be appropriate, but depends more on the developer’s availability. Q: (Wayne) Will PANYNJ be attending? No: they declined. Might have to do w/ lawsuit between the two. Jim: PANYNJ has a history of coming to one meeting, making a lot of promises and then not following up. Richard L.: PANYNJ representative used to attend District Services Cabinet meeting; when did they last attend? Ebenezer: earlier this year or late last year.
- At Borough Board, NYC Commissioner of Media & Entertainment (formerly Film, Theatre & Broadcasting) Julie Menin spoke regarding filming permits. Their office has a 6-month hiatus list if a community feels that an area is over-saturated. Shah will get a list of criteria, as well as a listing of permits that have been within CD12.
- Noted that a recent filming company in the District asked about local non-profits to which they might give a donation. CB12 is not in the position of accepting funds, but gave a list of several small non-profits to which a small donation would make a big impact. The film company gave \$750 to the W. 181st Street Beautification Project, which was much-appreciated.

7:35pm **District Manager’s Report, Ebenezer Smith:**

- Rankings for FY’18 capital and expense item have been sent to OMB, and distributed to all CB members.
- Columbia University still has yet to pay Catholic Charities for the rent on CB12’s offices in the Alianza Building. Still working through that w/ CU, Catholic Charities, and OMB.
- Office has been rearranged somewhat to accommodate a larger meeting space for committees and other public events when the conference room is being used.
- DM will be taking vacation beginning Friday, 11/25, returning Monday, 12/12.

7:45pm **Consideration of Holdover Resolutions from October General Meeting:**

- Sidewalk café for Pat’e Palo (251 Dyckman St., btw. Seaman/Payson), which CB12 opposed previously, along with opposition to OPL and change of business applications, all within the past 12-months. The Chair read into the record a strongly worded letter of opposition from the Board of the cooperative apartment at 1825 Riverside Drive, as a representation of the many letters received and testimony given at the October General Meeting.

- There was a discussion of the proposed moratorium, i.e., are we bound by it? Legally we are not, since it was just proposed legislation which has not been enacted into law, but the Board did unanimously support the idea of a moratorium and the proposed legislation. While not binding, we should be consistent. Maurice: the people of Dyckman Street and elsewhere in Inwood are under siege. Steve: we should support resident and come to an agreement as a Board on the boundaries of the moratorium; should be River-to-River from Dyckman St., north. Wayne: Community Boards can have moratoria irrespective of what elected do there is a rational basis for rejecting new licenses based on saturation and community complaints. There was also a brief discussion to clarify what constitutes “new”, i.e., adding a partner or removing a partner for a license that does not extend the expiration date is not new. A different set of owners of an establishment in the same place even under the same name is new.
- Ayisha: we need better institutional memory on the Licensing Committee, and should have the records of prior votes available at the meetings; we should be consistent. Richard L.: There are many issues regarding soundproofing, certified sound engineers, etc. Gerard: we need to streamline the process. The technology is easy, but there’s a lot of information.
- Richard L.: motion to amend reso #15 (Pat’E Palo) to add “...based on the spirit of community concerns, oversaturation and non-compliance of agreed-upon stipulations...” and include specifics regarding 3 prior CB12 resos opposing their sidewalk café, new OPL, and change of method of operation in lieu of current language (“...based on a long history...”) and change the reso to a negative one (i.e., opposing the granting of the license). Second by Liz; approved unanimously (12 votes in favor).
- Steve: motion to amend reso #10 (Casa del Mofongo, 546 W. 207th St. @ Sherman) to reflect that it’s in the moratorium area was accepted as friendly.
- Shah moved that for the December meeting any positive resolution that failed would become a negative resolution which passed, and the obverse, i.e., a negative resolution that failed would become a negative one which passed. This is the same motion that has been made at the general meeting for the last several meetings. It was further suggested that this item be incorporated going forward as “Item #0” to all agendas which include Licensing matters. There were multiple seconds, no discussion, and no objections. (12 votes in favor)

8:25pm **Committee Reports:**

8:25pm **Land Use, Wayne Benjamin, Chair:** Reso reaffirming prior CB12M reso opposing multiple BSA zoning variances to facilitate the development of a proposed 16- mixed-use building at 4452 Broadway. There is no benefit to the community offered in exchange for the variance. Richard L.: HAP (an investment company) has a long history of investing in luxury and market-rate housing. Liz: spoke in support of reso, which shows context and a consistent position regarding height and development generally.

8:35pm **Jim Berlin for Traffic & Transportation Committee: I**

- Change signage in front of Isabella from “No Parking” to “No Standing” to reduce parking in front of the Center, to facilitate deliveries and pick-ups, and reduce traffic/congestion in front of the Center.
- Reso opposing turning Bx6 into Select Bus Service (SBS) as it will negatively impact local users. Unacceptable to reduce frequency or to preclude local users from using all Bc6 buses, i.e., the SBS is for the benefit of the Bronx portion of the route, but many WH users use just the WH portion of the route, where SBS is not so necessary. Liz noted that the data show that SBS would be useful in speeding up the route generally, and that this is good for all route users. Jim moved that the reso be amended to become a positive reso with the following conditions: SMS limited to the Bronx portion of the route; local service in the Manhattan portion of the route remain the same (i.e., not less frequent); there be a mechanism to transfer from the local to the SBS route. Second by Liz; no objection (12 in favor).

8:40pm **Shahabuddeen Ally for the Executive Committee:** Proposed a resolution that would codify into CB12 action the intent of the reso passed unanimously last year which called on a legislative moratorium of new OPL Licenses in Inwood, i.e., to reject any new OPL applications in a defined geographic area. Seconded by Liz. Discussion: zone would be Dyckman St., north, from River to River, and south of Dyckman to Hillside/Nagle, east

of Broadway, during the period 1/1-12/31/17. Richard L.: can we legally do this? Liz: why not? We're an advisory body, advising the SLA that we would like a pause on any new OPLs issued in this area due to oversaturation.
 9:10pm **Voting on resolutions** (15 Licensing, 1 Land Use, 2 Traffic & Transportation, 1 Executive) (Note: these votes reflect 13 people voting, Arlene Schulman having arrived.)

1.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal OPL License to Hudson Fulton Corp., d/b/a Indian Road Café & Market (600 W. 218 th St. @ Indian Road)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
2.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal OPL License to Saggio (829 W. 181 st St. btw. Cabrini/Pinehurst)	11-1-0-1	<i>passed</i>
3.	Licensing Committee resolution to not recommend the SLA grant a renewal OPL License to Trio's Café & Lounge d/b/a Arka Lounge (4488 Broadway @ W. 192 nd St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
4.	Licensing Committee resolution to not recommend the SLA grant a renewal OPL License to Di'Vino Lounge, d/b/a Nitro Lounge (565 W. 207 th St. btw. Vermilyea/Sherman)	13-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>
5.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal OPL License to Punto de Sabor (1464 St. Nicholas Ave. btw W. 183 rd /W. 184 th St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
6.	Licensing Committee resolution to not recommend the SLA grant a renewal Tavern Wine License to Villas Lounge @ (130-132 Audubon Ave., @ W. 172)	13-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>
7.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Restaurant Wine License to Ceci Restaurant (78 Sherman Ave., btw. Thayer/Dyckman)	9-3-1-0	<i>passed</i>
8.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Tavern Wine License to La Minta Restaurant (3855 10 th Ave. @ W. 206 th St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
9.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Eating Place Beer License to Teddy's Variety, d/b/a Elsa La Reina del Chicharron (4840 Broadway @ Academy St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
10.	Licensing Committee resolution to not recommend the SLA grant a new OPL License to La Case del Mofongo (546 W. 207 th St. @ Sherman Ave.)	13-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>
11.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a new Restaurant Wine License to El Anicia de Puerto Plata Restaurant (142 Nagle Ave. @ Thayer St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
12.	Licensing Committee resolution to not recommend the SLA grant a new Restaurant Wine License to 4986 Cocina Latina Restaurant (4986 Broadway @ W. 211 th St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
13.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a new Restaurant Wine License to 231 El Valle Seafood Corp., d/b/a El Valle Restaurant (231 Sherman Ave. @ 207 th St.)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
14.	Licensing Committee resolution to recommend the SLA grant a new Eating Place Beer License to El Fuerte Deli (582 W. 207 th St. @ Vermilyea)	12-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
15.	Licensing Committee resolution to not recommend the NYC Department of City Planning grant a new Enclosed Sidewalk Café License to Vida Enterprises, Inc., d/b/a Pat'E Palo (251 Dyckman St., btw Payson/Seaman)	12-0-1-0	<i>passed</i>
16.	Land Use Committee resolution opposing a BSA zoning variance for a 16-story mixed use building at 4452 Broadway	13-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>
17.	Traffic & Transportation Committee resolution conditionally approving the addition of SBS to a portion of the Bx6 route	13-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>
18.	Traffic & Transportation Committee resolution approving signage change in front of Isabella Geriatric Center from "No Parking" to "No Standing"	12-0-0-1	<i>passed</i>
21.	Moratorium on new OPL Licenses in Inwood, 1/1-12/31/17	13-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>

9:15pm **Richard Allman, Chair, Nominating Committee**

- Reviewed attendance. 29 members were eligible to run. (8 or 9 didn't make the cut due to attendance; new members and members of the Nominating Committee also are ineligible.)

- There are candidates for 4 offices, but none for Treasurer or Assistant Secretary.
- Noted that recordkeeping at the office for attendance is generally poor – there are inconsistencies and gaps in records, and no single source of attendance across membership for all committees.
- Liz noted that it is the job of the Secretary to monitor attendance and she has compiled this information based on records given to her by the office, though sign-in sheets for the past 3 months of Committee meetings have not been received.
- Richard L. suggested that this attendance information be included on the website, and that it be compiled into a .pdf or other non-editable document and shared with the membership.

9:30pm **Arlene Schulman, Chair, Public Safety:**

- November meeting included a report from Board member Javier Trejo who also is a Principal at GWHS on law enforcement in schools and NYPD relations.
- Joint meeting between Public Safety and Parks/Cultural Affairs is scheduled for April, rather than May, to give more time to plan for summer enforcement.
- December meeting will be on fire safety and public safety around the holidays (e.g., candles/lights, scams, carrying cash, carrying packages, ID theft from increased online shopping, etc.)
- Ayisha noted that the Youth & Education Committee is planning to have a meeting w/ NYPD on policing for 14-25 year-olds and suggested to collaborate w/ Public Safety Committee; Arlene asked that Fe (the Youth/Ed Chair) be in touch.

9:35pm **Steve Simon, Chair, Health & Environment Committee:**

- Last meeting had a presentation from the Northern Manhattan Improvement Corporation on their new mental health programming, Connections to Care, a 3-year program funded primarily by NYC through its new mental health initiative, with some federal dollars.
- Street cleanliness is still above 90% threshold, so Alternate Side Parking reduction (1x/week) will remain.
- A ConEd Engineer will attend in December to discuss utility infrastructure issues.
- The PANYNJ will be installing a suicide fence as part of their long-term renovation of the GWB, but this won't be until 2020. There has been some discussion of doing something temporary, sooner. It looks like the PANYNJ might be responsive to public outcry on this issue.

9:42pm **Youth & Education:** In the absence of Committee Chair Fe Florimon, Shah announced an upcoming joint holiday gathering of the Committee and the District 6 Community Education Council, of which Fe also is Chair.

9:43pm **Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Chair, Parks & Cultural Affairs Committee:** There were a number of outstanding questions/issues based on the recent Parks Department presentation of plans for the Inwood Hill Park/Dyckman Street Green Gym, so that will be re-presented in December, with a resolution to come before the Board in December. The December meeting will also include a presentation of the long-awaited IHP Nature Center renovation, the Center having been heavily damaged by Superstorm Sandy, and the funding for the renovation of which had been delayed due to issues with FEMA. Also announced several upcoming cultural events, and an 11/28 visioning session w/ Parks Dept. for the \$30m investment in Highbridge Park.

9:45pm **Ayisha Ogilve, Chair, Housing & Human Services Committee:**

- Productive and free-flowing meeting, discussing the worst landlords list, Air B&B, apartment warehousing, and more. There was a vigorous discussion of warehousing, what exactly this entails, and what is the applicable law in this area.
- Next month reso (joint w/ T&T) on ½-price Metrocards for low-income New Yorkers (~800k people).
- Re: HDFCs, we are still waiting to hear from the Harlem group which presented last month.

9:58pm **The Chair entertained a motion to adjourn**, which received multiple seconds, and passed by acclamation.

