



Community Board 12, Manhattan

530 West 166th St., 6-A – New York, NY
10032 Phone (212) 568-8500 Fax (212) 740-8197

HOUSING AND HUMAN SERVICES COMMITTEE MINUTES

Thursday, September 8, 2022

YouTube: [Housing and Human Services Committee September 8, 2022 Meeting](https://youtu.be/G0WYUMROEaY)

<https://youtu.be/G0WYUMROEaY>

Member Attendance: Emily Marte, Marshall Vanderpool, Michelle Lee, Richard Allman, Jay Baez, Bruce Robertson

Other attendees: Daryl Cochrane, Mary Anderson, Randall Toure -RiseBoro

1. Call to Order

- Pardon the “Welcome to the Housing and Housing and ‘Health’ Services” statement
- Started conversation at 7:07 PM on September 08, 2022

2. Welcome & Introductions

- Daryl Cochrane: Good evening, Happy fall, end of summer. Happy to be back
- Bruce Robertson: From Downtown Washington Heights. I have been on this committee for a couple of years now and look forward to another year of action-packed fun and games. Thank you.
- Jay Baez: I am a new Community Board Appointee. Lived in Washington Heights my entire life.
- Randall Toure: From RiseBoro, I am not a Board member, but I am here to talk about the RiseBoro project.
- Michelle Lee: I am a member of Housing and Human Services, this is my second year on the committee. Excited to be back and looking forward to it.
- Mary Anderson: Board member for several years and I am chair of the committee for concerns of the Aging. I had a question for the Housing Committee that came up in our meeting this morning. So, I joined this meeting hoping to get an answer to the question to report back to my other folks.
- Marshall Vanderpool: 1st Vice-President of the Dyckman Association. I have been a member of the HHS Committee for 10 years now.

3. 37 Hillside Avenue Extended Hours Request

- Members did not receive agenda

Presentation by RiseBoro

- Randall: Many of you know that RiseBoro has a project at 37 Hillside in the process of being constructed, an affordable senior building, 167 units.
- Request: We would like to request from this Committee Saturday hours
- We have come to the committee and board before and requested the same thing. The HHS Committee said yes but Community Board 12 said no.
- We decided to come back and request again

- This is an affordable Housing project. It has been a little bit costly for us because of certain site conditions that have cause us to be slightly delayed in construction
- With the Saturday hours it will allow us to basically cut the time for construction
- We anticipate that if we get Saturday hours, we could cut construction time about 1.5 – 2.5 months. Our Goal is to cut construction time, get building up and running, and make the project less of a burden for the community. We recognize that construction is a burden for the community.
- We look at starting around 8am going to mid afternoon. We know that this CB has approved Saturday hours in the past...I see hands up so I am willing to take any questions.

Questions and Conversation

- Michelle: Hi Randall, it's nice to see you again...for the record I have been participating in some meetings with Randall, RiseBoro and also the tenants of 2535 Hillside, which is the neighboring apartment complex and Randall, I know that we are working on the communication between RiseBoro and the tenants in that complex — *have you brought this up with them? That you will be making this request to the community board and what are their opinions of it so far, If so?*
- Randall: Well, I don't want to speak if Michael Wolfe is on the call because I don't want to speak for them. I know we had an issue in the past related to making claims that ... I just don't want to do.
 - We informed Michael and the tenants that this was a request that we were going to make, and I have no idea what their feelings are so I prefer Michael to answer this question.
 - Our goal is to be open with our neighbors as we have been and to be responsive if there are any problems.
 - Our goal is to shorten construction period. There is a need for affordable housing for seniors. Those that do not have a 401K or a pension, they need affordable housing to remain in NYC.
 - Also, we are working with the Rocky Mountain Church so there is a Two-fold here because we are also trying to relocate them back into the projects. I will let Michael answer
- Michael: This particular issue has a tortured history. Before it was presented to the committee, Adam Zeidel , the project manager, made presentation to vouch how we had responded to the expansion of hours when we never heard there would be one. When it was brought to the CB12, we had 4 days' notice.
- Daryl: Lets focus on today's meeting. The Committee voted to extend the hours and the board did not
- Michael: We met with RiseBoro, and they apologized.
 - They also said there wouldn't be an expansion of hours and then 60 days later there is an expansion of hours again.
 - I represent the Tenant's association and we are unilaterally opposed to the expansion of hours. We have had enough with the noise (5 days a week) but we are for the project. We are opposed to RiseBoro's proposal for 6 days a week. There is not a single tenant who has agreed to an expansion of hours/days.
 - I believe that it will shorten the time of the project, but I also believe that there hasn't been a single deadline that has been met. There is no trust in your estimation of deadlines. When is the project estimated to be completed?
- Randall: Sometime in the Summer of 2022. Ryan Cassidy can answer to that better.
- Michael: You said Summer of 2023
- Randall: You are right.
 - As you know, there were significant site conditions with rocks and boulders being found that created delays in the timeline which has been financially devastating. We are nonprofit for an affordable housing project. We are not

- trying to make a lot of money for this.
 - The longer the delay, the harder it is for the project which is why we need Saturday hours.
 - We would not do Saturday for exterior work but once we got to the interior work. We do not want to create undo noise. We do not want more market rate developers in the neighborhoods, it is an affordable housing project by a nonprofit.
- Michael: Ultimately, the tenants oppose the Saturday hours but support the project. We simply do not trust your timelines or estimates.
- Bruce: *Can you be more specific about what you mean with "interior work" and how much noise it might intel and if there will be noise sensors on the site? If you can promise that, then it won't be noisy. How do you rectify the noisiness?*
- Ryan Cassidy: (Director of Construction at RiseBoro) We wanted to get going in the Spring with the interior work, it would be everything – framing drywall, electrical roughing, plumbing roughing so any interior work. We are 95% complete with the subgrade work and the excavation and vibration. We are 100% with piles which were the main cause of noise and the vibration. The interior work will be in the spring (of 2023)
- Bruce: *Why do you need Saturday hours now?*
- Ryan: The hours if granted would be for makeup days on concrete or the superstructure of the building and then interior work in the spring.
- Bruce: interior work concrete is not interior you're talking about Saturday pouring concrete that's a big truck sitting outside.
- Ryan: You are right, but the interior work is the roughing and framing and some of that is already ongoing
- Bruce: *But are you asking for the Saturday hours now or Saturday hours in the Spring?*
- Ryan: Yeah, I think the request is for now and there is already some interior work that's available... that work is going to greatly increase over time by the spring it's going to be you know a lot of all the apartments
- Daryl: What I would be comfortable with is if the tenants were able to experience inside work for a few weeks or a month before coming to the committee to ask for an extension so they could see how comfortable they are with it if its noisy.
- Ryan: The interior work has already been happening in a limited way but the full state of it will sound like, we will be there in 30 days so maybe mid-October. But I said the Springtime because the exterior skin of the building will be done too and that's going to be additional sound dampening so it'll be quieter work. We can revisit in about a month which is when it will be "bigger" interior work going on the floor plate
- Daryl: *If you are doing external and interior work 5 days a week, folks won't know what interior work, alone, sounds like until the exterior is done, right?*
- Ryan: Correct.
- Jay: A few questions. I know it's an affordable housing unit – *are you receiving any subsidies for the development of the affordable housing project? And who?*
- Ryan and Randall: Yes, the Project is subsidized by HPD through the SARA program (the senior program).
- Jay: 2nd, you said the cost of the project is getting expensive because of the time frame changing – *what was the original estimated cost of the project versus what it is costing now VERSUS what is the difference if we expand your hours?*
- Ryan: The difference is a lot because you end up adding time to the end of the project; the construction interest would be at its maximum at that point.
 - It's a heavier lift at the end of the project because if the time length is expanded you get far more construction interest at the end compared to the beginning of the project. The project started out at 55 million dollars. There is contingency money available (which we used up).

- The additional risk of time is a threat to the success of the project.
- Jay: You did not answer my question. And I didn't get materials about this project either. *What are your current hours and what are the extended hours you need?*
- Ryan: 55 million+ contingency money is 4.5-5 million. We are over 60 now. I don't have the exact calculation of how much it will cost each month. It's a big number. I do not know the interest rate off the top of my head.
- Randall: The goal is to have most of the Saturday work being done, interior work but some exterior work with be insulation and some concrete.
 - We are just asking for the additional time to cut the timeline for the project from being done in Fall 2023. I can send you the finances, Jay.
- Ryan: The request for hours is 8 AM – 4 PM and the current hours are as for the DOB permits (7 AM – 4 PM... Monday- Friday)
- Mary Anderson: *Most of the discussion is about noise but I would like to know if it is accessible- ADA standards?*
- Randall: Absolutely.
- Ayisha: I was told that you approached the Land Use Committee first. They asked what the community engagement has been like. *Have you gone to Land Use Committee Since the Board voted it down? Is there additional information that I am missing that has changed?* I don't see anything about this since March.
- Randall: The construction timeline, I am unaware that I did not provide it to the group. I was told that Land Use Committee was on a break which is why we came here to Housing. Around June we did an update on the project at that time. We gave an overview of the project and where we were at and now, we are asking for extended hours. We were referred to this committee.
- Ayisha: I am concerned with the community. *I am curious- this is a second attempt but has the concerns that the full board brought up, have they been documented?*
 - The concerns were not only related to noise or the neighbors. All of the items on the list of concerns should be addressed if we will be re-entertaining this.
- Randall: One of the concerns that has been looked at is having conversations with the neighbors. Tenants are not for this bit we still maintained outreach. Our Goal is to continue to engage even after this meeting and after the project is done. We are going to be the developers and operators of the senior facility. We will continue to engage.
- Michael: There was no outreach from RiseBoro or Coconut Properties(?) To us. We reached out to them. I keep an eye on the permits. I noticed this permit, reached out to Adam Zeidal. Not sure if you reached out to the properties in the perimeter.
- Keith (public): Resident of neighborhood for 12 years.
 - On June 8th, the property was fined by Buildings for digging contrary to plan.
 - There have been other noise complaints but I don't think they've received any violations
 - I spoke to inspector on August 25 about machinery that was screaming that wasn't supposed to be (used for concrete)
 - This is what we live with on a daily basis
 - It is not taken into consideration that there are 2 other projects on hillside, any day now, (Nagle and Broadway and another one on the opposite towards Dyckman Ave) – this neighborhood deals with major noise violence especially in the last several years and we are just now starting to get used to some quiet days
 - We have people who are first responders, teachers, work odd hours and we don't get a break from the construction – adding weekend hours would be horrific. I work from home and I face it- it is extremely difficult.
 - Daryl's idea for reviewing the inside work is great but RiseBoro hasn't been completely straight here- construction does not happen in a vacuum
 - If I were them, in those 30 days in October where they will evaluate, I would

- have workers focus on internal work on the easternmost portion of the building so that they are farther away from 35 Hillside for a couple of weeks but that doesn't deal with fact that large trucks starting at 8am on Saturday with the beeping and the materials – it doesn't happen in a vacuum
 - Ultimately, there is not a lot of contact. I told Michelle that they have a little sign (to inform us) by where people really don't because of construction and cocaine dealers and cadres... there is nobody here that is for the expansion of hours. We deserve to have weekends to self
- Bruce: There are construction materials being delivered on trucks on Saturdays?
- Keith: No but
 - I do want to mention that there was an incident where the hours were supposed to be starting at 7am but they were starting 6am where there had to be interference by an agency to stop the violation of hours.
 - There will still be noise, and this does not happen in a vacuum. Its not possible to not hear construction right outside our windows.
 - It's not our faults that RiseBoro got caught between deadlines and budget problems. They should have planned better from the beginning.
- Maria Viera (RiseBoro): I hear you and I understand what you said, it is not the tenant's fault. The fact is that materials have not been coming in in a timely fashion as well as many other difficulties and challenges from not anticipating a pandemic that have caused a delay in delivery and access to materials that are needed.
 - It would be great to not endure construction on a weekend, but because of these unanticipated factors, like most other construction you only have estimated timelines and can't give a firm date
 - Without extended hours, if project is prolonged, it'll be prolonged further
 - You will have to endure it longer on weekdays for longer, regardless. It will shorten the timeline and alleviate burden on residents more.
 - Michael responded that they understand how the math works and tenants still want their weekends.
- Ayisha: Concurred with what Michael said about the noise/disruption being beyond the hours of work due to preparation and truck arrivals. She worked from home and also found it disruptive.
 - Giving residents relief of their weekends is fair – she does not understand why this is still being requested again.
 - I am not hearing or seeing anything new or about the asks that were put on the table previously by this committee and the board. You are just asking again without being responsive and professional to previous meeting's asks
 - You are repeating previous statements.
- Daryl: Looked back at December minutes and the end date stated was supposed to be the end of the second quarter of 2023 – June 30th.
 - The new predicted end date is Fall of 2023 is a lot more with extended hours. Is this project going to end of 2023-January 2024 without the hours?
 - We can revisit this when you are strictly in internal construction and external is done.
- Jay: If your request is to get extended hours on Saturdays from 8 AM -4 PM to do interior work... *is that what is being requested?*
- Randall: There will be some outside work, the bulk of the work will be interior. It won't be completely interior.
- Jay: *Does insulation require heavy machinery that will be noisy? Drilling? For the interior work, will there be heavy machinery used that is noisy?*
 - I understand tenants and nonprofit efforts, I don't believe noise complaints from tenants if there is responsive communication between tenants and RiseBoro. If tenants' association are Okay with it for a month then they can continue their work.

- Randall: No, insulation foam is poured outside of building for the exterior work that can be done in the weekends.
 - For the interior work I don't want to say 100% No but it won't be very loud.
 - We cannot do Saturday hours (testing for a month) without the Buildings department approval
- Ayisha: Motion- that everything that is being asked for be requested in document form. Let's not paraphrased. We need the concerns that were asked for previously in document form.
- Randall: Let's clarify what it is exactly that you need from us.
- Ayisha: The answers to the questions and concerns we previously stated when RiseBoro came before us- we need to find out what exactly they were (committee and general Community Board)
- Emily: *Do you have the concerns and questions that were asked of you when your request was turned down?*
- Randall: I don't have it, the person that presented it probably does. We can give you financing information, the timeline information, and the engagement of the residents. We can give more concrete information on the specific work that can be done on Saturdays of these extended hours. We just want to get this project done as quickly as possible.
- Daryl: We have a liaison, Michelle, between the groups. The forms and hours (is noon to 4PM be allowed).
- Randall: The permit allows, earliest, 7 AM and past 8 AM is too much.
- Richard Allman: When Ayisha spoke, I did not hear a motion, just strong commentary.
 - *I am going to offer the motion to table consideration of this issue pending receipt pending availability of requested information be tabled to the call of the chair.*
 - My comment is that i hope that that's at the next meeting
- Ayisha: Seconds the motion.
- Daryl: Votes on the motion.
 - Yes: 8
 - No: 0
- Randall: *Is someone from your side going to give us the complete list of requested information?*
 - Michelle will get minutes information from past meetings about the requests and will be the point person to forward suggestions and questions about the matter.
- Ayisha: Procedural request. I am not going to be bullied in this meeting.
 - When there are interruptions while someone is speaking, makes it an antagonistic environment
- **Summary of asks from RiseBoro:**
 - Construction Timeline- taking into consideration delays
 - Financing Details
 - Transparency of the progress of the project
 - Concrete information on what will be done in the project (interior, exterior work technicalities
 - Addressing the initial concerns and asks from when the Community Board turned down previous requestion of extension of hours
 - Resident engagement of neighbors

4. Old Business

- Fort Washington Armory: Are we in the process of planning the public hearing and we asked for additions for that since we have a change of the guards.

- No word on the public hearing, from DHS, or about the licensing documents
- Agency should show up more not only for army issue but for buildings
- Buildings
 - One has been put on the distress list
 - Attorney general's office visited because of level of disregard that the landlord has for 2 properties. This is under watch of HHS committee, and they should be present in our meetings, our cabinet meeting
 - Follow up with Chair of the Community Board 12
 - Can we get minutes to see if DHS was there?
 - Elected Officials were informed, Ebenezer would know.
 - 705 West 170th Street and 709 West 170th Street to communicate to HPD
- Resource Directory and Fair
 - Manhattan Borough President's Office put us on hold for it
 - One Standardized Resource Directory for Community Boards in Manhattan.
 - We have a PDF document on our website and regularly update it which is separate from a resolution of a having a robust database website that encompasses all community boards, self-navigate, what applies to them in their area...etc.
 - Had a conversation with the Chief Technology Officer, spoke about the matter- his office would be the one in charge of moving that resolution along and execute on vision.
 - Our Resource Directory was updated in March of this year.
 - We should wait to hear from MBP Office.
 - It is 2 separate conversations regarding the PDF and the digital version
 - We still need to have something printed for those who are not technologically savvy.
 - Air Table is a software that is used by Community Board 11.

5. New Business

- Budget Prioritization- will send it via email to review this past year's document for committee members.
- Updates about going back in person

6. Adjournment

- Meeting ended at 9:00 PM