

Community Board 12, Manhattan
General Meeting – October 27, 2009 – Isabella Geriatric Center (515 Audubon Ave.)

PRESENT

Jackie Rowe Adams	Rolando Cespedes	Maria Luna	Edith Prentiss
Richard Allman	Martin Collins	Glenda Swanson Massa	George Nelson Preston
Rev. Antonio Almonte	George Cruz	Rita McKee	Zead Ramadan
Juan Carlos Alonzo	George Espinal	Helen Morik	Andria Reyes
Anita Barberis	George Fernandez	Jasmine Moy	Steve Simon
Wayne Benjamin	Nicole Foster	Edgard Nau	Manny Velazquez
James Berlin	David Ernst Kach	Pam Palanque North	Joe Wojak
Isaiah Bing	Rabbi Yosef Kalinsky	Cheryl Pahaham	
Emilia Cardona	Mark Levine	Elizabeth Pepin	
Cynthia Carrión	Elizabeth Lorris Ritter	Audrey Perez	

EXCUSED

Dora Maria Abreu
 Tony Lopez
 Tammy Rivera
 Melanie Hidalgo
 Gloria Vanterpool

ABSENT

Leonardo Blackman
 Julissa Gomez
 Albania Lopez Jimenez
 Carole Mulligan
 Ruddy Santana
 Ninoska Uribe

The Chair, Manny Velazquez, **called the meeting to order** at 7:05pm; absent a quorum. There was a brief discussion regarding the agenda, with Cheryl Pahaham suggesting to move the Economic Development Committee report (and related resolutions, of which there were 21) to the end of the Committee reports. Mr. Velazquez gave his **Chair's report**:

- Introduction & welcome to new member, Joe Wojak.
- Encouraged all to attend all Committee and other required meetings to aid in the work of the Board.
- Thanked the Retreat Committee – Pamela Palanque North (Chair), Obie Bing, Cynthia Carrión, George Fernandez, Nicole Foster, Yosef Kalinsky, Glenda Swanson Massa, Helen Morik, Gloria Vanterpool – who just joined the meeting having concluded an organizing meeting.
- Appointed a Nominating Committee: Glenda Swanson Massa, Chair; George Fernandez; Elizabeth Lorris Ritter; Audrey Perez, Gloria Vanterpool. The Committee will inform the Board at its November meeting of the slate of Officers for election December to one-year terms beginning in January.
- Highlighted several issues in his written report (attached) including youth violence and programming through the Harlem4 Center for Change; the importance of participating in the census for an accurate count; the street activities permit (SAP) application process (SAPO is no accepting applications online); youth scholarship opportunities; and upcoming venues for free 'flu shots.

Elected Officials' reports (7:15pm):

Herman D. "Denny" Farrell, Jr., NYS Assembly, 71st AD: The budget gap which had been \$2.1 billion is now projected to be at \$3 billion, and we will run out of cash in December. The Governor is proposing 10% cuts across the board (4%-5% for education). Spoke at length about traffic flow around W. 157th Street & Edward L. Morgan Place, citing a letter to DOT proposing specific changes in directionality and signage to enhance traffic flow and safety, and requested a that the Traffic & Transportation Committee initiate a supporting resolution from the Board.

Adriano Espallat, NYS Assembly, 70th AD (7:24pm): Echoed Assemblyman Farrell's comments regarding the budget. "We will have to take unpopular measures and spread the pain around." Noted that education and healthcare are 2/3 of the State's budget, so there will have to be cuts there. Announced upcoming events to get the word out regarding the census, and to advocate for a local census office. In 2000 we had a 66% response rate, 10% higher than the rest of the City, due in large part to the presence of a census office in the community. This time, there is no uptown office; we are pushing the Feds to open one; would like to see a resolution from the Board on this. Gave update on Nos Quedamos/Project Remain. Announced upcoming venues for free 'flu shots. Edith Prentiss clarified that the site is not ADA-accessible; Mr. Espallat responded that the venue would be moved.

With the achievement of a **quorum (7:29pm)**, George Espinal made a **motion to adopt the agenda** which was seconded by Emilia Cardona. Wayne Benjamin noted that one of the Land Use Committee's resolutions had been omitted from the agenda, though it was included in the packet. Ms. Pahaham did not propose that the order of the Committee reports (and related resolutions) be changed, but urged all to stay for the entire meeting so that there would be a quorum for all items. Ms. Cardona requested that everyone keep their comments brief and on-point, and that members not repeat points already made by previous speakers. There being no additional discussion, the motion passed by voice vote without objection. There were no minutes of the September meeting, the Secretary having been excused and the Assistant Secretary having been absent.

Ebenezer Smith gave the **District Manager's report (7:32pm)**, highlighted written report.

- BP's reception has been moved to December 3rd.
- Thanked Dr. North & Ms. Lorris Ritter for their assistance with the budget priorities.
- Announced addition of office help from high school students' internships through the City-as-School.
- Gave update of the Alexander Hamilton Bridge Reconstruction, which will include reconstruction of the Quisqueya playground at W. 180th & Amsterdam; Parks & cultural Affairs Committee to review.
- Announced a homicide earlier that morning outside of Casa de Mofongo on St. Nicholas Ave. & 183rd St. Few details at this time. Although this is a very unfortunate event, homicide is still very low in this precinct and the Board as compared to previous years.
- Reported on meetings with the 181st Street BID regarding excessive placement of flyers and posters along the BID corridor.

CBO Presenters:

WH/I Youth Council, Jennifer Beltre (President) & Eric Pichardo (VP) (7:42pm): Met with Congressman Rangel & Senator Gillibrand to discuss issues confronting youth in upper Manhattan. 10.2% of our teen girls are pregnant; 61% are single parents. (Mr. Pichardo bravely sported a pillow under his shirt to illustrate this point.) Trying to get a youth center by youth/for youth; we want it also to be attractive so that young people will want to attend programming there. Mr. Espinal, the group's founder: we are looking for capital funding for construction of a facility, hopefully

from the \$1.2 million set-aside for youth programming following the recent ConEd blackout. Announced upcoming events; go to www.whiyouth.org for more information. Distributed policy statement. Helen Morik: NYPH has teen pregnancy counseling programs.

Upper Manhattan Empowerment Zone (UMEZ), Hope Knight, COO (7:48pm): Spoke about Accion NY, an economic development organization funded by UMEZ. Acknowledged several current and former UMEZ board members, including Maria Luna, Dr. North and Zead Ramadan. East River Plaza – which will include a Costco, Target, Marshall's and Best Buy – will be opening 11/12. They are hiring on a rolling basis over the next four months. Also the Workforce Center has job opportunities. Rita McKee: is there any information on the GWB terminal project? A: No.

Elected Officials' & Representatives' reports <continued>

Ydanis Rodriguez, presumptive Councilmember, 10th CD (7:55pm): <Mr. Rodriguez, the winner of the Democratic primary, is running unopposed in the general election. Due to the current vacancy of the office, a special Charter provision allows him to take office as soon as the election is certified, rather than waiting until January 1st.> Spent a lot of time with the budget, looking at how to improve quality of life from river to river. Spoke about the importance of youth programming for all children regardless of race or income. Top priorities are youth, education and housing. We must work together. When I look at people to put on the Community Board, I will be looking for people who are committed and able to spend the time.

Wendy Garcia, for Manhattan Borough Scott Stringer (7:58pm): CB12 applications are now in process. Please complete reapplications if your term is expiring, and also help recruit other activists and community members who can commit to board service. Encouraged all to be honest with themselves in terms of their availability, and to not reapply if they are not able to spend the time. "Not having the time to serve on the Board doesn't mean you don't care about your community." Also reported on the "youth bucks" program: scrip for students to use on field trips to greenmarkets to learn more about healthful eating; this was recently highlighted in a NY1 segment. Gave details of recent town hall meeting attended by over 100 community residents.

Robert Jackson, Councilmember, 7th CD (8:05pm): Commented on the budget: how are we going to get through this recession when the State is cutting back, CBOs are not making payroll and everyone has to do more with less? We need to raise revenues to provide services, but people cannot afford the burden of increased taxes, especially property taxes, which is the only one that the City controls. There already are many foreclosures in central Brooklyn and Queens. Talked about a continuing problem with revenues generated by what he deemed prohibitive fees and fines. For example, new legislation requiring new businesses to install gates that are 70% thru-visible (to decrease graffiti and increase visibility for first-responders) initially carried fines of \$1k and \$2.5k for non-compliance. This was reduced to \$800/\$2k, but even that is too high. The fines for street vendors at \$1k for the third offense; this, too, is too high. He also is pushing for passage of the small business survival bill, which includes protective provisions for commercial lease renewals.

Josephine Minaya, DA's Office: All crime victims have the same rights, regardless of their citizenship status. The only time the DA's office takes immigration status into account is in the case of the defendant, not the victim. No one should be afraid to report being the victim of a crime just because they are an illegal alien. Announced upcoming seminar; gave contact info. Also announced upcoming seminar on domestic violence, noting that Northern Manhattan has the bulk of DV arrests and prosecution in Manhattan.

Public Speakers' Session (8:18pm)

Elaine Vargas, Health First (District Sales Manager): Help Medicare recipients with the Medicare supplement for the uncovered 20%. The annual enrollment period will conclude November 15th. Described extra benefits, gave out contact info. Health First is a non-profit, operating in most hospitals including HHC facilities. Her colleague, Francisco Mejia, gave details on coverage. Helen Morik: this is a Medicare Advantage program, not supplemental coverage? A: correct.

Rafael Escañó for Controller William Thompson: <inadvertently overlooked during Elected Officials Representatives reports>: commended CB12 for its work in the time he has represented the Controller's office.

Michael Hurwitz, Council on the Environment of NYC / Greenmarket: Spoke in support of Parks & Cultural Affairs Committee resolution for a greenmarket at W. 168th Street & Fort Washington Avenue (NW corner). We are requesting 190 feet (less 10 feet for the falafel vendor who has been there for years) on Tuesdays, 8am – 4pm, though farmers will stay as late as there is customer demand. It will be a seasonal market, beginning in June or July, going through the end of November, though again, it can grow to a year-round market if there is community support for that. Greenmarkets bring locally grown produce straight from the farm to the public. We also will have "green bucks," coupons worth \$2 for every \$5 spent, for NYPH clinic patients. The greenmarket also will be EBT-enabled, to accept food stamps. We have great partners with Columbia University and Presbyterian Hospital

"Mr. X," community resident: incomprehensible rant regarding public bathrooms.

George Espinal, 34th Precinct Community Council: announced an on-going turkey drive to benefit local food pantry recipients.

Elizabeth Porter, community resident: Urged the Board to be more conscientious in issuing liquor licenses, which generate so many quality-of-life complaints. We need other business in the community, not just bars.

Eric Palatnik, Attorney for Congregation Mita: Spoke in favor of the Land Use Committee resolution regarding a BSA variance. Mr. Simon asked about outstanding building code violations: A: the resolution will facilitate our ability to resolve code violation once we have zoning variance. The work will stay in place as there is no legal mechanism to correct violations if we are out of zoning compliance. There will be fines which the church will pay to abate errors and correct violations. Ms. Cardona: Wants to the record to reflect her objections to the speaker's client's actions.

Ramon Toribio, community resident: spoke passionately and at length in favor of the proposed greenmarket. The Inwood market is good, but it's too far: I live on 163rd Street, and I would love this market.

Margaret McQuade, Hispanic Society of America, (Assistant Director): Spoke in favor of the Land Use Committee resolution regarding proposed facade restoration project and the public safety and programming impediment that the buildings deterioration pose. It is a 100+ year old building. The project also would provide for ADA access as well as climate control and a renovation of the terrace. Mr. Simon: happy to hear of these plans, but the last time we passed a resolution supporting the HSA we got burned because you voted a few months later to move. A: we had thought of that, but rejected the idea; we are totally committed to staying in our current location.

Carmen Acosta, Healthcare Education Project: This is an advocacy group. The cuts to healthcare currently contemplated by New York State would be detrimental. Nursing homes alone would lose \$247 million, plus 2.6x federal match. There would be a loss of \$28 million to NYPH. Asked people to sign petition opposing these cuts. Also spoke in favor of the proposed greenmarket.

Committee reports (8:50pm)

Wayne Benjamin for Land Use: Resolution regarding BSA variance for Congregation Mita. The zoning issue is simple: the building, circa 1929, predates the 1961 zoning regulations, and is grandfathered; as a non-conforming building, it was alright to have smaller side yards and backyards. But new construction on existing building must conform all zoning. The resolution does not support the variance, but does not object to it as this provides the only legal process for DOB to inspect, fine and correct any code violations. A second resolution regarding the Hispanic Society's proposed project echoed a public speaker's comments. The HSA has been self-funded for a century; this is the first time public funds have been sought other than some terrace work a few years ago. Mr. Simon offered several amendments corrections and clarifications, including an addition to the second resolution's first "whereas" stating HAS's commitment to remain in its current location, which were accepted as friendly. Both resolutions passed unanimously (37) votes. Mr. Benjamin urged the DM and Chair to ensure that the local councilmember follow up with DOB.

Edith Prentiss for Economic Development: (9:03pm) brief presentation of each of the proposed new or renewal license applications. Mr. Simon: regarding South Beach Restaurant (new on-premises liquor) & Café Espresso (new restaurant wine), which are new establishments operated by the owner of Case de Mofongo, what impact, if any, of this morning's homicide outside of his restaurant? A: we can withdraw that resolution and refer back to committee for fact-finding, though SLA likely will approve it whether there is a vote from the Board or not. Mr. Benjamin: have any already been approved? A: No; I checked and already removed any resolutions for establishments that already have been approved. Ms. Cardona for member of public: if the owner of an establishment is under indictment, can the Board still consider the application? A: we have specifically asked the SLA about this; they said "an indictment is not a conviction; if convicted, a license would be withdrawn. Mr. Espinal: regarding 181 Billiards, noted a history of gang violence outside of premises. A: that was the previous owners; this application is by new owners; but the precinct did recommend only an eating place beer license, not full liquor license.

Resolution #2: recommend SLA grant a new On-premises Liquor ("OPL") license for Emilou, Inc. (829 W. 181st St.) passed 32-3-2-0.
Resolution #3: recommend SLA REJECT a new OPL license for FAM Restaurant (431 W. 202nd St.) passed unanimously (37 votes).
Resolution #4: recommend SLA REJECT a new OPL license for La Esperanza Sports Bar (2372 Amsterdam Ave.) passed unanimously (37 votes).
Resolution #5: recommend SLA grant a new OPL license for Aires Restaurant & Lounge (151 Nagle Ave.) passed 29-8-0-0.
Resolution #7: recommend SLA REJECT a new Restaurant Wine license for Anafe Restaurant, Inc. (2089 Amsterdam Ave.) passed 36-1-0-0.
Resolution #8: recommend SLA grant a new Restaurant Wine license for JAPP Business, Inc. (4179 Broadway) passed 34-3-0-0.
Resolution #9: recommend SLA grant a new Restaurant Wine license for El Caridad (1944 Amsterdam Ave.) passed 28-8-1-0.
Resolution #10: recommend SLA grant a new On-premises Liquor license for Ceci Restaurant, Inc. (78 Sherman Ave.) passed 32-5-0-0.
Resolution #11: recommend SLA grant a new Restaurant Wine license for Vino Versus Wine Bar, Inc. (Seven Henshaw St.) passed 26-7-4-0.
Resolution #12: recommend SLA grant a new Eating Place Beer license for 181 Billiards, Inc. (566 W. 181st St.) passed 28-8-1-0.
Resolution #13: recommend SLA REJECT an OPL renewal for Las Reyna's Restaurant (2178 Amsterdam Ave.) passed unanimously (37 votes).
Resolution #14: recommend SLA renew an OPL license for Jubilee Restaurant, Inc. (One Nagle Ave.) passed 31-4-2-2.
Resolution #15: recommend SLA renew an OPL license for 1562 St. Nicholas Ave. Restaurant Corp. (1562 St. Nicholas Ave.) passed 34-3-0-0.
Resolution #16: recommend SLA renew an OPL license for Venerato Inc., d/b/a/ Garden Café (4961 Broadway) passed 35-1-0-1.
Resolution #17: recommend SLA renew an OPL license for El Guanaco Restaurant & Pupuseria (4195 Broadway) passed 36-1-0-0.
Resolution #18: recommend SLA renew an OPL license for Bijaru Coffee Shop Restaurant (4032 10th Ave.) passed 36-1-0-0.
Resolution #19: recommend TLC renew a Livery Car Base license, Riverside Radio Dispatch (1642 St. Nicholas Ave.) failed 16-18-3-0.
Resolution #20: recommend TLC renew a Livery Car Base license, High Class Limo & Car Service (604 W. 158th St) passed unanimously (37 votes).
Resolution #22: recommend DCA renew an Enclosed Sidewalk Café license, El Conde Steak House (4139 B'way) passed unanimously (37 votes).

Cheryl Pahaham for Housing: (9:50pm) Resolution on Welfare Reform was presented due to upcoming federal renewal on Welfare Reform. (Seen as a moment for reflection on welfare reform.) Committee would like to send to legislators to start the conversation for welfare reform. Mr. Simon wanted clarity on the stated number of increase applications for welfare by NYC residents as well as language surrounding education opportunities for recipients (2 year and 4 year colleges/ universities). There were several other amendments as to form, some of which Ms. Pahaham accepted as friendly; there were no motions to amend which received a second. A motion by Ms. Cardona to table the resolution was second and failed, 10-25-1-0. A motion to call the question having passed 33-3-0-0, the resolution passed 28-0-8-0.

New Business (10:18pm): As Ms. Lorris Ritter was tallying roll call votes, an item of new business was moved up on the agenda: Martin Collins offered a resolution calling on the US Census Bureau to open a district office in Washington Heights/Inwood for the 2010 census. Following a brief discussion consisting primarily of amendments as to form and to wording clarification which were accepted as friendly, the motion passed unanimously (36 votes).

Elizabeth Lorris Ritter for Parks & Cultural Affairs Committee (10:26pm): Resolution regarding a Tuesday greenmarket on the west side of Fort Washington Avenue between W 168th & w. 169th Street. Ms. Lorris Ritter noted several corrections as to form and fact. Ms. Swanson Massa questioned potential traffic impacts; Ms. Prentiss raised the issue of double-parking. A: we will work with the precinct to ensure proper enforcement. Zead Ramadan offered amendments, accepted as friendly, to strengthen the "whereas" regarding traffic enforcement. Jim Berlin proposed that future greenmarket resolutions be considered jointly by the Parks/Cultural Affairs and Traffic/Transportation Committees. The resolution passed 33-0-3-0.

George Espinal for Youth & Education (10:40pm): Mr. Espinal gave brief remarks about the October meeting and referred all to the minutes. The Principal of the Washington Heights Academy has been invited to the November meeting to discuss the school and its recent Progress & Quality Report, on which it received an "F."

Due to the lateness of the hour, the remaining Committee Chairs declined to report, and referred members to the minutes in their packets.

The meeting was **adjourned** by acclamation a little before 11pm.

Respectfully submitted, Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Secretary, with help from Cynthia Carrión; transcribed by Deborah Blow

**Community Board 12, Manhattan Budget Priorities Hearing
October 20, 2009 – CB12M Offices (711 W. 168th St.)**

PRESENT		EXCUSED	ABSENT		
Juan Carlos Alonzo	Glenda Swanson Massa	Richard Allman	Dora Maria Abreu	Mark Levine	Manny Velazquez
James Berlin	Rita McKee	Wayne Benjamin	Jackie Rowe Adams	Maria Luna	Joe Wojak
Isaiah Bing	Helen Morik	Tony Lopez	Rev. Antonio Almonte	Jasmine Moy	
Leonardo Blackman	Pam Palanque North	Tammy Rivera	Anita Barberis	Carole Mulligan	
Emilia Cardona	Cheryl Pahaham		Rolando Cespedes	Edgard Nau	
Cynthia Carrión	Edith Prentiss		George Cruz	Elizabeth Pepin	
Martin Collins	Zead Ramadan		Nicole Foster	Audrey Perez	
George Espinal	Andrea Reyes		Julissa Gomez	George Nelson Preston	
George Fernandez	Steve Simon		Melanie Hidalgo	Ruddy Santana	
Rabbi Joseph Kalinsky	Gloria Vanterpool		Albania Lopez Jimenez	Ninoska Uribe	
Elizabeth Lorris Ritter			David Kach		

In the absence of the Chair, 1st Vice Chair (who was chairing another CB meeting, but arrived later) and the 2nd Vice Chair (who arrived later), Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, the Secretary, **called the meeting to order** at 7:22pm. She gave instructions on how fill out the forms for the Capital & Expense Budget Priority ranking forms, as well as the Office of Management & Budget's "Form 3," to rank agencies and spending areas.

There was a short list of public speakers to testify on budget priorities:

- Ken Rosenfeld, Northern Manhattan Inwood Coalition advocated for funding for housing legal assistance and the lead safe-house, speaking passionately on the importance of these two of NIMC's programs.
- Joanna Monnier, community resident, re the dire conditions at the 163rd Street IND (C-train) station.
- Brad Conover: community resident; urged CB12 to attend to bike paths, bus rapid transit, and other alternatives to alleviate traffic congestion.

There were several questions clarifying the proper procedures for filling out the forms. It was clarified that there were 47 expense priorities, and 40 capital projects, of which 7 were listed for continuing support. (Boards are capped by OMB at 25 expense and 40 capital items.)

There was a lengthy discussion of and correction to the list, including the separation of two erroneously conflated items, and various nominal clarifications. There was a lengthy discussion on the perennial quandary of how to manage requests that continue to be rejected by agencies. On the one hand, if the Board continues to ask for projects and programs that agencies do not fund, we are possibly "wasting" our higher rankings, and should use a different strategy either by asking for other projects and programs that will get funded, or reframing our needs so as to be met by other projects/programs which agencies are more likely to fund. On the other hand, the Board has a responsibility to advocate in the strongest possible terms for projects/programs that the community needs, and which we don't stop needing just because they don't get funded. It was pointed out that CB12 advocated for a new elementary school for almost 20 years before PS48 was finally built. Finally, there was some discussion on the process through which the Board generates its priorities, and the involvement of committees in adding items as a response to discussions throughout the year. This included a discussion on the overlapping purview of some projects/programs. While it is important for committees to work together on items of common purview, it was noted that the priority rankings are not broken down by committee when they are sent to OMB.

Members then stayed to rank the projects, and to complete the OMB "Form 3" which ranks service delivery items by agency.

The last of paperwork was completed around 10:15pm; as there was no quorum, a motion to adjourn was not necessary.

Respectfully submitted, Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Secretary

Traffic & Transportation Committee Minutes
October 5, 2009

Committee Members Present **Committee Members Excused**

Mark Levine
Anita Barberis
James Berlin
Rita McKee

George Nelson Preston
Rabbi Joseph Kalinsky

C.B. 12 Members Present :

Staffer: Deborah Blow

Guests: Evelyn Neal, Maggie Clarke – Inwood Livable Streets, Jonathan Rabinowitz – Inwood Livable Streets, David Nimowitz.

Chair Mark Levine opened the meeting at 7:15pm and added three items to the agenda.

- Queried how we may monitor the on-going repairs at 181st St. #1 subway line. The shed will be the work platform. Presently, arranging for contractors. Also the 168th St. #1 subway line station was inspected.
- Dyckman Greenway Connector that will permit and protect bicycles to travel from the Hudson River to the Harlem River via Dyckman Street is being evaluated by DOT which will have an assessment ready before this year. Note: The Ring Garden, Ram Pharmacy on Nagle and Our Lady Queen of Martinez School on Arden St. support this effort.
- Photos taken by Wayne Benjamin concerning the deteriorated steel structures at 157th St. #1 subway were distributed to the committee for review and action. We should alert the MTA and forward photos to Councilman Jackson and the Commissioner of DOT. Further, the MTA Community Liaison, Marcus Book, should be invited to our next meeting to respond with actions to be taken to alleviate the problem.
- The City's plan to explore expansion of ferry service did not include any northern ports like the Dyckman Marina and Sherman Creek. Six (6) community representatives, including Edith Prentiss from the T&T Comm., spoke at a hearing which decried the non-mention of any northern ports for ferries. We should draft a reso to support the inclusion of these sites for ferry service. Reso to be written: T&T=4, 1=abstain and Public 5=yes
- Jumel Terrace Historic District is requesting limited residential parking in this district and parts of West 160 & 162 Sts. to address the litter thrown from cars that park in this quiet tree-lined, low population area, but do not live on these streets. Litter like: empty beer cans, trays of half-eaten food, needles, tires, mattresses, etc. This usually occurs during the lunch hours and late at night. They are requesting designated residential parking only between the hours of 11am-3pm and 10pm-3am. A number of members of the committee stated they do not believe the City allows this on public streets. Suggested we advise the the DO Sanitation in assisting with the cleanup—matter to be taken up by CB health cmmte?
- Livable Streets. Broadway has ripples, which is a hazardous to cycling and pedestrians. Asphalt does not hold up well, but concrete curbs would be stable. Re-surface areas from Sherman & Broadway north to Broadway Bridge. Also, drag racing on Dyckman should have speed bumps. We suggested that we seek enforcement first- ask Capul for letter of support and ask DOT to reconsider.

- Missing Curbcut at 178 & Broadway northside is not viable. Potentially set back another 5 feet?
- Add following streets for re-paving: Pinehurst 183-187 Sts. & 179-178, Amsterdam Ave. 181-186 Sts., 172 bet. Haven & Ft. Washington.
- Ranked the Capital & Expense budget items for T&T and submitted to office.

Meeting adjourned at 9pm

Minutes respectfully submitted by: Anita Barberis

**Public Safety Committee Meeting Minutes
October 7, 2009**

Committee Member

Emilia Cardona, Chair
Andria Reyes

Committee Absentees

Ninoska Uribe
George Cruz
Ingrid Dominques-Brito
Julissa Gomez
George Fernandez
Rev. Antonio Almonte
Elizabeth Pepin

Board Members Attending

Staff: Deborah Blow, Community Coordinator

Guests: Joselinne Minaya-Manhattan DA's Office,

Meeting convened at 7:00pm Emilia Cardona

There being no quorum an informal discussion on the budget priorities was held. The two committee members ranked the items. The two attendees provided their input also.

Those present then discussed a future panel discussion on Domestic Violence.
Tasks were assigned for the next meeting.

The next meeting will be November 4 at 7:00pm. All are welcome.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:30pm

Respectfully submitted by Emilia Cardona, typed by D. Blow

HOUSING & HUMAN SERVICES - MINUTES

October 1, 2009

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Cheryl Pahaham, Chair
Glenda Swanson-Massa, Asst. Chair
Juan Alonzo
Nicole Foster
Melanie Hidalgo
Pamela Palanque-North, CB 12 1st Vice Chair

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT

Carole Mulligan
Ruddy Santana

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT

Staff Member Present: Ebenezer Smith

Guests: Anthony Parson, Resident; Emma Silvers, Columbia University journalism student

=====

Chairperson Cheryl Pahaham convened the meeting at 7:05 PM, with quorum.

Assistant Chair Swanson-Massa briefed the committee on Project Renewal's October 1 community advisory board meeting. Bidding and other work for the installation of air conditioning in the Fort Washington Men's Shelter would be done this winter and the air conditioning would be in-use by summer 2010. A question was raised regarding sex offenders residing in the shelter. Upon discussion of the issue, the Housing and Human Services Committee agreed to explore the possibility of hosting a public forum on sex offenders returning to community from incarceration.

The committee discussed FY 2011 budget requests received from community organizations and schools, including funds for housing attorneys; housing organizers; outreach and assessment for domestic violence programming for young men; needle exchange operation on Sundays; stipends for youth summer health careers internships; increasing the number of parent coordinators in schools; microenterprise loans; fathering programs and parent education programs; food for pantries and soup kitchens; additional bilingual education teachers; school auditorium renovation; more Section 8 vouchers; and enforcement of nondiscrimination laws for Section 8 tenants. Committee members agreed to do additional outreach and to invite people to attend the budget hearing on October 20th. The list of requests would be collated and sent to the District Manager before the budget hearing. The 1st Vice Chair of Community Board 12, Palanque-North, suggested that the committee also consider hosting a meeting for the district's food pantries and soup kitchens, to ascertain their needs as providers and to ascertain the community's need for basic essentials like food. Palanque-North expressed the view that many people were being denied food stamps and that the committee should highlight this issue. Committee members agreed to take this up in a future meeting.

The committee then discussed a draft resolution on welfare reform. The goal of the resolution was to recommend that the New York State Legislature, which is the body that sets welfare policy through its legislation, begin a series of public hearings on how to reform and improve the State's welfare programs in order to better meet rising financial needs, as evidenced by rising poverty and unemployment rates, and other indicators, such as a large increase in requests for welfare. The committee's discussion was largely based on guest presentations and review of documents from two prior meetings, one on welfare policy and one on food stamps. The committee agreed to recommend reform that would expand eligibility for benefits in order to meet growing needs, and that would provide greater opportunities for education and training, which committee members felt was a more certain path out of poverty than other work activities assigned to welfare recipients. All present voted unanimously in support of the resolution.

The meeting adjourned at 9:16 PM.

Minutes submitted by Cheryl Pahaham, 10/06/09

Land Use Committee - Meeting Minutes

October 7, 2009

Committee Members Present

Wayne Benjamin, Chair
Anita Barberis, Asst. Chair
James Berlin
Richard Allman
Isaiah Bing
Tamara Rivera

Committee Members Absent

Dora Maria Abreu

Board Members

Edith Prentiss

Public Member Absent

Vivian Ducat

Staffer: Deborah Blow

Guests: Margaret Connors McQuade-Asst. Director-Hispanic Society, Burdell Buckley-Architect, Maria Romanach-Architect, Eric Palatnik, Esq.- Congregation Mita, Victor Pagan, Mcdalin Carrion, Eunis Rivera, Theresa Ruiz, Peter Santana, Paimann Lodhi,- Man Boro President Office, Matt Sloane-CB12 Fellowship, Sahne Horlzel-Resident, Jessica Rivera

1. The Land Use Committee ("Land Use" or the "Committee") was called to order at 7:15 PM. Matthew Sloane, the planning intern who will be working with Community Board 12 this semester was introduced. Mr. Sloane is a graduate student at Pratt. He will assist the Land Use to further develop the soft site analysis prepared by last semester's planning intern and to document potential new historic districts.
2. Margaret Connors McQuade, Assistant Director of the Hispanic Society of America ("HSA") made a presentation to the Committee on HSA, its mission, facilities and master plan for capital improvements. Ms. McQuade was accompanied by Burdell Buckley of Maria C. Romanach Architects. Ms. McQuade was scheduled to meet with the Parks and Culture committee on October 6th but had to reschedule. The Committee was advised that HSA is a museum and educational center that is open and free to the public and contains works of art from the second millennium B.C. through the 19th century. It was founded to celebrate the contributions, influence and culture of Spain and the Spanish -speaking world. HSA's facilities at the landmark Audubon Terrace complex are nearly 100 years old. Its facilities include the Main Building, on West 155th Street, i.e.: the south side of Audubon Terrace, the former American Indian Museum Building, which HSA purchased, and the North Building on West 156th Street, i.e.: the north side of Audubon Terrace. Land Use was also advised that HSA has undertaken a capital projects master plan for its facilities. The first phase of this plan consists of renovating the Sorolla Room, repairing roof leaks and addressing various code and life safety issues. While the Sorolla Room is being renovated the paintings that were displayed in the room are being exhibited in Spain; this traveling exhibit has become the most attended art exhibit in Spain's history. Ms. McQuade also noted that HSA's buildings do not have climate control, which is critical to any museum, the terrace area, which is actually a building structure, is in poor condition and that water damage is causing portions of the North building's limestone facades to break away. It was also noted that for the first 100 years of its existence HSA was self-funded. It is now looking for new funding opportunities and sources and has implemented a capital campaign that has already attracted support from a few banks in Spain. Ms. McQuade advised the Committee that Assemblyman Denny Farrell recently visited HSA and expressed interest in assisting with funding a capital project. Renovating the terrace was discussed initially but it is a more complicated project.

than just repaving the walking surface and is expected to cost as much as \$15 million to complete. HSA initially considered asking Assemblyman Farrell to support an additional roof renovation project but was then faced with the need to undertake emergency repairs to the facades of the North building to address potential public safety hazards. Project costs are estimated at \$1 million and will include scaffolding the facades of the North building, opening the walls and replacing rusted steel lintels, replacing damaged sections of limestone, cleaning the existing limestone, relining the gutter at the top of the facades to prevent further leaks, conserving and cleaning the sculptural reliefs on the terrace-side facades and architectural and related fees. Ms. McQuade asked the Committee to consider providing a statement in support for its funding request to Assemblyman Farrell.

After further discussion a motion was made and seconded in support of HSA's funding request to Assemblyman Farrell to partially finance emergency façade repairs to the North Building and encouraging Assemblyman Farrell as well as all of the City, State and federal elected officials who represent Washington Heights and Inwood to work with HSA to assist it in securing the capital funds needed to fully implement its planned capital improvement projects inclusive of all aspects of disability accessibility. **The resolution was passed based on the following votes:**

	<u>For</u>	<u>Against</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>
Committee Members	6	0	0
Board Members	1	0	0
Members of the Public	7	0	0

- 3 **Public Hearing:** The Committee hosted a public hearing to obtain comment on the application (Application Calendar No.: 182-09-BZ) filed in connection with 612 West 180th Street (the "Property") that was submitted to the Board of Standards and Appeals ("BSA") on behalf of Congregation Mita (the "Owner" to the "Church") seeking zoning variances to legalize the enlargements to the second and third stories of the existing structure. No density/FAR or use variances are requested. The Property is a former synagogue built circa 1923 that was purchased by the Owner in 1982. The zoning variance is sought in order to permit the current house of worship and novitiate use groups to continue to meet the Church's programmatic needs.

Eric Palatnik, a lawyer representing Congregation Mita (the "Owner"), made a presentation concerning the BSA application. Mr. Palatnik informed that Committee that the Church is based in Puerto Rico and has chapters in the United States, Canada, Venezuela, Columbia, Ecuador, Panama, Costa Rica, Mexico, Spain and the Dominican Republic. The chapter located at the Property has 375 members who use the structure daily for prayer, meetings and gatherings. The Church has two ministers and one caretaker who reside at the Property, three ministers who are based at the New York chapter and travel to the other chapters, 32 novitiates who travel from Puerto Rico between six to nine times a year and 18 novitiates who travel six to nine times a year from the northeastern United States to this location when the Church's Board is at the premises.

Mr. Palatnik continued his presentation noting that the Property was renovated by the Church, circa 2003, to enlarge to the second and third floors in order to provide with expanded space for its Novitiate, which is akin to a residential dormitory associated with a religious institution. The enlargements are straight-line extensions over the existing structure's foot print, that is, the new construction does not setback from the exterior walls of the existing building. Pursuant to zoning a rear yard of 30 feet is required and side yards of either zero feet to eight feet are required. The Property's original 1923 construction does not conform to current zoning with respect to these side and rear yard requirements, but since it pre-dates the 1960 zoning resolution, it is a legal non-conforming building. However, new construction or renovations to existing construction must

conform to zoning. The renovations to the Property that enlarged the second and third floors do not conform to rear and side yard zoning requirements.

Mr. Palatnik noted that the renovation work was undertaken without building permits but that this was done out of ignorance on the part of the Church, not out of any willful intent to go around proper procedures. The Church is not being forced to vacate the space nor is it being compelled to legalize the construction; it is doing so because it wants to correct this situation. This illegal construction resulted in both building code and zoning violations. The zoning violations relate to the aforementioned side and rear yard requirements. In order for the Owner to address building code violations it must first obtain zoning variances with respect to the rear and side yard requirements.

Mr. Palatnik continued his presentation noting that under federal law signed by President Clinton not-for-profit religious institutions are provided great latitude with respect to zoning and land use matters and that the criteria that must be established in order to obtain a BSA zoning variance differs from the typical five findings that must be established by private, for-profit entities and institutions. He noted that under applicable laws a religious institution can rely upon its need to meet or continue to meet programmatic requirements in seeking to obtain a zoning variance, and that, unless a danger to public health and safety can be shown to be created by the requested variance it must be approved.

The Committee stated that the requested rear and side yard variances are minor matter that do not cause concern but the non-compliance with the process that should have been followed in order to obtain approvals from BSA and the Department of Buildings ("DOB") before any work was undertaken is of significant concern. The Committee asked for the name of the contractor that performed the work and was advised that no contractor was used, rather the Church sent a crew of approximately 15 men (church members) from Puerto Rico to perform the work. The Committee noted that this reinforces its concerns with the process followed by the Owner with regard to the renovations. Mr. Palatnik responded stating that the Church fully realizes the mistakes it has made, understands that DOB will make it open walls and ceilings to inspect concealed work, may require some work to be reconstructed and that, in the long run, getting the work legalized after the fact will cost more than having followed proper procedures from the start.

Board member Edith Prentiss asked if the plans submitted to DOB would be self-certified (by an architect or engineer) or if they will be subject to a full review by DOB staff. Mr. Palatnik stated that the plans would undergo a full review by DOB.

Committee member Jim Berlin asked if the Owner has plans for any additional construction at the site, and if so, how could we be assured that any new construction would proceed in accordance with proper procedures. Mr. Palatnik indicated that there is unused FAR at the site but there are no plans for additional construction; the Owner's intent is to maintain the building at its current height. Land Use Chair Wayne Benjamin asked if the Church would be willing to reduce this to writing. After consulting with the Church representatives Mr. Palatnik responded in the affirmative. Mr. Benjamin requested this concurrence in writing and that it be provided to the District Manager in advance of the October General Meeting.

Committee Member Obie Bing raised concerns about the adequacy of subsurface utilities to support the building's electrical and other systems demands, noting that based on his site visit substantial new HVAC equipment has been installed. Obie also noted that he knocked on the church door in an effort to gain access to inspect the interior but no one responded. Mr. Palatnik indicated it is his understanding that that the DOB review includes all electrical and other utility requirements. He also asked representatives of the Church present at the public hearing if arrangements could be made for a site visit for any members of the Committee who are interested, they responded in the positive.

Mr. Benjamin noted that DOB's web site shows a number of open violations and complaints and indicates that in the past DOB inspectors have not been allowed access to the Property. Mr. Palatnik replied that the violations would all be addressed and that he did not know why DOB inspectors would have encountered a problem with obtaining access in the past but they now should have no problem.

Paimann Lohdi of the Manhattan Borough President's office noted that the BSA application the Committee is asked to consider relates only to the rear and sides year zoning requirements and does not pertain to the DOB violations. The Committee stated that is was aware of this but that as Board members they are concerned with all of the compliance issues and with others may seek to use this matter as a precedent.

After further discussion a motion was made (J. Berlin) and seconded (O. Bing) offering no objection to the requested rear and side yard zoning variances but strongly objecting to the fact that construction was completed without permits or licensed contractors and therefore demanding that the Department of Buildings undertake a strict and complete review of the existing construction of this building, and indeed for any building where construction was completed without permits or licensed contractors, to ensure all of the work is brought up to code support and further demanding that self-certification of the plans and the construction not be permitted for this building or and building where work that was undertaken without permits is to be legalized. **The resolution was passed based on the following votes:**

	<u>For</u>	<u>Against</u>	<u>Abstaining</u>
Committee Members	6	0	0
Board Members	1	0	0
Members of the Public	5	0	0

4. Subsequent to the conclusion of the Public Hearing a neighborhood resident who lives across the street from Congregation Mita advised the Committee that the church has held street activities at least three times this year and did not adequately clean up at the end of these events. Board Member Edith Prentiss agreed to research the SAPO applications reviewed by CB12-M to determine if Congregation Mita is following proper procedures.
5. Board Member Edith Prentiss asked if it is a code requirement for a building that has a wheelchair accessible entrance to have a directional sign to indicate the location of the accessible entrance. She also suggested that, if an accessible entrance is locked there should be a bell to alert building staff that assistance is required at the accessible entrance. It was agreed that these matters should be researched further, and that, to the extent that these matters are not currently required, resolutions in support of same should be presented to the full board for consideration.
6. Committee member Obie Bing noted that as a result of the work CB12-M undertook related to Con Edison's M29 project we have access to substantial information on subsurface infrastructure in and around the vicinity of the M29 project. This information can be of use to the Committee and CB12-M in evaluating the potential impacts on existing utilities by renovation and development projects.
7. The meeting adjourned at t 9:25 PM.

Respectfully submitted by Wayne A. Benjamin