

Housing and Human Services Committee Meeting Minutes
Thursday, February 4th, 2021

Committee Members Present: Edda Santiago, Ayisha Oglive, Bruce Robertson, Angel Vasquez, Ariel Miranda, Marielle Ali, Marshall Vanderpool (Public Committee Member)

Other Community Board Members: Curtis Young

Public Members: Zadia Adam, Dr. Gary Altheim, Phil Zablocki, Bob Schanz, Diego Quintana, Sandi Galawanji, Maceo Raysor, Stephanie Rivera, Ericka Rodriguez, Peter Giles, Michael Tod Smith

Presenters: Erin Burns-Maine (Senior Director for Policy and External Affairs, NYCHA), Marissa Schaffer (Vice-President for Transactions, NYCHA), Spencer Edwards (Senior Program Manager, NYCHA), Yuliya Szczepanski (Intergovernmental Affairs Team, NYCHA), Amy Stokes (Assistant Vice President, Monadnock Development), P. Downing (Monadnock Development)

Agenda

1. Call to Order

- Meeting was called to order at 7:05 pm. Edda seconded the motion.

2. Introductions

- Ariel provided an overview of the meeting's agenda. Community Board members introduced themselves.

3. Presentation by NYCHA on CB12 Properties' Finance Planning

- Marissa led the presentation on the PACT Initiative (Permanent Affordability Commitment Together)
 - i. Main Goals of Pact –
 1. stabilize a critical housing stock for New York City
 2. invest in communities by addressing community-wide goals and priorities; investing in resources and amenities that support resident health and prosperity
 3. meaningfully engage communities in planning for the future of their homes.
- PACT seeks to unlock funding to complete comprehensive repairs in NYCHA developments. NYCHA enters into development partnership with private and non-profit partners selected on competitive procurement process. NYCHA maintains ownership of land and building.
 - i. NYCHA
 1. NYCHA manages the subsidy the waitlists. NYCHA serves as Section 8 Administrator and controls the waitlist and release of subsidy for the PACT program.

2. NYCHA monitors conditions at the developments and ensures that developers adhere to their obligations.
3. NYCHA is supported by the Asset Management infrastructure of the PACT financing partner, and sister agency, NYC Housing Development Corporation.

ii. Private Partner

1. Under HUD's Rental Assistance Demonstration, the PACT partner is required to renovate apartments, building facades, grounds, etc.
 2. Partners assume the day to day by private property manager – operation and upkeep of building
 3. Include social services provider to develop robust programming to improve services for residents in developments
- **Current Converted PACT Projects in CB12 M** (Converted November 2020 construction phase) managed by PACT Renaissance Collaborative (Monadnock Development LLC, Kalel Holdings LLC, Lemor Development Group, Cornell Pace Inc, and Community League of the Heights (CLOTH))
 - i. Fort Washington Avenue Rehab (226 units)
 - ii. Washington Heights Rehab Groups 1&2 (216 units)
 - iii. Washington Heights Rehab Phase III (102 units)
 - iv. Washington Heights Rehab Phase IV (C) (32 units)
 - v. Washington Heights Rehab Phase IV (D) (32 units)
 - **Forthcoming PACT Projects** (Predevelopment Phase 2021) will be managed by ABM Community Partners (Dantes Partners, Webb & Brooker, Apex Building Company, Mosholu Montefiore Community Center)
 - i. Bethune Gardens 1945 Amsterdam Avenue (210 units Senior)
 - ii. Marshall Plaza 1970 Amsterdam Avenue (180 units Senior)
 - **Presentation Question and Answer**
 - i. **Angel:** What has NYCHA noticed on the experiences of other residents in converted buildings with the new management partners?
 - ii. **NYCHA:** One of the challenges NYCHA faces is misinformation due to issues in the past. It is not privatization, and this is a public-private partnership. NYCHA is still the owner of the land and the building and will maintain oversight of the private companies. The contract documents include oversight regulations and enforcement mechanisms language and can be found on PACT's website. Residents have responded positively to the renovations.
 - iii. **Angel:** Two to three years after the renovations, who is responsible for the management and day to day issues? Can residents raise any concerns they are experiencing without fear of harassment?
 - iv. **NYCHA:** The property manager will be responsible for the day-to-day operations, but residents can still reach NYCHA if problems exist. Residents should go to their property manager in the first instance.

Afterwards, residents can go to the Section 8 Housing Department and to the Asset Management. They can call 311 as well.

- v. **Angel:** What is the renewal process for NYCHA residents and Section 8 residents?
- vi. **NYCHA:** Section 9 in NYCHA public housing there is an annual recertification process. With Section 8 residents, they also have to recertify every year with NYCHA's Lease Housing Department.
- vii. **Angel:** Are the buildings being updated to include broadband access?
- viii. **NYCHA:** When assessing potential PACT partners, NYCHA asks for proposals that include broadband access in their renovations.
- ix. **Ayisha:** What is the rental change as the rent may be different from NYCHA to Section 8? Once residents are switched to Section 8 are the apartments do not go to market rate?
- x. **NYCHA:** Correct.
- xi. **Ayisha:** Is there a concern that there may be a push for all private funding due to lack of funding from the government?
- xii. **NYCHA:** As a government entity, NYCHA is unable to borrow money from any funding source outside of HUD. Through the RAD program, NYCHA is able to partner with groups like PRC that have the ability to borrow money from sources like the Housing Development Corporation.
- xiii. **Ayisha:** How can we get more information about the developments in our district?
- xiv. **NYCHA:** There is information available on NYCHA's website. The PRC are regularly meeting with elected officials. We are also happy to offer similar presentations in the future to the community board.
- xv. **Marielle:** What is the process for employment opportunities for NYCHA residents?
- xvi. **NYCHA:** We work with PACT partners to advertise the jobs in the community, particularly in the development. Most of the jobs are in construction, but there are also long-term property management and social service-related jobs.
- xvii. **Marielle:** Can you talk about the steps you've taken to green the renovation process?
- xviii. **NYCHA:** We are prioritizing energy efficient appliances and ensuring the process is green.
- xix. **PRC:** Measuring water usage – working towards local law 97 to be carbon neutral by 2030
- xx. **Ayisha:** For people in shelters with vouchers, would they apply for Section 8 and not NYCHA?
- xxi. **NYCHA:** They can apply for both NYCHA Section 9 and NYCHA Section 8. Converted buildings were previously Section 9 and after the conversion they are now Section 8 as they were converting from one form of federal subsidy to another. Residents that were in the buildings (Section 9) prior

to the conversion do not have to move. Newer residents coming into the development after the conversion are coming off the Section 8 waitlist.

- xxii. **Angel:** Is this unionized labor? If not, what is the percentage?
 - xxiii. **PRC:** 30% are non-prevailing and 70% are prevailing. We worked with Local 79
 - xxiv. **Angel:** Will the building specifications remain the same i.e. senior housing?
 - xxv. **NYCHA:** There is a distinction in what Section 9 and Section 8 qualify as a senior household. The Head of Household will be 62 or older.
 - xxvi. **Ariel:** Can you clarify the terminology on sticky voucher?
 - xxvii. **NYCHA:** After someone has been in a Section 8 development for a year, they can apply for a transfer voucher. It is sometimes referred to as a sticky voucher.
 - xxviii. **Ariel:** Can you explain what is within Title III that sets up job requirements and how can we ensure underrepresented people are getting into these jobs?
 - xxix. **NYCHA:** Section III a HUD requirement – Section III hiring plan NYCHA reviews it
 - xxx. **Ariel:** How are you engaging the residents in these buildings?
 - xxxi. **PRC:** We held over 40 in-person and virtual meetings for residents and tenant organizations. We worked with a local non-profit and liaise with local elected officials on NYCHA outreach. We also use social media. We also used surveys to ask for resident input.
 - xxxii. **Marshall:** What are the differences between the PACT Initiative and the Blueprint Program? They are a lot of similarities.
 - xxxiii. **NYCHA:** There are a lot of similarities between the two initiatives. The Blueprint Program was recently announced and is not yet being implemented in any of the developments.
- The committee thanked the NYCHA and PRC representatives for the presentation. NYCHA agreed to share the PowerPoint presentation with the committee.

4. DHS Oversight Resolution

- Ariel read the draft resolution, and the committee discussed it.
- Ayisha raised that the Armory Foundation came before the CB12M Licensing Committee to request a liquor license and asked for it to be included in the resolution pointing to issues of governance at the location. Ayisha further explained that it was a caterer that applied for the license despite not having its establishment at the Armory Foundation. The Licensing Committee objected to the license.
- Ariel shared his multiple attempts to invite DHS to attend the Committee meetings to discuss the situation at the Armory Foundation in detail but that DHS representatives have been available to meet.
- Dr. Gary Altheim (Public) asked how public officials can be held accountable after they've agreed to help GDS return to the building or relocate?

- Ayisha asked whether there are fees associated with the use of space for the vaccination site at the building and asking whether those fees are going to the Armory Foundation.
- Angel suggested a meeting between the Armory Foundation and DHS with the entire Community Board to understand and address the situation between the two entities.
- Ayisha suggested separating the draft resolution in two: one on the current contract and the intended expectations of how the building should be managed. The second resolution focused on the usage of the building in the community and what governance arrangements should be in place so the building functions as it is intended.
- Zadie (Public) raised the oversight issues at the Armory Foundation.
- Angel again suggested the Community Board hold a public hearing or forum with both DHS and the Armory Foundation.
- Ariel shared that he has been trying to meet with DHS for the past four or five months without any success to address this issue.
- **On the Resolution**
 - i. Edda suggested the use of breach rather than illegally in the fifth Whereas of the draft. It was accepted as a friendly amendment.
 - ii. Ayisha motioned to include 5 points in the draft resolution:
 1. An attempt to request a liquor license for use at the Armory Foundation
 2. the second resolution that was passed resolving DHS to cooperate with the Community Board and answer outstanding questions
 3. Armory Foundation rented out the space for corporate and social events, including MTV and Vera Wang
 4. List the names of the two
 5. An out of state individual had a bedroom in a city building
 - iii. Marielle seconded Ayisha's motion. The Committee voted on the motion: 5-1-0.
 - iv. Ariel motioned to vote on the resolution. Marielle seconded the motion. The Committee voted on the resolution: 9-0-0.

5. New Business

- Ayisha introduced a resolution to implement a tracking system for resolutions.
 - i. Curtis suggested taking the resolution to the Executive Committee.
 - ii. Edda motioned to vote on the resolution in the March HHS Committee meeting if it does not pass in the Executive Committee meeting. Angel seconded the motion. The Committee voted on the motion: 9-0-0.
- Ariel reminded the committee members of the listening sessions held by Bowery Residents' Committee (BRC) on the history of Inwood's Cemetery for Enslaved Africans and Indigenous Ceremonial Pits. Due to the discovery of the site and the ongoing rezoning, it is not yet clear how BRC may move forward with the

location. A current idea is to use the space for a shelter service site and the other half for supportive housing.

6. Old Business

7. Adjourn Meeting

- Ariel motioned to adjourn the meeting at 10:39 pm. Angel seconded the motion.