

Community Board 12, Manhattan
Minutes of the March 28, 2017 General Meeting
Isabella Geriatric Center (515 Audubon Ave., NYC 10040)

Board Members Present: Richard Allman, Mary Anderson, Glennis Aquino, Anita Barberis, Wayne Benjamin, James Berlin, Isaiah "Obie" Bing, Jennifer Chung, Daryl Cochrane, Jason Compton, Robin Cruz, Gerard Dengel, Katherine Diaz, Domingo Estevez, Fe Florimón, Barbara Frazier, Mitchell Glenn, Fern Hertzberg, Yosef Kalinsky, Osi Kaminer, Andrea Kornbluth, Elizabeth Lehmann, Richard Lewis, Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Maria Luna, Isidro Medina, Deborah Nabavian, Ayisha Ogilvie, Pamela Palanque-North, Liliana Saneaux, Arlene Schulman, Steve Simon, Karen Taylor, Javier Trejo. **Members Excused:** Yahaira Alonzo, Natalie Espino, Jay Mazur, Jonathan Reyes. **Members Absent:** Shahabuddeen Ally, Wanda Garcia, Rud Morales, Esteban Nembhard, Angela Sanchez, Carlos Suero, Luis Tapia. **Staff:** Ebenezer Smith.

~~~~~

6:47pm **Introductory remarks by the First Vice Chair**, Richard Lewis, in the absence of a quorum, and in lieu of the Chair, Shahabuddeen Ally, who was unable to attend this evening.

- Thanks to Isabella for hosting this evening's meeting; nice to be back in this space, now beautifully renovated. Shout-out to CB12's own Betty Lehmann for making the arrangements.
- Tenants had a major victory upheld in court: judge saw through RGB claim, and upheld last year's rent freeze. CB12 was 1<sup>st</sup> board to pass a resolution calling for a rent freezes several years ago.
- Introduced Jennifer Brown, Live-On NY, 347-815-5930 / [jbrown@liveon-ny.org](mailto:jbrown@liveon-ny.org), helps seniors get benefitted for SCRIE/DRIE, SNAP, Medicare, M'care savings, etc.
- Moment of silence in memory of Dr. Norbert Sander of the Armory, who died a week-and-a-half-ago, quite suddenly. Not without difficulties, but made huge contributions to the community, the Armory, and to youth programming in running and academics.
- Urged patience as we go through complicated changes to bring the website up to speed; we have some limitations due to the template we must use per DoITT.

6:58pm **Highlights of District Manager's report**, the full text of which is NOT included in members' packets:

- Update on the CB12 website.
- Job vacancy for Community Assistant has been posted and closed. We got ~25 resumes; many of good quality. Goal is to have 2-3 candidates to bring before the Board in June. Thanks to all who submitted.
- Announced Community League of the Heights neighborhood clean-up dates.
- MBPO asked to promote JTS standing Uptown for religious tolerance, Weds 4/5, 12-2:40 at 3080 Bway @ 122<sup>nd</sup> St.
- MBPO looking for community liaison in uptown office
- Chairs: make any corrections to calendar tonight; corrected version will be distributed tomorrow.

7:02pm **Adoption of the agenda:** Motion by Isidro Medina, second by Daryl Cochrane. No objections to agenda. Add Reso "D" from Housing re HDFCs, which inadvertently was omitted from the agenda. No other changes; no objection.

7:05pm **Adoption of January 2017 General Meeting minutes:** Motion by Betty Lehmann, second by Fern Hertzberg; no corrections; no objection.

7:06pm **Adoption of February 2017 General Meeting minutes:** Motion by Ayisha Ogilve, second by Fern Hertzberg; no corrections; no objection.

~~~~~

7:08pm **Public Session** (Chaired by Secretary, Elizabeth Lorris Ritter; time-keeping by Carlos Suero)

Julissa Perez & Giordanna del Rosario, My Beauty Mark Foundation: raises money for cancer survivors who are having difficulty paying their bills. Did a fundraiser at Mamjuana; raised \$5k in two months, which was used to help three families including one whose 3-y/o died of brain cancer. Just trying to give back. julissa@mymbf.org; 917-833-3533

Joel Yoffie: read a poem that slandered a local non-profit and made unsubstantiated allegations of anti-semitism.

Paul Hintersteiner: we need FHV designation on taxi stands. Will give locations to Ebenzer. Was not aware that some stands already have the designation; would like to see it on all stands so that liveries, which are not technically taxis, can use the stands for respite.

Danita Nichols & Cassandra Innocent: announced upcoming programs at the Inwood, Washington Heights & Ft. Washington branch libraries.

Al Kurland, PAL announced May 20th “Youth & Police Building Bridges” event. Launched last June. Had 300 participants marching from various organizations, and as individuals. We’ll be gathering at CB12/Triangle building and marching to GWHS ballfield for speeches, food, entertainment, then field day of activities, demonstrating that young people and the police can engage in cooperative activities, from sports to games to healing circles. Contact through Ebenezer at CB12 (212-568-8500) or email Al Kurland: akurland@palnyc.org.

Sarah Keifer, Save Inwood Library: library is a vital community resource. It is a safe haven for our children, a meeting place for the whole community and brings us all together, and it’s free. Our public spaces are disappearing. Free speech is under attack. We can’t afford to lose this.

Valinn Ranelli, made additional moving and supportive comments in support of the NYPL and their importance, similar to his appeal last month, but pro-library activists wanted to record the speech to share on YouTube.

Karla Fisk: spoke against the Inwood Library sale to a developer for \$1 and demolition of same. Most heavily-used branch in the system, open 7 days/week.

Emma Goldman-Sherman: a library speaks volumes. A 20k s/f space says something; tells people that the culture values them and their futures and their learning. Urged CB12 to take a stand and support libraries. ISIS is levelling libraries and we should not allow anyone to attack our cultural institutions.

Gabriela Biel, spoke passionately on behalf of libraries, where she learned to read, studied for school, prepared for tests, filed taxes, etc.

Fernando Sedeño spoke in Spanish in strong support of our local libraries. A place for immigrants, a safe place for children, and a pillar of the community.

Maury Ayora: Growth & Development Services (GDS) & Camp Excel. Been going on for 20 years, had a bit of a down time but we are bringing it back. It was a second home for me and my sister. Provides college prep, afterschool help, mental health services, etc.

Stephen Hirsch, GDS: Graduate SW student interning at GDS. Echoed comments of previous speaker; see flyer. If you need a safe space, we are here. 4/11 is open mic event, great opportunity to come in and see space, and what we do. Also a camp over the summer.

Nancy Bruning Spoke in support of libraries, and affirms all that was said previously, but came to speak about recreation. Masters in Public Health. Great free programs in IHP, including guided fitness walks through the park with stretches & exercises afterwards; Forest Fitness; and a yoga walkabout program specifically for seniors, using benches (not the ground; not mats required). Free outdoor fitness begins 4/24, meets M/W 11-12 starting at the flagpole. Forest Fitness begins 4/17, meets M/W noon-1, starting at the Nature Center. Seniors program is on Saturdays from 10-11 and meets at Payson playground.

Leah Durner, Save Inwood Libraries The proposed project isn’t a redevelopment, rather it is the sale of our public good to private interests. Robin Hood Foundation is composed of Hedge Fund members. This has been totally opaque, there was no public discussion. Privatization of public good has a chilling effect, and imposes corporate values of maximizing properties. We are presented with a false choice.

Laurie Tobias Cohen: lived at 50 Overlook for more than two decades. My local stop is 184th A train. There are lots of teen boys on bikes – to be expected in warm weather, which is a good thing – but when they use the ramp, if they lose control there is no space for a parent w/ a stroller or an elderly person on a walker and there is the potential for a serious collision. This is a real problem. I went to the police precinct and was told to come to the Community Board. Referred to tomorrow’s 34th Precinct Community Council meeting, or C/M Rodriguez’ public safety town hall.

Michelle Kohut Another voice for Inwood library. We should separate the issues of housing and libraries because both are important to the community.

Jeffrey Wollock, save the library. This is part of a citywide real estate scheme to exploit libraries and demolish them so that no new Mayor can undo what the Bloomberg administration started. Cited extensively from the Revson report: “reenvisioning libraries according to the needs of property developers.” Inwood Library’s history is dear to Inwood.

Sally Fisher, Save Library: last year Inwood library won an award for the services it provides. We must continue to invest in libraries. You CB members don’t know how important the library is because you don’t use it, but we need our library. Other neighborhoods have no idea what it’s like to be without a library, and even though other

neighborhoods have had their libraries closed for renovations. Inwood cannot endure that because people only have three swipes on a Metrocard.

Catarina Rivera, City Harvest/Food Council: City Harvest had a successful supermarket event day at Super Foodtown (Broadway & W. 160th) on March 11th. 84 participants learned about nutrition and received \$10 to spend on fresh fruits and vegetables. Thank you for the support with promotion. Washington Heights/Inwood Food Council: next meeting will be on Thursday April 27th at 7pm at the HS of Media & Communications at GW Educational Campus. We are starting our garden plot soon and a policy work group focused on the Street Vending Modernization Act. RSVP to crivera@cityharvest.org or 646-412-0719. We also are seeking local graphic artists to help design our very first logo. We are looking for a logo that best represents our mission of providing access to healthy foods while also capturing the melting pot of cultures represented in the neighborhood. Work will be compensated. Please submit examples of your work to crivera@cityharvest.org; include your name, email, and website (if applicable).

Allegra LeGrand: Where will we integrate with our neighbors if not at our libraries? Our community will never recover from this disruption of public resources. If the land were sold for \$6 million and financed that would be \$11 million and then 45 units could be built for an average of \$365k/each, which is the going rate of sale. This is a corporate giveaway and must be stopped.

Phil Simpson: So glad to hear that CB12 will be taking up this important topic. Urged everyone who cares about the Inwood library to come out in support of this important topic.

Betty Lehmann, Isabella Geriatric Center: welcome to our newly renovated space. Thanks to Councilmember Ydanis Rodriguez and Assemblywoman Carmen De La Rosa for helping to fund. There also continues to be availability of independent and supportive senior housing at Isabella; contact us for details.

8:06pm **Report from Lesley Almanzar, Office of Manhattan Borough President Gale A. Brewer. See report.**

- Over 1000 applicants Borough-wide! Done with interviewing process; meeting with Councilmembers and anticipate making appointments by mid-April.
- Wrote to HPD regarding Inwood Library affordable housing project. Supports goals, but only if the property remains city-owned, and only if the developer is non-profit.
- Working with Fort Washington Presbyterian at 21 Wadsworth on their boiler issue.
- Women’s History Month event at which we renamed the art gallery in honor of Maggie Peyton, a friend and tireless community activist and advocate who recently died.
- Condolences to the community and to the family of Dr. Sander, who also recently died. Sent letter to Mayor requesting that the Armory be co-named in his honor.
- HollerBack: hosting workshops in your district. We have been doing events w/ Public Advocate. Contact us if you are interested in doing one at your organization.
- Community-friendly r/e development for faith-based orgs. 4/19 8a-12:30. RSVP on BP website or at EventBrite.
- Hosted hearing, cosponsoring bill w/ Rosie Mendez regarding reserved spaces in public parking garages for car-sharing (Intro 267-2014).

8:12pm **Representatives of Elected Officials**

- **Frank Hess for Assemblymember Herman D. “Denny” Farrell:** budget should be ready but may be moot depending on what Trump does. See report.
- **Laurie Tobias-Cohen for Congressman Adriano Espaillat:** referred to report. Spoke of some of the specific constituent issues faced, and the human side of what government is able to accomplish.
- **Manny Belliard for NYC Councilmember Mark Levine:** gave info about then-upcoming Participatory Budgeting projects as=nd venues/hours for voting through the weekend.
- **Kiana Diaz for NYC Councilmembers Ydanis Rodriguez:** Landmarked the United Palace. Joined Dominos fast food workers and 32BJ members to ensure fast-food franchise owners to give schedules two weeks in advance and ban “clopening” (the practice of scheduling the same person to close a late-night shift and then come back in early the next day to open. Announced PB projects and voting schedule through the weekend, including right here/right now. Announced Public safety Town Hall tomorrow, and tenant’s resource fair here at Isabella on April 4th 6:30pm.
- **Mariel de la Cruz, Comptroller Scott Stringer’s Office:** announced upcoming events and recent initiatives.

- **Jennifer Araujo for Manhattan DA's Cy Vance:** hate crime forum cosponsored w/ C/M Levine. Over 100 in 2016; on pace to be higher in 2017, alas. Call 212-335-3100 to report a hate crime. Yesterday James Jackson indicted on 1st & 2nd degree murder for fatally stabbing Timothy Kauffman.
- **Richard Allman for Assemblymember Carmen de la Rosa:** see report. Co-hosted Town Hall on GWBBS marketplace. Much community concern and discomfort with lack of progress. We'll continue to focus on small businesses and quality-of-life issues. On April 21st we are hosting a forum here at Isabella on single payer healthcare. Also called attention to civil rights legislation that passed the Assembly: GENDA, a bill on religious freedom that allows employees to wear whatever religious garb in the workplace, and a 3rd piece.

8:25pm **Business Section**

8:25pm **Traffic & Transportation (Debbie Nabavian, Committee Assistant Chair):** Refer to minutes. Many turned out regarding Jumel Terrace issue and ways to improve notification process. And traffic calming measures on Amsterdam Ave. from W. 155nd to W. 162nd Streets (and areas further south, not in CB12). Next meeting: co-naming on Broadway, Bx6 routing issue, and the Move NY Fare Plan. Reso: passed unanimously in December, but fell through cracks because of internet issues. Re Dyckman corridor from Broadway to Nagle, and then east of 10th. This reso relates to the portion from Nagle to 10th Ave., which we passed unanimously out of Committee. We need for the other portion to have additional vetting and community discussion, so we did only part of it, and will be analyzing the rest as a separate reso. Maria Luna: looking at this in pieces is like putting on your pantyhose in one leg, and then the other leg after you put on your shoes. A: we thought that the part east of Nagle was less complicated could proceed, and that the other piece can be scheduled as a workshop between now and June before the redesign of the most congested part can be dealt with in sections. Jim: this segment is pretty uncontroversial, and will increase safety. There are no businesses. Arlene: from public safety aspect: getting FDNY rigs around bike lanes can impact the reach of ladders from rigs, so make sure to include FDNY when you have a workshop.

8:35pm **Land Use (Wayne Benjamin, Committee Chair):** special permit for school to operate in C8-3. Seven years ago CB12 passed reso asking the Department of City Planning to take a look at all c8-3 areas in our District as they tend to emphasize automotive/industrial and prohibit residential, schools nursing homes, etc., all of which we want and need. To date, DCP hasn't acted on it, and this is the 2nd item of this type, which, had DCP acted on the prior reso we wouldn't be doing this one. The Inwood Academy currently goes through 11th grade and is planning to add 12th. Looked at other sites, and couldn't find anything affordable except something in a c8-3 district, for which they need a BSA waiver to go forward with a lease, and with filing plans with DoB. Renovation would acoustically isolate walls. Referred those with any questions to Andrea's excellent reso and minutes.

8:40pm **Parks & Cultural Affairs (Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Committee Chair):** Read minutes. Presented reso in support of the proposed \$10.1 million Phase I Project of the Highbridge Anchor Park Initiative. Next meeting will include a presentation by HPD and the NYPL regarding the proposed Inwood Library Affordable Housing Development, with a summary of the findings from the three community workshops held in January. Other items include an update on programming at the Morris-Jumel Mansion, discussion on how best to mark/commemorate several slave and Native American former cemetery sites in Inwood, and a report on environmental protection in the "Cabrini Woods" section of Ft. Washington Park.

8:44pm **Housing & Human Services (Ayisha Ogilvie, Committee Chair):** Reso opposing HPD's proposed new 40-year regulatory agreement for HDFCs (i.e., coöps created through the Housing Development Fund Corporation). There is a real problem with about 25-28% in varying measures of distress which must be addressed. More than 70% of HDFCs are solvent, and shouldn't be penalized by programs designed to help the coöps that need it. Should learn from best practices of others that are solvent. Changes to reflect these clarifications were accepted as friendly. Next meeting will be discussing RGB guidelines: rent freeze for 2nd year in a row? Or a possible rollback? Please attend. Also gave information regarding Stand for Tenant Safety, a citywide advocacy group.

8:54pm **Licensing (Isidro Medina, Committee Chair):** No item #14. Steve Simon: Re: #9, why are we not concerned about the hours for hookah? Re: #12 Why quote Moving Forward/Unidos – we should know our own records, and quote them. Also, why are we changing our position if we voted against it 4x? Why are we dropping that well-established opposition no clear reasoning. #15: did they meet with 33rd Pct? A: Yes. Barbara Frazier reiterated Steve's point. Arlene Schulman:

might be stronger if it had all of the specifics as to WHY it was opposed, and when. Liz Ritter: why are we even discussing this? The Board repeatedly votes against this place, so why are we even discussing a sidewalk café for a bar we keep opposing. Presumably we can just vote against this, and the failed positive reso becomes a negative reso (i.e., in opposition) that passes. Jim Berlin: clarified that this CB12 practice of automatically recording a positive reso that fails as a negative that passed applies **only** to Licensing Committee resos. There was some discussion about name changes for Heights Tavern/Crazy Annie's.

9:26pm **Roll Call on Land Use, Traffic & Traffic, Parks & Cultural Affairs, & 14 Licensing Committee resolutions.** (Note: there is no #14.)

Item #	Resolution	Yes-No-Abstain Not Voting	Passed or Failed
A.	Traffic & Transportation: Regarding Improvements to Dyckman Street from Nagle Avenue to Tenth Avenue	31-2-0-0	<i>passed</i>
B.	Land Use: Supporting a BSA Application Requesting a Special Permit to Allow Operation of a School in a C8-3 Zoning District	31-1-1-0	<i>passed</i>
C.	Parks & Cultural AffairsL Supporting the Phase I Project of the Highbridge Park Anchor Park Initiative	32-0-0-1	<i>passed</i>
D.	Housing: Opposing HPD's proposed new 40-year regulatory agreement for HDFCs	32-0-1-0	<i>passed</i>
1.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal On-Premise License to Element Restaurant Group d/b/a 181 Cabrini (854 W. 181 st St., corner of Cabrini Blvd.)	30-2-0-1	<i>passed</i>
2.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal On-Premise License to 839 W. 181 Food Corp d/b/a Le Cheile (corner of Cabrini Blvd.)	30-2-0-1	<i>passed</i>
3.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal On-Premise Food & Beverage License to the Metropolitan Museum's Trie Café (99 Margaret Corbin Dr., in the Cloisters)	32-0-0-1	<i>passed</i>
4.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Restaurant Wine License to the Jach Restaurant Corp. d/b/a Park View Café (219 Dyckman St., @ Broadway)	32-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
5.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Restaurant Wine License to AKV Restaurant Corp. d/b/a Inwood Local Wine & Beer Garden (4957 Broadway, btw. W. 207 th & Isham Streets)	33-0-0-0	<i>passed</i>
6.	Resolution to recommend the SLA not grant a renewal Restaurant Wine License to La Nueva JuquilaRestaurant (2106 Amsterdam Ave., btw. W. 164 th /165 th Streets)	32-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
7.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Restaurant Wine License to Yudyt Restaurant d/b/a Lulo Restaurant (1626 St. Nicholas Ave. btw. W. 191/192)	29-3-1-0	<i>passed</i>
8.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a renewal Tavern License to Kazza Corp., 708 W. 177 th St. btw. Broadway & Ft. Washington Ave.	32-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
9.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant an application by Novvo to change their Method of Operation to add live music.	23-9-1-0	<i>passed</i>
10.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant an application by Brown Sugar (5060 Broadway btw. W. 215 th /216 th Streets) to change their Method of Operation in increase the hours during which live music may be offered. (*NOTE: since this resolution failed, it automatically became a NEGATIVE resolution which passed, i.e., a resolution recommending that the SLA not grant the License, by a vote of 20-11 with 2 abstentions.)	11-20-2-0	<i>failed*</i>
11.	Resolution to recommend DCA grant a renewal Sidewalk Café License to Corcho Wine Room (227 Dyckman St., btw. Seaman Avenue & Broadway)	23-9-1-0	<i>passed</i>
12.	Resolution to recommend DCA grant a renewal Sidewalk Café License to Vida Enterprise d/b/a Pat'E-Palo, at 521 Dyckman St., btw. Seaman & Payson Avenues. (*NOTE: since this resolution failed, it automatically became a NEGATIVE resolution which passed, i.e., a resolution recommending that the SLA not grant the License by a vote of 26-4 with 3 abstentions.)	4-26-3-0	<i>failed*</i>

13.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a new Beer/Cider License to New San Francisco Restaurant Corp., at 59 Audubon Ave. (btw. W. 168 th /169 th Streets)	32-1-0-0	<i>passed</i>
15.	Resolution to recommend the SLA grant a new Beer/Cider License to Seaflower Fish Market at 4127 Broadway (btw. W. 174 th /175 th Streets)	31-2-0-0	<i>passed</i>

~~~~~

In consideration of time, refer to minutes.

9:12pm **Public Safety (Arlene Schulman, Committee Chair)**: Arlene read a letter enumerating her considerable accomplishments in her three years on the Board as Chair of Public Safety and as a member of the Licensing, Health & Environment, Land Use, and Aging Committees. In her tenure as Public Safety Chair, “the Committee has transformed from listening to complaints and a few cops attending to smart and informative conversations into important matters around us.” Her creative work has been taking up more time, and she can no longer serve on CB12, effective today. Thanked BP Gale Brewer and C/M Rodriguez for “this wonderful opportunity;” representatives of the FDNY, NYPD, and DANY for their participation; Committee members Javier Trejo and Natalie Espino for their service; and Chair Shah Ally, DM Ebenezer Smith, former Board members Aldemar Diaz and Edith Prentiss, and current members Wayne Benjamin, Steve Simon, Isidro Medina, and Liz Ritter for their guidance and support.

9:16pm **Health & Environment (Steve Simon, Committee Chair)**: March meeting including presentation by Solid Waste Advisory Board (SWAB); refer to minutes. Next meeting will include a discussion on suicide prevention, a presentation on NYPH’s mobile stroke unit, continued discussion of NY Universal Health (single-payer) plan, reports from CU/NYPH/Isabella, and updates on street cleanliness and DEP service requests.

9:19pm **Concerns of the Aging (Liliana Saneaux, Committee Chair)**: Thanks to Assemblymember Carmen De La Rosa Councilmember Ydanis Rodriguez, every senior center (of which there are ten) will be getting two new computers (for a total of 20). Thank you, thank you for your support!! Refer to minutes.

9:21pm **Youth & Education (Fe Florimón, Committee Chair)**: Referred the membership to the minutes. Thanks to Glennis Aquino for running and taking minutes at the last meeting. Echoed comments of public speaker Al Kurland regarding May 2<sup>nd</sup> youth/police event; please support this initiative and march with us.

9:24pm **Business Development (Jonathan Reyes, Committee Chair)**: No report – refer to minutes.

Maria Luna announced that the 33<sup>rd</sup> Precinct Community Council will meet on April 22<sup>nd</sup> at 6:30pm, at the Precinct.

There being no new business, a **motion to adjourn** was made by Jason Compton, seconded by Yahaira Alonzo, and approved by acclamation at 9:25pm.

Respectfully submitted: Elizabeth Lorris Ritter, Secretary