



CICELY HARRIS
Chairperson

SHATIC MITCHELL
District Manager

CITY OF NEW YORK
MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD 10
215 West 125th Street, 4th Floor
New York, NY 10027
T: 212-749-3105 F: 212-662-4215

RESOLUTION TO NOT DISADVANTAGE CENTRAL HARLEM RESIDENTS BY CONGESTION PRICING THROUGH THE CITY'S EFFORTS TO MITIGATE TRAFFIC CONGESTION, THROUGH THE PROPOSED CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT TOLLING PROGRAM.

WHEREAS Congestion pricing refers to the use of electronic tolling to charge vehicles for entering certain areas during peak commuting hours, ideally resulting in reduced traffic congestion and increased revenue for transit-oriented projects; and

WHEREAS Under the congestion pricing plan approved by the state legislature, vehicles entering the tolling zone would be charged once per day. Toll prices have not been set as yet. The tolls will be recommended later by a six-person board; and

WHEREAS rates were expected to range from \$9 to \$23 for passenger vehicles using the E-ZPass toll system, with possible discounts overnight or during off-peak hours. If there are more exemptions, officials said, the base rate would likely be higher; and

WHEREAS Congestion pricing in New York is proposed to redistribute wealth from people with higher means to the working poor. The charge will be paid by wealthier commuters and fund improvements in mass transit used by the working poor. The congestion fee will be a major source of funds to the MTA's capital plan; and

WHEREAS The 2019 congestion pricing law passed in Albany made tolling applicable to all cars, trucks and vehicles in the zone except three categories (1) Emergency vehicles (2) Vehicles transporting people with disabilities, and (3) Any vehicle belonging to families living inside the Manhattan congestion pricing zone in which the household earns \$60,000 or less per year. (The cost of the tolls would be returned as a tax credit); and

WHEREAS Currently, emergency vehicles and those transporting people with disabilities are exempt from fees, as are vehicles that travel on the F.D.R. Drive or West Side Highway but do not exit onto city streets; and

WHEREAS The goal of the policy is to price a free good that is being over-used: the street surfaces of lower Manhattan; and

WHEREAS The proposed benefits of the fee are that it will reduce traffic and generate needed resources for mass transit. Better mass transit will reduce the generation of greenhouse gases- even upon transition to personal electric vehicles; and

WHEREAS The amount of energy per person used to move a subway car is far lower than the power needed to move any car. Subway traffic and even bus traffic takes up less street space than motor vehicles leaving more street space for pedestrians and bicycles; and

WHEREAS The impact of congestion pricing on low-income New Yorkers was studied before the pandemic by the Community Service Society of New York (CSS). The study examined the potential impacts of congestion pricing on the working poor. The analysis found that just 4% of the city's outer borough working residents commute to jobs in Manhattan by vehicle and could be subject to a congestion fee. This compares with 56% of outer borough residents who use mass transit to commute to work in Manhattan, the other boroughs or outside the city. Another 29% drive to other destinations besides Manhattan for work, 11% use other modes of travel to work outside Manhattan, including biking, walking, taking the ferry or working from home. Just 1% walk, bike or take the ferry into Manhattan for work; and

WHEREAS According to CSS data of the 4% who drive to jobs in Manhattan, the overwhelming majority have moderate and higher incomes. CSS also found that only 2% of the city's outer borough working poor could potentially pay a congestion fee as part of their daily commute. This compares with 58% who rely on public mass transit and would theoretically benefit from a congestion pricing plan that raises money for both improved transit services and fare discounts; and

WHEREAS Congestion pricing in New York is proposed to redistribute wealth from people with higher means to the working poor. The charge will be paid by wealthier commuters and fund improvements in mass transit used by the working poor. The congestion fee will be a major source of funds to the MTA's capital plan; and

WHEREAS NYC Mayor Eric Adams declared his support for congestion pricing, while expressing a desire to protect low-income New Yorkers needing to drive into Manhattan from fees, he expressed strong support for both the fee and the use of fees to improve mass transit; and

WHEREAS Some transportation experts are advising the MTA to accelerate implementation of the congestion pricing plan, arguing that the number of people driving into New York City and their reasons for doing so has changed dramatically since the COVID-19 pandemic began; and

WHEREAS The MTA had hoped to begin charging the new tolls in early 2022, but the congestion pricing plan has been stalled for more than a year since the authority sent its proposal

to the U.S. Department of Transportation's Federal Highway Administration, as legally required, for guidance on how to move forward with an environmental study; and

WHEREAS MTA Chairman Patrick Foye said the federal government's inaction on the proposal over environmental concerns is especially confounding, because of its potential to reduce traffic congestion, encourage transit use, and improve air quality; and

WHEREAS The MTA continues to reel from the financial impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, which has cost the agency most of its riders and their fares. The MTA has said it is losing about \$200 million a week; and

WHEREAS Recommendation has been made to include a Manhattan resident, preferably someone who lives within the pricing zone, on the Traffic Mobility Review Board (TMRB) to represent New Yorkers most directly impacted by congestion pricing; and

WHEREAS Recommendation has been made that the MTA and the TMRB consult local Manhattan community boards for the citing of gantries and toll cameras necessary for the implementation of the program; and

WHEREAS Recommendation has been made to include a toll-free perimeter along the West Side Highway and FDR Drive, a tax credit for New Yorkers making below \$60,000 annually, and exemptions for emergency vehicles and vehicles transporting people with disabilities; and

WHEREAS Assembly Member Harvey Epstein's legislation (A. 6598) that would establish a toll exemption for residents within the congestion pricing zone whose household incomes are equal to or less than 120% of the Area Median Income (about \$100,000). Also, the TMRB is urged to pay special attention to ensure that disabled New Yorkers aren't disadvantaged by congestion pricing, including clarity on how the vehicle exemption for people with disabilities will work. It is recommended that TMRB consult with disability advocacy; and

WHEREAS The TMRB should consider additional, limited exemptions to improve the current framework. It is recommended that TMRB examine London's successful pricing scheme to help determine possible exemptions or fee reductions for residents within the pricing zone; mopeds, electric vehicles and patients and staff of hospitals and medical institutions; and

WHEREAS President Joe Biden signed the \$1.2 trillion infrastructure bill on November 15th, 2021. Formally known as the Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act, the law includes \$550 billion in new spending on the nation's physical infrastructure and represents the largest investment in roads, bridges, ports, water and rail in years. The measure provides \$110 billion for roads, bridges and major projects, \$39 billion for public transit and \$66 billion for railways. It also provides \$65 billion to expand broadband infrastructure and \$55 billion for clear water investments; and

WHEREAS The expected timeline for the environmental review process means that congestion pricing likely would not be implemented before 2023; and

WHEREAS The MTA, New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) and New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) hosted 13 public meetings to discuss the Central Business District Tolling Program (CBDTP), which would be the first-ever congestion pricing plan implemented in the United States; and

WHEREAS The first 10 meetings focused on how the program will impact various regions. A meeting was held on Oct. 6th, 2021 for the region of Manhattan Outside the Central Business District (61st Street and above); and

WHEREAS In addition to the 10 regional meetings, the agencies hosted three Environmental Justice Outreach meetings to discuss how the proposed program could impact minority and low-income areas. An Environmental Justice Outreach meeting was held on Thursday, Oct. 7th, 2021 for New York; and WHEREAS The feedback generated from these meetings will be included in the federal Environmental Assessment (EA) that is required for the project; and

WHEREAS As part of the \$175 billion state budget approved on April 1st, 2019, the MTA's Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority (TBTA) will establish the CBDTP which will charge travelers a variable fee for driving into Manhattan's Central Business District, defined as any area south of 60th Street; and

WHEREAS A six-member Traffic Mobility Review Board will recommend toll pricing to the TBTA, which will ultimately determine the toll prices, which may vary based on a combination of factors and may potentially offer exemptions and credits to certain travelers; and

WHEREAS The program is expected to generate \$1 billion annually, which can be bonded against for \$15 billion, which will be placed in a designated MTA "lockbox" to fund capital improvements to the ailing mass transit system; and

WHEREAS The toll could potentially vary based on the time of day, the amount of traffic, the total distance traveled within the zone and the time spent driving within the zone; and

WHEREAS Under the congestion pricing plan approved by the state legislature, vehicles entering the tolling zone would be charged once per day. Rates are expected to range from \$9 to \$23 for passenger vehicles using the E-ZPass toll system, with possible discounts overnight or during off-peak hours. If there are more exemptions, officials said, the base rate would likely be higher. Currently, emergency vehicles and those transporting people with disabilities are exempt from fees, as are vehicles that travel on the F.D.R. Drive or West Side Highway but do not exit onto city streets. Residents who live in the tolling zone and earn less than \$60,000 would also qualify for a tax credit; and

WHEREAS NYC Mayor-Elect Eric Adams declared his support for congestion pricing, while he expressed a desire to protect low-income New Yorkers needing to drive into Manhattan from fees, he expressed strong support for both the fee and the use of fees to improve mass transit; and

WHEREAS Of the 4% who drive to jobs in Manhattan, the overwhelming majority have moderate and higher incomes. CSS also found that only two percent of the city’s outer-borough working poor could potentially pay a congestion fee as part of their daily commute. This compares with 58% who rely on public transit and would theoretically benefit from a congestion pricing plan that raises money for both improved transit services and fare discounts”; and

WHEREAS The \$1.2 Trillion Bipartisan Infrastructure Law signed by President Biden on November 19th, 2021 is expected to clear the way for several high-profile projects in the City and the State, including the extension of the Second Avenue subway in Manhattan and a long-needed solution to the crumbling Brooklyn-Queens Expressway. Its effects will also be felt in numerous other ways to rebuild a region with outdated infrastructure whose vulnerability has been especially tested by climate change. \$9.8 billion is expected to be slated for transit; and

WHEREAS It’s critical that the congestion pricing system be evaluated on an ongoing basis for the benefit of the public and decision makers. Key to this evaluation will be defining metrics for tracking the equity goals of the program, specifically with regard to low-income residents and people with disabilities. The TMRB has been encouraged to consider a tracking dashboard so that the program can be transparent and held accountable.

WHEREAS It is recommended that the impact of the Central Business District Tolling Program and its effect on the surrounding neighborhoods be studied. Community Board 10 therefore affirmatively supports the consideration and implementation of a neighborhood parking and or pricing model that gives preferential parking to local community residents.

WHEREAS 29% of residents of Central Harlem live below the Federal Poverty Level; it is the second poorest neighborhood in Manhattan; and

THEREFORE NOW BE IT RESOLVED that Manhattan Community Board 10 recommends that Central Harlem residents not be disadvantaged by congestion pricing through the City’s efforts to mitigate traffic congestion, through the proposed Central Business District Tolling Program.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Manhattan Community Board 10 also recommends that the impact of the Central Business District Tolling Program and its effect on the surrounding neighborhoods be studied. Community Board 10 therefore affirmatively supports the consideration and implementation of a neighborhood parking and or pricing model that gives preferential parking to local community residents.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED Manhattan Community Board 10 APPROVED the RESOLUTION TO NOT DISADVANTAGE CENTRAL HARLEM RESIDENTS BY CONGESTION PRICING THROUGH THE CITY’S EFFORTS TO MITIGATE TRAFFIC CONGESTION, THROUGH THE PROPOSED CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT TOLLING PROGRAM during the February 2, 2022 General Board Meeting, the board voted 40 YES, 0 NO, 0 ABSTENTION, and 0 RECUSAL.